

TOWARD A HOLY SPIRIT MOVEMENT IN
A SUB-GROUP OF CESSATIONISTS IN
A KOREAN IMMIGRANT CHURCH

Seung Mok Choi

MDiv, Methodist Theological University, 2004
DMin, Claremont School of Theology, 2015
ThM, International Theological Seminary, 2020

Mentor

Ian Dunn, DMin

A FINAL PROJECT SUBMITTED TO
THE DOCTORAL STUDIES COMMITTEE
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

UNITED THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
Dayton, Ohio
May 2023

Copyright © 2022 Seung Mok Choi
All rights reserved

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	vii
DEDICATION.....	viii
ILLUSTRATIONS.....	ix
ABBREVIATIONS.....	x
INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER	
1. MINISTRY FOCUS.....	7
Ministry in America.....	14
Ministry in Palm Springs, CA.....	26
New Ministry in Albany, NY.....	32
Immigrant Church Context.....	33
The Present Ministry.....	35
Conclusion.....	36
2. BIBLICAL FOUNDATIONS.....	38
The Holy Spirit in the New Testament.....	39
The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament.....	42
The Holy Spirit in Mark 1:8.....	52
Other Similes for the Holy Spirit.....	57
Conclusion.....	61

3.	HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS.....	63
	Activity of the Holy Spirit in Early Church History.	65
	Is the Holy Spirit Still Active?.....	70
	The Activity of the Holy Spirit in Korean Church History.....	74
	Conclusion.....	77
4.	THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS.....	80
	Theology of the Holy Spirit in the Experience of John Wesley.....	82
	The First Great Awakening.....	86
	Wesley's Experience of the Holy Spirit and the Correlation with Holiness.....	87
	The Theology of the Holy Spirit in the Wesleyan Quadrilateral.....	89
	The Understanding of Holy Spirit in C. Peter Wagner's Theology.....	91
	The Healing Theology of John Wimber.....	94
	Conclusion.....	97
5.	INTERDISCIPLINARY FOUNDATIONS.....	100
	Correlation between Ch'i and the Holy Spirit in the Orient.....	102
	The Concept of Logos in the Chinese Bible; Tao...	103

	Worship in Spirit (Ch'i).....	108
	Creation and Sprit in Zhuang Zhou.....	113
	Conclusion.....	115
6.	PROJECT ANALYSIS.....	119
	Description of the Project.....	120
	Data from Project.....	126
	Summary of Learning.....	139
	Conclusion.....	143
APPENDIX		
A.	Personal Testimony.....	147
B.	Pre-questionnaire, Interview Questions, and Journal Questions.....	149
C.	To study about the spirit in the understanding of the World.....	152
D.	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament.....	154
E.	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the New Testament.....	156
F.	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the church history.....	158
G.	Lesson on the Holy spirit in the history of Korean church	163
H.	Lesson how cessationists transformed to continuationism	165
I.	Lesson on How the Holy Spirit works in my ministry....	167
J.	Post-questionnaire.....	169
	BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	171

ABSTRACT

TOWARD A HOLY SPIRIT MOVEMENT IN A SUB-GROUP OF CESSATIONISTS IN A KOREAN IMMIGRANT CHURCH

by
Seung Mok Choi
United Theological Seminary, 2022

Mentor

Ian Dunn, DMin

The context for this qualitative study was an immigrant Korean church in the United States. The problem addressed was that immigrant Koreans from different denominational backgrounds gathered in one church, adhering to the beliefs of their tradition, including cessationism. My hypothesis was that if project participants took part in an eight-week training process, they would report increased functioning in the gifts of the Holy Spirit. The eight-week process included intensive Bible study, singing worship songs, praying sessions with impartation, and testimony. Data for this qualitative

phenomenological study was gathered using pre- and post-questionnaires, interviews, and journal entries.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I would like to thank God for guiding me to write this thesis. I couldn't do anything without God's help, and it was a miracle that I was led to this point. I can only confess that this is the work of the Holy Spirit. Special thanks to Ian, my mentor. He worked tirelessly to understand me despite the communication problems with me, and I am grateful that he encouraged me to finish my studies to the end and never gave up. Next, I would like to thank Professor Andrew Park for introducing me to United Theological Seminary. Andrew Park taught me systematic theology at Claremont School of Theology. It was there that he introduced UTS and made me re-challenge for the second Doctor of Ministry I am always amazed by his enthusiasm and academic depth. Personally, I am very grateful to my beloved father and mother. I would like to express my gratitude to my father, Lee Sun Choi, who passed away to heaven in 2009, and to my loving mother, Hye-ja Kim, who is alone and prays for me every day. I would like to thank my beloved wife Soo Jeong Cho, eldest son David, second daughter Jane, and youngest daughter Anna. Lastly, I would like to thank my church members and everyone who prays for me.

DEDICATION

This project is dedicated all the pastors and members of the Korean immigrant church. In addition, through this thesis, I hope that all immigrant churches across the nation will be restored to the work of the Holy Spirit and their pain will be restored. Ultimately, it is hoped that through this thesis, all churches that restrict the movement of the Holy Spirit will see the movement of the Holy Spirit again and that this thesis will be used more systematically and concretely in the places where the movement of the Holy Spirit occurs. The project is also dedicated to my God, my Lord Jesus Christ, the Holy Spirit, and all saints of the church.

ILLUSTRATIONS

Tables

1	Outline of Project Weeks and Sessions.....	
	120
2	Second Session of Curriculum.....	
	122
3	Third Session of Curriculum.....	
	122
4	Fourth Session of Curriculum.....	
	123
5	Fifth Session of Curriculum.....	
	124
6	Sixth Session of Curriculum.....	
	124
7	Seventh Session of Curriculum.....	
	125
8	Participant Understanding of the Holy Spirit in Pre- and Post-questionnaires...	131
9	Participant Experience of the Holy Spirit in Pre- and Post-questionnaires.....	131

10	Revealed Phenomena after Eight-week Study about the Holy	
	Spirit.....	142

ABBREVIATIONS

NIV	New International Version
KJV	King James Version

INTRODUCTION

While serving as a Korean pastor in Korean American churches in North America, I have noticed that a Korean American church will draw people from many different Christian and non-Christian backgrounds. Immigrants from Korea often seek out a local Korean church to be with others from their same culture. Such immigration churches can function as a support system, to helping the co-ethnic members to adapt to living in the United States. However, the problem that arises from this is that there are competing theological directions within the church. The goal of this DMin hypothesis, which addresses this problem, is that if project participants take part in an eight-week training process, then they will report an increase in the gifts of the Holy Spirit functioning in their lives, bringing greater experiential and theological unity.

The specific problem that was addressed herein exists when conservative cessationist Presbyterians attend more charismatic congregations who are interested in the active gifts of the Holy Spirit. The cessationist leaning Christians attend the church more for the common Korean culture than for the common theology. The

cessationist members are more guarded in their faith expression while the charismatic members are more expressive in their faith. Because of my theological beliefs that the gifts of the Holy Spirit are active, this hypothesis was meant to explore the potential of moving the cessationist-leaning members toward believing and acting in the movement of the Holy Spirit. My hypothesis contained the idea that if cessationists would study about the gifts of the Holy spirit and pray to receive them (part of the process), they would begin to believe in the availability of these gifts for today and practice spiritual gifts (increased functioning). The so-called fundamentalist conservative Presbyterians could be baptized in the Holy Spirit and experience the continuation of the gifts of the Holy Spirit if they participated in an eight-week course of robust Bible training, with prayer for impartation, despite their long-established belief that the gifts of the Holy Spirit have ceased. This Bible training course was focused on re-education of the conservative Presbyterians regarding the origin and history of the work of the Holy Spirit. The beliefs and aspects of the life of faith of the participants within the context of immigrant church was evaluated before, during, and after the study.

Those who believe in the theory of the cessation of the gifts in Korea are mainly adherents to Presbyterian Reformed theology. Because of this, the cessationist roots of Reformed theology, especially as based in the theology of John Calvin, was examined in

detail. A biblical, historical, theological approach was utilized to analyze how the power of the Holy Spirit continues to make changes in our lives as a counterpoint to cessationism.

This study sought to find the basis of the biblical roots and the work of the Holy Spirit in the early church and how the work of the Holy Spirit continued through to modern times. The background for this project lays in my own experience of coming to faith and how the Holy Spirit directly impacted my understanding of the biblical concepts of supernaturalism and the continuation of the Spirit's work. This personal experience was foundational to the project's emphasis. God has taken me through some unique and informative circumstances in this regard. This is the focus of the first chapter.

In chapter two, the research begins in earnest, as biblical foundations found in the Mark 1:8 are explored. While correlating passages will be examined to show the continuity of the Holy Spirit's work through the Old and New Testaments, Mark 1:8 provides the key foundation text to examine what it means to be baptized in the Holy Spirit as an experience distinct from conversion. Jesus' life is examined in the context of crucifixion, resurrection, and ascension, looking at the dynamics of the Holy Spirit in His own life. This will be critical in helping cessationists come to a fresh understanding of the present work of the Holy Spirit in their lives.

Next the research examines a key historical reference for the

project subject matter in chapter three. Beginning with a more general survey of the ongoing work of the Holy Spirit throughout the early centuries of church history, the research zeros in on the movement of the Holy Spirit in John Wesley and Methodism. This movement will be considered as an important transitional point of the movement of the Holy Spirit leading to our contemporary expressions. This movement will be shown to have direct links to the movement of the Holy Spirit in the Korean church and will provide a critical historical link showing how God's activity has been continuous from the early church through to today.

Chapter four then examines some of the theology that underpins the project focus. Using Wesley as a pivotal theologian, the research will examine how Wesley's theology, along with the expressions of the Great Awakening in America, influenced the theology of the Spirit in America. Two influential contemporary theologians, C. Peter Wager and John Wimber will be examined in this context as their theologies have been pivotal in responding to issues of cessationism in contemporary America.

Chapter five examines some of the oriental concepts of spirituality as a connection point to the work of the Holy Spirit among the context demographic for the project. Koreans will be well acquainted with the spirituality mentioned, and the research will examine key links to how the Holy Spirit works in general revelation

to reveal Himself. Specific connections, for example, will be made between the concept of ch'i and the Holy Spirit's work, Tao and the Bible revelation of the Spirit. Again, this will serve to give expression to the foundational idea that the Holy Spirit's work has never ceased and that he is quite active in every culture in supernatural ways.

Finally, chapter six will examine what how the project was implemented and what the results were from the triangulation of the data. The teaching and prayer processes will be discussed. Key experiences that people had will be examined in detail. In the end, it will be shown that the hypothesis was valid and that the project did, in fact, lead to a change in cessationist positions among many of the participants as a result of their experiences during the time together. However, some of the results, including some of the ways the cessationist theology was broken down, were not anticipated by the teaching focus. God seems to have moved according to his own plan to help the participants come to a new understanding of the present work of the Holy Spirit in their own personal experience.

Education is critical to help cessationists learn that the work of the Holy Spirit has not ceased. To this end, the search for the biblical origin, historical basis, and theological justification for the continued work of the Holy Spirit was used to help lead people to invite the Holy Spirit into their lives and to experience the work of the Holy Spirit that appears to them. The outcome of this study was measured with

the questionnaire before and after the Bible training course. Weekly journals of the participants were also reviewed. Over a twenty-year period, I designed an eight-week Bible study for seminary students in China and Cambodia. This DMin project led participants from a Korean immigrant church in the United States through this study. In particular, the participants included members of the church from Presbyterian backgrounds that are cessationist. These participants were examined before and after to the Bible study to see how they had changed in their view and experience of the Holy Spirit. The ultimate purpose of my research was to lead participants in the Bible study to understand, believe in, and experience the Holy Spirit, and then to share their experience with others.

As an example of the impact of this Bible study, we had a time of praying to receive the gift of healing. Then had people who prayed to receive the gift of healing pray for others who needed healing. Then we tested to see if their mindset about the gift of healing had changed after praying for the sick and noting any healings that took place. I always pray for healing during the benediction of our church worship. As a result of the study, small groups prayed for healing over individuals and the healing change in the individual's lives were be observed. Through the project we collected data on whether these individuals experienced any healing, either physical, psychological, or emotional, in their lives.

The Bible study for this project is based on a book that I have already published in Korea that was designed for seminary students in China and Cambodia. This Korean version, translated as Holy Spirit with Brunch, is written as twenty-one sessions. For this project, the study was shortened to eight weeks while also redesigned and strengthened for general members of a congregation. My expectations and purpose through this study were to prove that the work of the Holy Spirit is timeless and can continue in the lives of Christian believers. Through this study, people sought and experienced the power of the Holy Spirit. It is hoped that their church can become a more vibrant community as a result. Specifically, the ultimate purpose was to lead congregations to live a life where they pray for the sick, see the power of prayer through the gift of the Holy Spirit, and to share their testimonies with others they encounter in their daily lives.

CHAPTER ONE

MINISTRY FOCUS

I was born on November 7, 1975, in a small city near Seoul, South Korea. Thankfully, as soon as I was born, I received a blessing prayer from a local Methodist pastor. My birth was not reported to the federal government because I was so weak that I was not expected to live. Thankfully, I survived and after about two months, on December 30, 1975, the birth notification was legalized. As I grew up, I was very weak. I would read books and stay home rather than exercise or engage in outdoor activities. When I was a first-grade student in elementary school, my father's business failed, and my mother went to work. I had to take care of my four-year-old brother when I came home from school each day. This background seems to have made me an introvert. After school, I usually stayed inside my house and I thought a lot of the afterlife, dreams, and the spiritual world.

In kindergarten, I read the Bible verses that tell the story of how the wise men followed the stars and met Jesus, and I hoped to become an astronomer to study the stars. I had a dream where I had a seat on

the space shuttle Columbia, which was launched April 12, 1981. On Christmas eve that year, I received a gift from Santa Claus—a small model of the space shuttle. I was so disappointed because the gift was just a toy space shuttle Columbia. I wanted the real one. Later, I had a dream where I found a new star, which could lead us to a new savior for all of the world. Later, I used the story in my preaching. If I had received the gift exactly how I had wanted it, I could not have handled it. I was interested in the world of space and the spiritual world also. As I grew up, of course, I learned that it was impossible to find a new Messiah through astronomy.

As a child, I dreamed a lot and saw the phenomena that would occur in my real life. Because of this, I liked the Joseph story in the Bible and also had a lot of interest in Samuel, who grew up in the temple from a young age. I wanted to understand more about dreams, especially those that work in the real world. I wanted to understand these phenomena, not only biblically but also scientifically. I also wanted to read many psychological and biblical books.

One of my most memorable stories from elementary school was the day when I visited the local market and bought Sigmund Freud's *A General Introduction to Psychoanalysis*. I read it again and again, even at that early age. Through the book I discovered Freud's three elements of human beings: ego (reality), super ego (morality), and id

(instincts). In my case I realized I had been standing on the super ego more than the other elements.

My most memorable spiritual experience of my childhood was when my mother's friend visited our house when my mother was not home. I told the friend that I was going to go to church to find my mother, and I went straight to the church. However, I did not see anyone there and the church door was locked. I did not understand why the house of God was locked at that time. I knelt down before the locked door and prayed to God. I said, "Almighty God, I want my mother to be home before I get back there." When I prayed and went back home, my mother was already there. I asked my mom, "How were you home first?" She said that she had suddenly felt uncomfortable and felt led to come back home quickly, which happened while I was praying to God. This event led me to meditate on the power of prayer, which I have continued throughout my life.

Another memory from my life during elementary school was when I once had a big tumor under my tongue and went to the hospital. The medical doctor told me that he would have to cut it out with a knife. I prayed to God. I believed the doctor also could heal my tongue, but at that time I prayed for the healing of God's grace without any surgery. One day, I went to a party for my father's company where I drank numerous Sprites (a Coca-Cola product); I felt refreshed in my mouth. When I returned home, I checked the

underside of my tongue in a mirror. The tumor had disappeared and there was a hole in its place. When I went back to the medical doctor, he told me that because God had healed me there was no need for surgery. Even now I still have a hole under my tongue. This is how I have evidence for his miracle in my body.

When I was an elementary student, there were many stores selling chicks after school. It was only five cents for a chick. I bought a chick and studied how to care for chicks and raise them to be chickens by reading children's magazines of the Korean Daily Newspaper. First, I learned how to have chick kiss me by reading a book. Whenever I came back home from the school, I called loudly towards the chick and the chick kissed me. I wanted eagerly to have the chick with me for all my life. Eventually, my chick became a grown chicken. One day my mother told me about the senior pastor of my church. The senior pastor had come from North Korea to South Korea during the Korean War. He later believed in God, studied theology, became a pastor, and planted a church near my village. There were very few people in the new church, and he had a very difficult time financially. He was starving and his face had turned yellow. His symptoms were probably from jaundice. My mother said she was sorry for the starving pastor, and she looked at my chicken. I was quite uncomfortable with how my mother was looking at my adorable chicken. After agonizing all night, I was suddenly reminded of the

Bible verse, “And if anyone gives even a cup of cold water to one of these little ones because he is my disciple, I tell you the truth, he will certainly not lose his reward”.¹ I was also reminded of the miracle of feeding five thousand with two fish and five loaves where Jesus said, “You give them something to eat” (see Matt. 14:16, Mark 6:37, and Luke 9:13). One little boy responded to Jesus’ command and then the miracle happened through his commitment. I decided to dedicate my chicken, all I had, to the Lord, and I gave it to the pastor. This event made my history blessed more abundantly.

Another spiritual turning point in my life happened when I was in fifth grade and my father's business failed. I moved into a relative's house where I attended a church. We had a Bible study at 10:00 p.m. I memorized many scriptures and through these studies longed for a life like Samuel, who grew up in the temple. I still remember the Bible verses I memorized in my childhood, and I still use them in my life and preaching today.

Teenage Years

After I moved to Ui-jeong-bu, I joined a small church that became my mother church. I grew up under a youth pastor who taught me the Bible in the new church of Ui-jeong-bu. At that time,

¹

Matthew 10:42, New International Version (NIV). Unless otherwise noted, all scripture references in this document are from the NIV.

the pastor's mother was a shaman. A demon would come upon her, her voice changed, and she spoke and prophesied. She was displeased with her son for studying theology and becoming a pastor, and eventually she cast her son out of her house. The pastor left the house and began to eat, sleep, and live in the church. I received permission from my parents to go and live with the pastor at the church. This pastor had the greatest influence on me during my middle and high school years. After graduating from high school, I went to the prayer mountain to pray and receive the Holy Spirit with my pastor. I fasted for ten days. After that I prayed for ten more days, eating only soups. I stayed for twenty days and experienced a lot of charismatic gifts of the Holy Spirit at the prayer house. Eventually the pastor went to China. Before he left, he challenged me to be a pastor who received the Holy Spirit and not just to be a pastor only through studying.

The fasting prayer on the prayer mountain gave me a great spiritual experience. At that time, I started praying in tongues on the seventh day, and the gift of interpretation of tongues began to deepen. I never understood what happened to me during that time until later. I studied the spiritual gifts one by one and searched for the corresponding experiences of the Holy Spirit. As I had experiences, they made me more interested in the working of the Holy Spirit. Twenty days later, I returned home from the prayer house.

At the church I had been teaching a class of fifth-grade students that started with only two children. After my prayer mountain experience, class attendance grew rapidly. At the time, my grandfather, who was in the last stage of gastric cancer, came to my house. My grandfather had lost weight, and his legs were bent and hardened. After fasting and prayer, I felt quite full of the Holy Spirit and thought that I should pray for my grandfather to be healed. I put my hand on my grandfather's stiff leg and claimed, "In the name of Jesus, let these hardened legs be stretched out." And then I put my hand on my grandfather's hardened knees again and prayed loudly. "In the name of Jesus, let these hardened legs be stretched out." I had no doubt that the legs would heal right away. Unfortunately, nothing happened to grandfather. Thankfully no one saw that event.

I was very discouraged, but I continued having worship with my grandfather each day at home. About two months later, my grandfather's hardened legs stretched out and he arose and asked God to give him the faith of Abraham. He suddenly shouted, "God of Abraham, give me great faith." After that he stood up. I deeply realized that I wanted only his legs to be healed so he could walk again. However, God wanted him to have faith first. From this experience, two scriptures awakened to me. The first was, "Seek first his kingdom and his righteousness, and all these things will be given to you as well" (Matt. 6:33). The second was, "I pray that you may

enjoy good health and that all may go well with you, even as your soul is getting along well” (3 John 1:2).

When my grandfather was young, he built a church that is in my hometown now. The young pastor, who was charged to that church and built the building with my grandfather, left the church after being ordained (while pastoring in the countryside for three years, a pastor can be ordained). My grandfather was wounded in his heart by the disloyal young pastor, who by all appearances only stayed in the pastorate in our town to get ordained rather than for the love of the people who lived in the village. Because of this my grandfather left the church entirely. However, my grandfather’s wounds were gradually healed through my prayer. I had persistent worship with him over two months. I wanted my grandfather’s physical illness to be cured, but my grandfather had spiritual healing and reconciliation of the heart first. Then finally, his body was also restored. He had an illness of three elements. His soul, heart, and body were sick. He felt betrayed in his heart from the pastor and had lost his faith. He got bad feelings from the church and was not comfortable in his mind. He could not get peace at all. Through the recovery of faith that his heart had received, peace was restored to his life and his body also was restored.

Young Adult Years

Before I went to college, during my last winter vacation of the twelfth grade, I had two miracles that I will not forget. One of them occurred when I was fasting all day without drinking water and praying hard for my career and future. When the prayer session began, I began to pray in front of the pulpit. After praying I opened my eyes and found myself standing at the back of the church. I do not remember moving at all during the prayer time, but my body gradually moved from the pulpit. Maybe I was moved to the back of the chapel by the Holy Spirit, but I do not know how this happened. The second happened when the revival pastor Soon-hyoung Hong came and prophesied that I would be admitted to the Methodist Theological Seminary. I ended up not attending the Methodist Theological Seminary and instead entered another university. This discouraged me for my lack of faith and distrust for prophecy. However, the pastor's prophetic prayers were fulfilled exactly seven years later.

Every man in South Korea in his early twenties is required to have military service. Before I entered the military, I often thought of pastoring in a chapel in the military. I had a mentor who had led me since I was a teenager, and I had a dream to fight in a war with that mentor's gun. When I woke up from my dream, I was convinced that I should be a senior pastor in the army.

In the military, senior soldiers often beat junior soldiers who attended church. There were soldiers attending the seminary at the time, but they did not go to church because of beatings. Then a miracle happened. Before I joined the army, I was in charge of the church as I had desired. Since I was the only one who attended church services, I became a senior pastor of the Military Church. Many things happened while I was serving as a senior pastor of the Military Church. The army often sent me to the garbage incinerator. One day I was told to clean the garbage from the cement incinerator. I went to church to pray to God before clearing the garbage. As I was praying, I suddenly heard a loud explosion. I thought it was the voice of God. In actuality, the dump had exploded. If I had been there, I would have been killed or seriously injured. Some who had tried to prevent me from going to church saw what happened and confessed, "Your God is alive." After the accident, while serving in the military, I was free to go to church.

During that time in the military, I had begun my first ministry without any study in theology. I had just learned from listening to many sermons from famous Korean pastors. Despite this, I still organized and led the daily dawn services and Sunday evening services. When I left the military, I was able to attend the Methodist Theological Seminary in Korea to study theology.

Ministry in America

After my first year of studying in the Methodist Theological Seminary, I took a break from school for a while and went to Toronto, Canada with a friend who graduated from Yonsei University, one of the best schools in Korea. He was an atheist and skeptic. I was challenged every time he asked a religious question. When I went to Canada, I did not have enough money or knowledge of English. I had to get a job shortly after I arrived in Toronto. The day after I arrived, I went to York Station on the subway and asked an Asian man to give me a job at Teriyaki Bar. He was Korean and gave me the opportunity to work there. I cooked teriyaki meat for eight hours each day. After work, I went to Emmanuel College of Toronto University to study theology. When I visited the Toronto Torch Korean Methodist Church, a senior pastor asked me to be a youth pastor. When I started, I worshipped with only one child in attendance. As time passed, more and more youth began to attend. While there, I learned about immigrant churches and how to start them and register them as a nonprofit organization. This was a great experience that helped me build a Korean church in the United States later.

One Sunday, the pastor from South Korea suddenly proclaimed, "Next Sunday, I will go to the park and worship there." The weather forecast said it would rain the next Sunday. But he said, "I believe God will stop the rain for us." My skeptical friend was very upset as he

returned home. He accused the pastor of conveying his faith unscientifically. But just as the pastor had claimed, it did not rain the next week.

My friend had no faith at all. But there was a meaningful miracle that led him to have faith. Before I went to Toronto, I never worked outside. I preferred reading inside and never playing outside. But after moving to Toronto, I had to work for a living. While I was physically working as a foreigner, I had pain in my neck. One day I could not move hardly at all. My friend was really worried about my health. I sang “Live for Jesus” for a few hours, and suddenly I was able to move and walk slowly again. While I was praising the Lord, my friend was amazed at the miraculous healing through the power of God.

In Toronto, I was also exposed to conflict, division, and struggle in the church. The pastor and the elders fought each other, and as a result, the church was divided into two. I later realized that this was a common phenomenon in immigrant churches. It was not difficult for immigrants to leave a church as they had once left their country and their families. In immigrant churches, it was common for wounded people to leave and build new churches or to scatter. I look back at this time as almost equivalent to a second master’s degree in church conflict and division.

After a year in Toronto, I returned to Korea to finish my studies. I had to study for two more years to get a master's degree and a pastoral ordination. It is required to be ordained as a pastor to preside over baptisms and the sacraments. Afterwards, I submitted a resume to The Kwang-lim Methodist Church, the largest Korean Methodist Church in the world, with over 85,000 church members. I became a youth pastor in that church and learned about administration. I met my wife when she was a student in an English class I taught. We married at Kwang-Lim Methodist Church.

We wanted to go to the United States, but the church refused my resignation and I had to work ten more months after our marriage. My wife went ahead to the United States. I entered the United States on October 30, 2004. My son was born on January 4, 2005. We moved to Salisbury, Maryland where I had worship with one family who lived across from the house.

While in Maryland I lived with my in-laws and had a worship time every night with my father-in-law, mother-in-law, and my wife. The first day of worship I asked all the family what prayer requests they had. My father-in-law began to tell how he came to the USA. He had owned a gas station in Korea, but he fell victim to a surge of fake oil that occurred in Korea. He had no ability to recover economically and went bankrupt. He decided to immigrate to the USA to begin again as he believed he would recover in America. He applied for

unskilled employment immigration and moved to the small city of Salisbury, Maryland, where there were chicken farms. Many Korean and other immigrants lived in Salisbury to get green cards. My mother-in-law worked identifying male and female chicks. After my father-in-law got a green card, he began a new business by farming rented land. His request was to farm his own land.

After listening to him, I encouraged him to have hope and told him that God is almighty and is still living with us. I told him some Bible verses. “My ears had heard of you but now my eyes have seen you” (Job 4:5). “That which was from the beginning, which we have heard, which we have seen with our eyes, which we have looked at and our hands touched—this we proclaim concerning the word of life” (1 John 1:1). “The Word became flesh and made his dwelling among us” (John 1:14). “For the word of God is living and active. Sharper than any double-edged sword, it penetrates even to dividing soul and spirit, joints and marrow, it judges the thoughts and attitudes of the heart” (Heb. 4:12). I told him that faith is an experience as the Wesley quadrilateral includes (1) Scripture, (2) tradition, (3) reason, and (4) experience. Through using these Bible verses, I encouraged my father-in-law and asked to pray together.

Every morning I had worship with him and then drove to a circle of land which we pointed at when we prayed. Around two months later, my father-in-law suddenly got angry and said, “I don’t know

what we are doing. I don't want to keep doing this." I eagerly prayed to God more. "Almighty God, I need your mercy and miracle. Please give us the clue you are living God. And show us that you respond to our prayer." That night, the owner of the land visited our house and asked us to buy his land. I was happy when he asked and thought it was the answer to our prayer from God. But the price offered by the landowner was considerably higher than expected. My father-in-law seemed to be more desperate, but I suggested I go with him to the land. The land looked beautiful with a forty-five-acre square. We walked together, and I saw four warehouses and opened them to find grain stored. Then we saw there were chickens, 85,000 of them. I suddenly remembered offering a chick to the pastor when I was young. I was convinced that the providence of God was here. I told my father-in-law that God would be with him.

Something unexpected happened that night. Although it had been seventeen years since my father-in-law had immigrated to America, a call came from a friend in Ilsan, Korea. The friend told my father-in-law that the area where he lived was being developed and he had sold his land to the developer. While praying, the friend felt led to help my father-in-law and had decided to send him 100 million won (around \$100,000). My father-in-law had miraculously received the money to buy the farm. I was reminded of the verse, "No eye has seen, no ear has heard, no mind has conceived what God has prepared

for those who love him” (1 Cor. 2:9). God reminded me that he never forgot the little chick I gave to the pastor when I was a little child. Jesus said, “I tell you the truth, anyone who gives you a cup of water in my name because you belong to Christ will certainly not lose his reward” (Mark 9:41).

Being an immigrant, my early days in America were hard for me. I felt like a sinner because I left my parents in Korea and came to the United States. My heart hurt every day.

Nevertheless, I tried to overcome my unstable situation by establishing a Korean church and worshiping weekly in the house of my father-in-law with one family that had left the church a long time ago. I wanted to quit living in my father-in-law’s home and re-establish the church in the city. Therefore, I prayed to God for my future ministry, and I asked the Lord where I had to start a new church. I really wanted to open a new church in the big city, not in the countryside. My father-in-law strongly opposed my opinion for two reasons. First, I had to have enough money to live alone. Second, my wife needed postpartum care.

I wanted to get an answer from God directly and wanted to follow his direction. I kept praying and one day I had a dream. In the dream there were two choices for a church. The first choice was a church in the city. I was approved to start a new church from Rev. John Kim, who was superintendent of my denomination. But he

suddenly forced me to hurry and got angry when I hesitated with my decision. The second choice was a church in the countryside. I also got approval from Rev. Kim. In this case he showed me mercy, encouraged me, and blessed me by saying, "If you start new church in countryside, you will face difficult times financially, however your effort will produce fruit and your reward will be great in heaven." When I woke up, I realized that first dream was not from God. If the superintendent was from God's revelation, he would not be angry towards me. From this dream I concluded that I should start a new church in countryside.

To be certain, I wanted one more sign from God. I prayed that I would start where I received positive responses from churches. I contacted churches located in the city and the countryside. The Bible Baptist Church in my small town responded and gave me permission to start a Methodist church beginning Easter Sunday in 2005. To have use of the church building, I cleaned the church facility, mowed the grass, and paid \$500 a month. A year later, an article came out about The United Methodist Church and homosexual recognition. The Bible Baptist Church was a conservative church. The women had to wear long skirts and all the members read the King James Version (KJV) of the Bible only. At the time, the board members of the church strongly opposed the policy of the liberal United Methodist Church. I explained my church was Methodist but did not belong to the UMC and that my

denomination was very conservative. However, the board did not accept us, and we had to leave the church. I still have a good relationship with Pastor George, the senior pastor of that church who helped me start a Korean church. My father-in-law blamed me for what happened, but the new believers who accepted Jesus through the church I established encouraged me and gave me a word of blessing that God would help us.

After being expelled from the Bible Baptist Church, I unintentionally discovered our next building location, a commercial building owned by Calvary Chapel Ocean Gateway. I visited and met senior pastor Don Mitchell. He allowed us to use the church starting from the following Sunday. I received lots of blessings from that church. Every year I attended the Calvary Chapel conference and learned their system and beliefs. The Calvary Chapel denomination was founded by Chuck Smith who was also well known in Korea as a Bible teacher. One of interesting tenets of their theology is that they do not approve of woman pastors.

For the first year of the new church, I did not receive any salary and only received \$1,000 the second year. I had a tremendously difficult time financially. One day, I was sad because I did not have money to put gas in my car. I could not go anywhere to share the gospel and could not drive some young people needing a ride to come to my church. I was crying and praying to God in the chair of the

sanctuary. I asked God why I was here and what did I have to do.

During the prayer, I fell asleep for a moment. Someone knocked on the door and I woke up and opened it. It was quite unusual to have people passing by visit, because the church was a commercial building with no sign at the time. The person who stopped by my church proceeded to give me some money for missions. I asked him how he found my church, and he told me he suddenly wanted to stop at my church building to come in. God had provided.

I learned to experience God's manna provision every day as I shared the gospel with my church members. The first five years of pioneering this church start was a series of miracles. At first it was an exciting experience to me. As time went on, however, I started getting tired. I began praying to God to allow me to live a more predictable life than a life requiring constant miraculous expectation.

One day I got mail from Laos. A pastor who studied theology with me at seminary in Korea went to Laos as a missionary and sent me a letter asking me to provide toys from America. I could not buy clothes or toys for my own children at the time. It was an impossible request as I did not have enough money to even buy gas for the car. Nevertheless, I visited my church members houses, collected dolls and toys that they did not use, and sent them to Laos. My pastor friend was able to start a pre-kindergarten school at home. Now his

school is approved by the government and has grown to include middle and high school as well.

From the start of the new church, I prayed for people who had sicknesses and illnesses. In the beginning, some members did not want healing prayer because only a few of them were ever sick and most days none were sick. However, based upon my understanding of the Bible, I did not want to stop praying for healing. One day, an old friend from Korea attended my church service. At the end of the worship time, I prayed for the people who had pain, sickness, illness, or other physical problems. I asked them to place their right hand on their sick point. As a result of this prayer, my friend was healed. Years before, when he had a construction job, the second finger on his left hand was cut in half horizontally while he was cutting wood. He had surgery, but the doctor said that his finger would not be able to move again. At our worship service, he just followed the order of the healing prayer at the end of service. He placed his right hand on his left second finger and was healed. My church members were able to experience this healing. After he was healed, my friend was able to play guitar in worship again.

Two years after starting the church, I suggested a special early morning service during Easter Week. Pastor Don Mitchell, who was the senior pastor of Calvary Chapel Ocean Gateway from whom we rented space, wanted to join the Korean service. I did not want him to

join, because I could not preach in English for him. All my church members were Korean and most of them could not understand English. Also, I did not have the ability to speak English well enough to preach in it. However, he still wanted to join our special early morning prayer time. At the service I preached about the blood of Jesus in Korean and then we had prayer time. Pastor Don suddenly cried out and prayed for a long time. After finishing the prayer time, I asked him what happened. He replied that when he listened to my preaching in Korean, he understood it in English. He also felt fire in his backbone which was hurt and had chronic pain since he was a football player in college. He was suddenly able to move his back freely without any pain and spoke in Korean, "At the cross all my sin is gone away." He had never before spoken any Korean.

As I mentioned earlier, the financial pressures were very high for the first five years of the church start. In the meantime, what sustained me was that the church grew little by little, and many miracles of God took place. Even more difficult than the financial pressures were the fact that it was hard to live in the house of my father-in-law. In the Bible, Jacob and Moses lived with their father-in-laws. I was comforted by these stories. I said to myself repeatedly that God would use me one day like Moses and Jacob.

My father-in-law had a hard time seeing his daughter suffer financially. He would focus on the current situation rather than on

faith. He was also extremely sensitive to the gossip of the people in the neighborhood. Some people in the village felt sorry for my wife. The poverty of poor pastor's wife made it difficult for my father-in-law. He seemed to be struggling with his inner battles and was often angry with me or cursed at me. He was never satisfied, despite his many experiences of God.

The more serious problem was his intervention in church administration. He had issues of resentment when he was not made an elder of the church in the early years. As more and more people began to come to the church, he decided to become an elder through his own will. Being my father-in-law made a strong claim to church members for him becoming an elder. Once he became an elder, the image of our church became the family church or his church and not the image of a house of God managed by the pastor. I have discovered that many immigrant churches are recognized as some leader's church instead of being called a house of God.

I ultimately decided to pray to God as to whether I should leave the church and give leadership of the first church I built in the USA over to my father-in-law. I was eager to get an answer as to whether or not I was to go to another place to have a ministry. I went to a prayer house called Anna Prayer Mountain. I fasted in prayer for three days. At the end of the days of fasting prayer I received a phone

call from a church located in New London, Connecticut. I accepted this event as a sign from God, and I decided to go to a new place.

My new ministry in the New London, Connecticut was not long. I taught the Bible to thirty young men and women. Most of the youth were there as chef interns at a hotel called Mohegan Sun. I was still struggling with financial issues. My first son David could not go to kindergarten because we did not have enough money. One relative who visited learned about this and gave us \$950 for one-month's tuition for David. After one month, David had to quit kindergarten again. The president of the kindergarten felt sorry for our situation and lowered David's tuition to \$50. My son was one of the smartest kids there. I once again lived each day by the grace of God.

The young men and women of the ministry were grateful for our dedication and effort. They stayed up all Thanksgiving night so that on Black Friday they could buy a big TV for my family. When Lehman brothers filed for bankruptcy on September 15, 2008, a great economic crisis came, forcing almost all our young people to leave the United States. Our time in New London was drawing to an end.

In addition, there was an incomprehensible rumor from one woman in the church, which led me to leave the church more quickly. She had come to my house to ask about a member of the church who gambled. She left and went to his house and misconstrued what I had said. I was put in a very difficult situation as a pastor. Instead of

blaming the woman, I decided to leave the church and announced that I would resign the following Sunday. Shortly thereafter, my wife gave birth to our third child. Right after seeing my daughter, I drove blindly to Los Angeles. It took seven days to arrive. I attended one Korean church in Anaheim and cried out every night for several hours with an uncertain future and a longing for my three children.

I became almost homeless for six months, barely hanging on. I tried to commit suicide and went to a pharmacy to buy rat poison, but the pharmacy no longer sold the poison pills. I did not find meaning for my life and could not find any hope. On a Friday service, I joined a prayer meeting feeling that I might die if I did not overcome this situation. The pastor of the church asked us to write down a prayer request. I wrote a list of eight prayer requests that were promises to God. The first three were: "If you give me a chance one more time to do ministry again with my family, I will do my best. Second, I will not take a vacation until the church is well and comforted. Third, I will not take rest on Mondays until the church gets its own building." I wrote these prayer requests without any hope, dream, or vision. After I came back home, I received a phone call from one church. The next day I had a call from another church, and later two more churches contacted me about being their senior pastor.

Ministry in Palm Springs, CA

I was just thirty-three years old when I was invited for the first time to be a senior pastor. God led me to the Palm Springs Korean Church, and in the process saved me at the edge of a cliff in my life. Since I became a senior pastor of Palm Springs Church, I have gone with my church members to mission fields in Mexico, China, Cambodia, and Indian reservations. The most unforgettable memory of a mission was in Mexico. I preached the gospel, and the members of church did what they could do to help. Someone cut peoples' hair, others helped construct a cross, others offered acupuncture for sickness, and still others led VBS for the children. After worship one day, a man asked us to follow him to where he introduced us to the church he pastored. He asked us to help finish his church building that still had reinforcing bars sticking out of the ground that had been placed eight years prior. I suggested to my members to buy materials, nails, cement, wood, and iron plates. The local church members could build the structure themselves, but they needed materials. Some of our mission team opposed the idea because of our own financial issues. At that time, we were renting a worship space and did not have enough money for our own building. Finally, I persuaded them, and we bought all the material that they need to finish the construction.

One year later, the pastor of that church called me, asking me to join the service to dedicate the completed building to God. My church members were going to the Mexican church again. While we were traveling to Mexico, a senior pastor of a church in Thousand Palms called to ask me if I was willing to help his church sell their building to my church. I told him that we were on our way to Mexico, but that I could meet him the next day. An elder of my church and I went to the Thousand Palms church where the senior pastor gave us a good price to buy their church building. The property was on 3.3 acres and had two buildings. The price had been \$1,500,000 one year ago, but the price had dropped to \$599,000. It was a good price, but my church didn't have enough money.

I announced all this to my church members on Sunday. My young son attended the adult worship at that time rather than go to the children's ministries. After hearing the announcement, my son wanted to offer all his money so that we could buy our own church building. During his summer vacation he had saved \$200 from mowing the grass at his grandfather's house. Some of the members saw my son's dedication and they committed to a special offering for the new church. We gathered \$400,000, but it was not yet enough. Thankfully, the church owner offered financing to us. We just had to give \$1,500 monthly for principal and interest. After buying the building we moved to the new church property. There was a Christian

school already operating there, which paid the church \$1,500 every month for rent, just enough to cover our mortgage. It was another miracle. Korean Christian media shared our church story on newspapers, TV, and radio. The title was “The Miracle of Palm Springs,” with the subtitle “Korean Palm Springs church built Mexican church, and God built Palm Springs Korean Church.”

The year before we moved into our new church home, we wanted to have a Thanksgiving Day service at the church where we were renting. We were unable to use the fellowship hall since the home church was using it for their own party that evening. We instead set up a table outside and shared a meal on the parking lot. I preached to all who attended, “Next Thanksgiving, God will give us our own building. Let us not be discouraged but look to God's work.” The people who lived in the neighborhood thought I had no sense of reality or was delusional. But exactly one year later, thanks be to God, we had fellowship in our own building on Thanksgiving 2014. My proclamation was fulfilled. Many miracles and testimonies continued to overflow.

My ministry goal in the USA is to build the Kingdom of God. The first step is going to the ends of the earth with my church members, sharing the good news. The second goal is doing ministries with the movement of the Holy Spirit. I graduated from the Methodist Theological University in Korea with an MDiv degree and came to the

United States to start my immigrant ministry in 2004. Most Korean pastors come to the USA with the goal of studying theology, but I came to the USA as an immigrant. That meant I needed to study English more, but that I also did not have the money to study. When my ministries became more financially settled, I began my Doctor of Ministry program in Pastoral Studies at Claremont School of Theology in 2012 and earned my DMin in 2015. The program supported Korean and English bilingual language courses. I learned much through my study at Claremont School of Theology, however, I felt eager to learn theology in English to enable me to share the gospel in all the world. I entered the International Theological Seminary located in West Covina, CA. I finished the coursework and did a thesis to earn a master's degree in English. My thesis was about the liberation theology of the Korean immigration church in the USA. Through this study, I researched more about Korean Han (suffering), resentment, oppression, and sorrow. I especially understood more about immigrant feelings and their experiences of discriminations. I also learned that an answer to this can be found through the worship and movement of the Holy Spirit.

I then felt more eager to learn theology about the Holy Spirit. At that time, I met Yoon-Sun Shin at the annual conference of the Korean Methodist Church in Los Angeles (LA). She gave me information about United Theological Seminary in Dayton, Ohio,

where Professor Andrew Sung Park taught. While I was studying at Claremont School of Theology, I had met Professor Andrew Sung Park. I became interested in studying mysticism and the Holy Spirit from him. In his lectures he had introduced me to two of the world leaders in the Holy Spirit movement, Randy Clark and Heidi Baker. I wanted to learn and work academically with Andrew Park.

Through his teaching, I published the book *The Psychology in the Bible* in Korea. It has been published five times within the past two years. The time leading up to its publishing is interesting. When I first came to the Korean church in Palm Springs, even the neighbors did not know the church well. Our church is in a resort area and needed more publicity to bring in outside guests. Our church finances did not allow us to advertise using newspapers, radio, or television. I spent almost six months visiting the presidents of radio and television stations and newspaper reporters with Korean bread asking for publicity. As a result of my persistent efforts, I was able to serialize columns in radio and newspapers for several years, and I have been involved in TV broadcasting so far without any financial investment from the church. My church became more and more known through the media, and more tourists visited my church.

A person who loved me made a commemorative bookbinding of three and half years of my newspaper columns. I received the binding and then went to a restaurant to meet a person who left the church as

they had been hurt. Suddenly I heard a voice within my inner heart that said to give him the bookbinding to heal his wounded heart. Honestly, the binding-book was so dear and precious to me that I did not want to give it to him. But God gave me great enlightenment in the moment, showing me that the binding was God-given grace. I knew I had to give it to him if it could lead to his reconciliation and salvation. I gave him my precious memories and knowledge. When I came home that evening, I unexpectedly received a proposal from a publisher to formally publish my column as a book. Every time God has asked me give up something precious to me, it has produced much fruit and has returned to me in abundance.

I have a lot of interest in spiritual phenomena and a lot of curiosity about the prophetic dreams and spiritual gifts which are described in the Bible. There have been many things in my past that cannot be explained scientifically. Before the hardships of the church came, God showed me dreams, which helped me overcome. God also provided miracles when I earnestly prayed. Blaise Pascal said that it is the heart which experiences God, and not the reason. This, then is faith: God felt by the heart, not by reason.²

The ministry of healing took place in Palm Springs as well as in the early days of my first church in Maryland. Through healing prayer, a deacon in my church was healed of a migraine headache that had

² Blaise Pascal, *Pensees*, in *Great Books of the Western World 33*, W. F. Trotter, trans. (New York: The Great Books, 1980), 222.

afflicted him for twenty-eight years. After one worship service, I put my right hand on his head, earnestly proclaimed healing, and he was freed from his migraine headaches. He brought another sick man immediately after he was healed, but this other man was not healed. This provided an opportunity to affirm the importance of the receiver's attitude and faith in healing.

At the end worship services, many were healed by God through healing prayers, even though I had never studied this phenomenon. Lumps in my mother's neck disappeared, the deacon's toothache disappeared, a herniated disc was healed, and another person's arthritis disappeared after eighteen years of suffering. I first experienced a bit of an academic approach to this phenomenon through Andrew Park at Claremont.

When I studied theology at the Methodist Theological University in Korea, I learned a scientific approach to the Bible rather than a spiritual approach. As a Methodist pastor, I have taken "experience" to be one of the most important concepts of theology. The four sides of the Wesley Quadrilateral are scripture, tradition, reason, and experience. These are core doctrines and basic to the study of theology. John Wesley, the founder of Methodism, led a movement of the Holy Spirit.

Nevertheless, Methodist theology has been transformed over the years into a liberal theology in many branches of the Methodist

branches are still conservative, so it's best to qualify the statement.

The approach to scripture has become more often academic study of the Bible rather than spiritual study the Bible. This, in my view, is why the Methodist churches are now declining. The churches of most major denominations have declined, but the churches which focus on the Holy Spirit movement have been seeing new growth, especially among the independent churches.

My theological pursuit is incarnation theology. The God of Abraham, the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob becomes my God. Job said, "My ears had heard of you but now my eyes have seen you" (Job 42:5). The apostle John said, "That which was from the beginning, which we have heard, which we have seen with our eyes, which we have looked at and our hands have touched, this we proclaim concerning the Word of life" (1 John 1:1). This is because the Word is living and moving. My church has been doing a healing ministry through prayers at the end of worship every Sunday. Through this time, many members have experienced healing and have been sharing their testimonies. Every time my church members and I have gone to Mexico, China, and first nations reservations in the USA, I have placed my hand on the heads of those who had sickness and illness and have prayed. Each time the spiritual experience has caused us to share the dramatic work of the Holy Spirit. Even demons have left people. One time a demon threw a man down before my members,

and yet came out without injuring them. I want to establish a theory of this phenomenon theologically.

I have experienced many successes and some failures in my ministry. The successful aspect has been the quantitative growth of the church through passionate preaching and spiritual experience. But the struggle between the church members and the conflict among some people causes the church to shake and corrupt itself. The lesson learned from this is that the pastor must always be neutral and unbiased, not to speak to or to engage in the slander of others. Most importantly, we must all receive and obey the Holy Spirit. This applies not only to all of the members and their children, but also to pastors and church staff. They must be witnesses of Jesus Christ and share the gospel to the ends of the earth. They must be his disciples. Furthermore, the pastor and the leaders must train members in reading of the Bible, studying the Bible together, memorizing the Bible, understanding truth about the Holy Spirit, and must send them to the mission fields of their homes, workplaces, and the ends of the earth as messengers of the Lord.

New Ministry in Albany, NY

On June 24, 2021, I was appointed Albany Sarang Fellowship Korean Methodist Church. Before being called to be the senior pastor at a church in New York, I received a calling offer from Agape World

Mission Church, one of the large churches in LA, and I also received an offer from a large church in Korea as the senior pastor. Before I came to Albany, NY, God showed me and revealed to me in a dream of few people standing and begging me, "Come over here and help us." I received a callings and emails from other churches to be a senior pastor of that churches, I was confused and wondered if I was not hearing the voice of God clearly about Albany Sarang Fellowship Korean Church. After a long wait, I was assigned to a new church and came here. I started teaching about the Holy Spirit through the Bible college. As in the Church of Palm Springs, there was doubt, ignorance, and disbelief in the work of the Holy Spirit here. So, I became eager to check with scientific data whether it is possible to change the skeptical view of the Holy Spirit among the cessationists from a Presbyterian background or those among the immigrant church who are just starting to believe through Bible study.

Immigrant Church Context

The situation of immigrant churches is that most of the first-generation immigrants feel limited in their ability to communicate in English. The first group feels the limits of conversation even with their children. There are many people who feel disconnected from society and are caught up in the glamorous past in Korea. Many immigrants live under extreme stress due to the barriers of English as well as

cultural barriers and social position restrictions. Korea is getting richer and richer, and its worldly position is getting higher, while immigrants living in the US live in relative deprivation and marginalized classes. As a result, they often explode in church with their bitterness, resentment, and nervous reaction in their unfamiliar situation.

The second group is multicultural families with international marriages, where the separated spouses often do not communicate with their husbands and children. Not a small number of the women have been abandoned by their husbands, and as a result of this disregard and severing relationships, they try to overcome their loneliness and psychological pain through faith. Among them, there are many cases where the pastor is regarded as a lover like a husband, and there are many cases of rivalry and jealousy with each other. If they do not receive social recognition, they try to gain recognition through the Korean church. One of the unique characteristics of the Korean church is that there is a system of deacons, exhorters, and elders beyond the denomination, and there are many cases where they try to get promoted in the church because it is regarded as a promotion in social status.

The third group is those who want to apply the denominational background in Korea to the current situation. Among them, there are groups who claim to suspend the gift of the Holy Spirit while

advocating Calvin's Reformed theology, thinking that they are holy and Bible-centered. In Korean Presbyterian groups, elders and pastors have the same canonical position, so they insist on their own theological ideas and philosophical methods and carry them out. In many immigrant churches, pastors are often expelled by elders. The deacons and elders of the church are thought of as a class, and sometimes they show off their power as a group within the church.

A fourth group is the reclusive ones. Everything is unfamiliar and they avoid people. Some immigrants are afraid to go to restaurants, and others are afraid to meet people. Even within the church, they avoid interacting with people or meet only with a small number of people, and there are many cases where they continue to complain and criticize.

The immigrant society is a group of people who leave the country, leave their parents, and leave friends, so it is often easy to leave the church. They leave the pastor easily and give their hearts to another church and pastor. That is why the church keeps breaking down, creating new ones, and disappearing repeatedly. There is no way other than the work of the Holy Spirit to build up such a weak immigrant church.

The Present Ministry

Together, my church and I have been involved in many missions. However, I have honestly faced pastoral and environmental limits. Though we are a minority church, we have nevertheless been very active and fruitful. My ministry now has seven small group meetings within our church context. I set up seven leaders for Bible study and intercession in each house and another co-leader to keep in touch with each member. There is a Bible study meeting for the seven leaders. I have a theme each month to educate and train leaders. I have taught and shared topics on the Holy Spirit, tabernacles, reading the Bible, Revelation, and Genesis. I shared with them a new book of Holy Spirit, which I published at the end of 2020 in Korea.

Our church has a mission team. We visit to Cambodia, Mexico, and China three times a year to perform and share the gospel. The mission team consists mainly of the core members who attended the Bible school in the church. We also have intercessory prayer meetings every Tuesday, Thursday, and Sunday. I lead them for five weeks. Throughout this period, I teach the leaders of the prayer team primarily about the definition of prayer. They pray for an hour, praying for the church, the pastor, the nations, and America. Now I am going to lead this prayer meeting in the work of the Holy Spirit. Our church organization has twenty-two departments, including worship, education, finance, mission, social service, administration,

etc. One-tenth of the church's budget is spent on missions, with mission teams visiting three countries. After the annual summer VBS event, our educational mission to the Mexico will continue.

There are three mission groups in the church. There is one men's and five women's mission groups. This mission ministry is its own organization, which raises funds through various events. The women's ministry makes and sells kimchi and dumplings to raise mission funds. The men's ministry raises mission funds through car washes and church member's shoes washes and playing golf. The education department raises mission funds by selling ice cream and desserts.

Finally, the Korean school is an affiliated institution of our church and teaches Korean history, culture, food, and language to everyone who wants to learn. Even people of other ethnicities in the region are welcome to attend. Through this organization, the gospel is proclaimed, and many are transformed for mission purposes. Although there is much effective ministry and mission in our church, not all members or even all leadership believe in the active gifts of the Holy Spirit.

Conclusion

I have faced big challenges to overcome the limitations of immigrant ministry. However, through the UTS DMin program, I have

learned more about the Holy Spirit. Through the ministry of Randy Clark and Andrew Park, I have been able to encounter the broader field of the Holy Spirit and to face new challenges. Above all, I am grateful for the solid academic background in the work of the Holy Spirit.

Since my book on the theory of the Holy Spirit has been published, I now am approaching the full application of the work of the Holy Spirit. Ultimately, I would like to teach pastors about the work of the Holy Spirit through the Korean immigrant pastors' meetings when pastors meet for a ministerial. I especially would like help pastors serving small churches. I want to share with them how to revive the church and how to begin the work of the Holy Spirit. Recently, a book about the Holy Spirit that I wrote and published is being translated into English and Chinese. Now I am preparing to teach the ministry of the Holy Spirit in multiple languages. I have taught the work of the Holy Spirit in Chinese Theological Seminary for the past two decades, for one year at Lao Theological Seminary in Cambodia, and for three years at Mexican Theological Seminary. Now, I hope to enter a deeper world through my future studies and experiences.

To enhance that future, I now turn to focus on how to effectively impart understanding and experiences of the Holy Spirit to immigrants from a cessationist tradition, or those who are new to the

charismatic church experience, in hope of gaining understanding and effectiveness at bringing them into the experience of God's empowerment and gifting. The project will focus on a redaction of teachings I have done before into an eight-week concentrated process for new experiential understanding of the person and work of the Holy Spirit.

CHAPTER TWO

BIBLICAL FOUNDATIONS

“I baptize you with water, but he will baptize you with the Holy Spirit” (Mark 1:8). The project at hand is to bring church members through an informative and experiential process about the baptism of the Holy Spirit. Many believe that the work of the Holy Spirit ended in the New Testament times. Because of this incorrect mindset, the biblical basis for this study is Mark 1:8: “I baptize you with water, but he will baptize you with the Holy Spirit.” In this passage, Jesus mentions another baptism in addition to John's baptism.

This chapter describes the work of the Holy Spirit and the importance of receiving a baptism in the Holy Spirit beyond a baptism with water. It starts with the words of Jesus regarding the Holy Spirit, flowing through His crucifixion, resurrection, and ascension. It continues with the work of the Holy Spirit in the Book of Acts. However, the work of the Holy Spirit does not begin with the New Testament but is shown to be active throughout the Old Testament as well. The presenting passage of Mark 1:8 is examined in detail. Following this, other descriptions of the Holy Spirit from Scripture are

presented. Through this chapter, the on-going work of the Holy Spirit will be highlighted.

The Holy Spirit in the New Testament

Jesus connected the importance of the Holy Spirit with the kingdom of God.

In reply Jesus declared, "I tell you the truth, no one can see the kingdom of God unless he is born again." "How can a man be born when he is old?" Nicodemus asked. "Surely he cannot enter a second time into his mother's womb to be born!" Jesus answered, "I tell the truth, no one can enter the kingdom of God unless he is born of water and the Spirit." (John 3:3-5)

Most of Jesus' preaching was about heaven. One of the conditions of entering heaven is the rebirth from the Holy Spirit. This condition is not only valid at the time of Jesus but is still valid now. Jesus told His disciples that the reason for his crucifixion was that we would receive the Holy Spirit. "I tell you the truth: It is for your good that I am going away. Unless I go away, the Counselor will not come to you; but if I go, I will send him to you" (John 16:7). He died on the cross and was resurrected on the third day. After his resurrection, the first words spoken to the disciples were to receive the Holy Spirit. "He breathed on them and said, 'Receive the Holy Spirit'" (John 20:22).

Jesus was with the disciples forty days (Acts 1:3) after the resurrection. Right before his ascension,

Jesus came to them and said, "All authority in heaven and on earth has been given to me. Therefore, go and make disciples of all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the

Son and of the Holy Spirit, and teaching them to obey everything I have commanded you. And surely, I am with you always, to the very end of the age.” (Matt. 28:18-20)

As he ascended to heaven, the last words spoken to them again emphasized the Holy Spirit.

“You will receive power when the Holy Spirit comes on you; and you will be my witness in Jerusalem, and in all Judea and Samaria, and to the ends of the earth.” After he said this, he was taken up before their very eyes, and a cloud hid him from their sight. (Acts 1:8-9)

Jesus' last concern for us was the Holy Spirit. After the ascension of Jesus Christ, the disciples waited on and then received the Holy Spirit.

When the day of Pentecost came, they were all together in one place. Suddenly a sound like the blowing of a violent wind came from heaven and filled the whole house where they were sitting. They saw what seemed to be tongues of fire that separated and came to rest on each of them. All of them were filled with the Holy Spirit and began to speak in other tongues as the Spirit enabled them” (Acts 2:1-4).

The ministry of the disciples included going to a church and teaching them not only John's baptism but also the baptism of the Holy Spirit.

When the apostles in Jerusalem heard that Samaria had accepted the word of God, they sent Peter and John to them. When they arrived, they prayed for them that they might receive the Holy Spirit, because the Holy Spirit had not yet come upon any of them; they had simply been baptized into the name of the Lord Jesus. Then Peter and John placed their hands on them, and they received the Holy Spirit. (Acts 8:14-17)

The church of Samaria did not know about the Holy Spirit. They only knew the baptism of John in the name of Jesus Christ. This means

it is possible to accept the word of God and be baptized in Jesus' name without receiving the baptism of the Holy Spirit.

Apollos of Alexandria was a good speaker and educated about the Bible, but he did not know about the Holy Spirit.

A certain Jew named Apollos, born at Alexandria, an eloquent man, and mighty in the scriptures, came to Ephesus. This man was instructed in the way of the Lord; and being fervent in the spirit, he spoke and taught diligently the things of the Lord, knowing only the baptism of John. And he began to speak boldly in the synagogue: whom when Aquila and Priscilla had heard, they took him unto them, and expounded unto him the way of God more perfectly. (Acts 18:24-25, KJV)

He boldly preached the gospel about Jesus Christ in the synagogue, but he did not know about the Holy Spirit. When Paul went to Ephesus it happened similarly.

While Apollos was at Corinth, Paul took the road through the interior and arrived at Ephesus. There he found some disciples and asked them, 'Did you receive the Holy Spirit when you believe?' They answered, 'No, we have not even heard that there is a Holy Spirit.' So, Paul asked, 'Then what baptism did you receive?' 'John's baptism,' they replied. Paul said, 'John's baptism was a baptism of repentance. He told the people to believe in the one coming after him, that is, in Jesus.' On hearing this, they were baptized into the name of the Lord Jesus. When Paul placed his hands on them, the Holy Spirit came on them, and they spoke in tongues and prophesied. There were about twelve men in all. (Acts 19:1-7)

The church of Ephesians did not know about the Holy Spirit. In the Book of Acts the Holy Spirit worked through Philip to reach the Ethiopian eunuch.

Now an angel of the Lord said to Philip, "Go south to the road—the desert road—that goes down from Jerusalem to Gaza." So, he started out, and on his way, he met an Ethiopian eunuch, an important official in charge of all the treasury of Candace,

queen of the Ethiopians. This man had gone to Jerusalem to worship, and on his way, home was sitting in his chariot reading the book of Isaiah the prophet. The Spirit told Philip, "Go to that chariot and stay near it." Then Philip ran up to the chariot and heard the man reading Isaiah the prophet. "Do you understand what you are reading?" Philip asked. "How can I," he said, "unless someone explains it to me?" So, he invited Philip to come up and sit with him. The eunuch was reading this passage of Scripture: "He was led like a sheep to the slaughter, and as a lamb before the shearer is silent, so he did not open his mouth. In his humiliation he was deprived of justice. Who can speak of his descendants? For his life was taken from the earth." The eunuch asked Philip, "Tell me, please, who is the prophet talking about, himself or someone else?" Then Philip began with that very passage of Scripture and told him the good news about Jesus. As they traveled along the road, they came to some water and the eunuch said, "Look, here is water. Why shouldn't I be baptized?" And he gave orders to stop the chariot. Then both Philip and the eunuch went down into the water and Philip baptized him. When they came up out of the water, the Spirit of the Lord suddenly took Philip away, and the eunuch did not see him again, but went on his way rejoicing. (Acts 8:26-39)

These are just a few of the examples of the work of the Holy Spirit in the New Testament. The work of the Holy Spirit is described in incredible detail in multiple places. However, the Holy Spirit has also been working from the beginning of the creation.

The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament

In the manifestation of the work of the Holy Spirit, it is often said that the beginning is Pentecost. However, the Holy Spirit, as the third Person of the Trinity, has always been present. According to biblical scholars John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue, the Holy Spirit is referred to from the time of creation (Gen. 1:2) all the way to the last Old Testament book (Mal. 2:15). God's Spirit appears most

frequently in Isaiah (fifteen times), Ezekiel (fifteen times), Numbers (seven times), Judges (seven times), 1 Samuel (seven times), and Psalms (five times).³

The work of the Holy Spirit began in Genesis. “Now the earth was formless and empty, darkness was over the surface of the deep, and the Spirit of God was hovering over the waters” (Gen. 1:2). John H. Sailhamer states that “the Spirit of God,” could also be literally translated as “a mighty wind,” but that this translation it is not suited to the rest of the passage “hovering over the waters.” The Spirit of God is the only reading compatible with the verb “hovering.” “Hovering” is simply not suited to a translation of the blowing of a mighty wind.⁴ Sailhamer points out the use of “hovering” in the Old Testament is akin to an eagle “hovering” over the nest of its young, protecting and preparing their nest (Deut. 32:11).⁵

Hermann Gunkel points to the Spirit of God as operating on chaos, with the effect of bringing order to this universe. The author of Genesis describes the chaotic state at the first state of creation and then describes the origination of the current ordered world.⁶ The word

³ John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue, *Biblical Doctrine: A Systematic Summary of Bible Truth* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2017), 334.

⁴ John H. Sailhamer, “Genesis,” in *The Expositor’s Bible Commentary 2*, Frank E. Gaebelin, gen. ed., (Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1990), 25.

⁵ Sailhamer, “Genesis,” 25.

⁶ Hermann Gunkel, *Genesis*, trans. Mark E. Biddle (Macon Georgia: Mercer University Press, 1997), 103.

ruah in Hebrew (as in Gen. 1:2) is translated as breath, ghost, wind, and spirit.⁷ The Hebrew word *ruah* appears 378 times in the Old Testament, while the identical Aramaic word occurs an additional eleven times in the book of Daniel. It is usually translated as “spirit” (1 Sam. 16:14), “wind” (Ex. 10:13), or “breath” (Gen. 6:17). Context almost always determines the intended meaning, distinguishing, for example, between the Spirit of God (Gen. 6:3), and the spirit of man (Job 10:12) or between an attitude (Prov. 16:18) and the immaterial part of man (Ps. 31:5).⁸ The Spirit of God was hovering over chaos, protecting and preparing for the next step. Gerhard Von Rad added the meaning “shakes” from Jeremiah 23:9, in addition to “hovering” as mentioned above in Deuteronomy 32:11 with regard to an eagle. According to Von Rad, in the ancient world the sea was always seen as a symbol of chaos and fear. The Spirit of God, the Holy Spirit, hovered over the chaotic and fearful waters of the earth.⁹ This makes it difficult to deny that the Holy Spirit was present at creation in Genesis.

Another argument is the plural use of God in the creation of humanity. “Then God said, ‘Let us make man in our image, in our likeness, and let them rule over the fish of the sea and the birds of the

⁷ Haim Baltzan, *Webster’s New World: Hebrew Dictionary* (Cleveland, OH: Wiley Publishing Inc., 1992), 361.

⁸ MacArthur and Mayhue, *Biblical Doctrine*, 334.

⁹ Gerhard Von Rad, *Genesis*, trans. [International Bible Commentary 1 (Seoul, South Korea: Korea Theological Institute, 2001), 51-2.

air, over the livestock, over all the earth, and over all the creatures that move along the ground” (Gen. 1:26). The “let us” can refer to the Trinity of Father, Son, and Holy Spirit.

Later in Genesis, Joseph was called a man touched by “the Spirit of God.” “And Pharaoh said unto his servants, can we find such a one as this is, a man in whom the Spirit of God is?” (Gen. 41:38). Gunkel states that Pharaoh was astonished at the superhuman wisdom of Joseph. Pharaoh surmised that God must have revealed this wisdom to Joseph who therefore must have “the Spirit of God” in him. The “spirit” is the divine power which produces wonders and mighty things in people.¹⁰ The divine power is personified in the Holy Spirit, or the Spirit of God. The narrator of this story described Joseph as being dominated by the Spirit of God.

In Exodus, Moses mentions those who are filled with the spirit of wisdom, in reference to the Holy Spirit’s work, anointing people for special tasks. “Thou shalt speak unto all that are wise hearted, whom I have filled with the spirit of wisdom, that they may make Aaron’s garments to consecrate him, that he may minister unto me in the priest’s office” (Exod. 28:3, KJV). Moses said that those who received the Spirit of God were also affected by the making of gold, silver, and brass in addition to the sacrifice (Exod. 31:1-5, 35:30-33, 35:34-35).

¹⁰ Gunkel, *Genesis*, 419.

In the Book of Numbers, God told Moses that he would pour out the Spirit of God on the seventy elders so that they could help bear the burden of the people (Num. 11:16-17). Ronald B. Allen states this meant the elders would share the same Holy Spirit who animated and empowered Moses.¹¹ United Theological Seminary professor Thomas B. Dozeman interpreted this passage to mean that the spirit in Moses refers to the spirit of prophecy (see Amos 9:7). The spirit is also central in the charismatic leadership of a judge.¹² Prophecy was given as evidence of the Spirit of God (Num. 11:25). But Moses said that God wants all the people to receive the Spirit of God and all to become prophets. “Moses replied, ‘Are you jealous for my sake? I wish that all the Lord’s people were prophets and that the Lord would put his Spirit on them’” (Num. 11:29). This is analogous to “the priesthood of all believers” passage from 1 Peter 2:9.

In Deuteronomy, Moses ordained Joshua, and the spirit of wisdom flowed from Moses to Joshua, again pointing to the anointing of God’s Spirit upon leaders for a special task. “Joshua son of Nun was filled with the spirit of wisdom because Moses had laid his hands on him. So, the Israelites listened to him and did what the Lord had commanded Moses” (Deut. 34:9). After Moses had laid his hands-on Joshua, he is described as follows: “Since then, no prophet has risen

¹¹ Ronald B. Allen, “Numbers,” in *The Expositor’s Bible Commentary 2*, Frank E. Gaebelein, gen. ed., (Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1990), 792.

¹² Thomas B. Dozeman, “Numbers,” in *The New Interpreter’s Bible 2*, Leander E. Keck, et al. gen. ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1998), 106.

in Israel like Moses, whom the LORD knew face to face” (Deut. 34:10). Scripture even states that Moses was like a god before the king of Pharaoh (Exod. 7:1). Walter C. Kaiser, Jr. explains that the Lord had made Moses as “god” to Aaron and Aaron in turn as his “prophet” to the people. Moses was also ordained (Hebrew *natan*) as a “god” to Pharaoh in that he would speak and act with authority and power from above and Aaron would be Moses’ “prophet” addressing Pharaoh.¹³ Moses was the one who received the word of God, who had the Spirit of God upon him, and who faced God.

In the time of the Judges, those who had the Spirit of God became leaders and saved Israel. For instance, God raised up “Othniel son of Kenaz, Caleb’s younger brother, who saved them. The Spirit of the LORD came on him, so that he became Israel’s judge and went to war” (Judg. 3:9–10). Dennis T. Olson interpret this Bible verse to mean that God raised up Othniel as “the Spirit of the LORD” came upon him. The effect of the divine Spirit on the judge is an important criterion by which to evaluate the judge. With Othniel, the effect is positive as he is empowered and immediately victorious.¹⁴ The Spirit

¹³ Walter C. Kaiser, Jr., “Deuteronomy,” *The Expositor’s Bible Commentary 2*, Frank E. Gaebelin, gen. ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1990), 345.

¹⁴ Dennis T. Olson, “Judges,” *The New Interpreter’s Bible 2*, Leander E. Keck, et al., ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1998), 767.

had given Othniel the power and courage to unite Israel and defeat the enemy.¹⁵

However, Olson shares the positive, delayed, and even the negative works of the Holy Spirit. First, for Othniel, God's Spirit is a positive gift that changes him and leads him into powerful, decisive, and faithful action. The result is similar to the effect of God's Spirit coming upon Saul in 1 Samuel 10:6-7. Other judges, like Ehud and Deborah were given divine word (Judg. 3:20, 4:6).¹⁶ Although scripture does not explicitly state that the Spirit of God came to them, they did receive the Word of God, which can be regarded as the same thing.

Regarding the delayed work of the Holy Spirit, Olson notes that after the Spirit of the Lord came upon him (Judg. 6:34), Gideon is not immediately changed. The cowardly Gideon continues to need repeated reassurance from God through signs and dreams (6:36-7:15).¹⁷ Therefore, the effect of the work of the Holy Spirit may not appear at once. Even Jesus had to pray twice for a blind man to have his sight completely restored. "Once more Jesus put his hands on the man's eyes. Then his eyes were opened, his sight was restored, and he saw everything clearly" (Mark 8:25).

Olson mentions that there may even be what can be considered negative signs of the Holy Spirit's work. Before receiving the Spirit,

¹⁵ Olson, "Judges," 802.

¹⁶ Olson, "Judges," 767.

¹⁷ Olson, "Judges," 767.

Jephthah had been an able and cool-headed negotiator of conflicts (Judg. 11:1-28). After “The Spirit of the Lord” comes upon him (11:29), Jephthah begins to act in rash, careless, and impulsive ways by making a foolish vow that causes his daughter’s death (11:30-40). The Spirit-filled Jephthah also erupts in a hot-headed killing spree, slaying 42,000 fellow Israelites over a petty disagreement (12:1-6).¹⁸ Even if the Spirit of God comes, the response of the person can lead to problems.

As a further example of negative response to receiving the Holy Spirit, Olson points out Samson’s multiple misuses of the divine Spirit’s power (Judg. 13:25, 14:6, 19, 15:14). The Spirit of the Lord enables Samson to act powerfully, but he does so with unthinking impulse, violence, and faithlessness. In untamed response, Samson uses the Spirit’s power to slay a lion and later eat honey from its carcass. The Spirit-filled Samson kills thirty Philistines and later a thousand more with the jawbone of an ass. Samson is a Nazirite from birth (see Judges 13) and is prohibited from touching anything unclean, especially a dead body or corpse. He repeatedly breaks his Nazirite vow to God.¹⁹ Nevertheless, the Spirit of God came upon Gideon, Jephthah, and Samson to save the people (Judg. 6:34, 11:29, 14:6) and the people were saved.

¹⁸ Olson, “Judges,” 767.

¹⁹ Olson, “Judges,” 767.

In other Old Testament examples, the Holy Spirit came upon Saul when Samuel anointed him, and Saul prophesied (1 Sam. 10:1, 6-7, 10-11). Interestingly, the Spirit that came upon Saul leaves (1 Sam. 16:14). After the Spirit of God leaves Saul, evil spirits often come upon him. David writes in a Psalm, "Do not cast me from your presence or take your Holy Spirit from me" (Ps. 51:11). Perhaps he remembered that in Saul's case, the Spirit of God left. As shown in Hebrews 6:4-6, there is a possibility of being abandoned even in the presence of the Holy Spirit:

It is impossible for those who have once been enlightened, who have tasted the heavenly gift, who have shared in the Holy Spirit, who have tasted the goodness of the word of God and the power of the coming age, if they fall away, to be brought back to repentance, because to their loss they are crucifying the Son of God all over again and subjecting him to public disgrace.

After Saul, David became king by being filled with the Spirit of God (1 Sam. 16:13). In David's case, the Spirit of God spoke the word of God through David's mouth. "The Spirit of the Lord spoke through me; his word was on my tongue" (2 Sam. 23:2).

It is believed that the Psalms of David were inspired by the Spirit of God. Jesus even stated that it was through the Holy Spirit that David wrote, "The Lord said to my Lord, 'sit at my right hand until I put your enemies under your feet'" (Mark 12:36 quoting Ps. 110:1). There are many scholars who believe that the Messiah was prophesied throughout the Psalms of David through the inspiration of the Holy Spirit. In Acts, the followers of Christ rejoiced: "You spoke by

the Holy Spirit through the mouth of your servant, our father David:

‘why do the nations rage and the peoples plot in vain? The kings of the earth take their stand and the rulers gather together against the Lord and against his Anointed One’” (Acts 4:25–26 quoting Ps. 2:1–2).

Solomon's Proverbs also describe the Spirit of God from the first chapter. “If you turn at my reproof, behold, I will pour out my spirit to you; I will make my words known to you” (Prov. 1:23, ESV). Solomon is saying that God's Spirit and the Word are linked. Allen P. Loss states that wisdom is firmly resolved to pour out her spirit, her active power, on those who respond.²⁰ Similarly, Ezekiel said that the Spirit of the Lord lifted him up and gave him revelation (Ezek. 3:10).

As with David, Elijah also spoke the word of God through the power of the Holy Spirit. “The word of the Lord came to Elijah” (1 Kings 18:1). Elijah was also physically empowered by the Spirit of God (1 Kings 18:46). Later, Elisha asks Elijah for a double portion of the Holy Spirit to upon him (2 Kings 2:10). Choon-Leong Seow points out that this request is difficult because it is difficult, even impossible, for a human being to fulfill. Elijah is saying that, in essence, the privilege is not his to give (cf. Mark 10:38). However, God could grant this request, so Elijah prophesies that if Elisha witnesses his departure, then the request would be granted.²¹

²⁰ Allen P. Loss, “Proverbs,” *The Expositor's Bible Commentary 5*, Frank E. Gaebelin, gen. ed. (Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1991), 910.

²¹ Choon-Leong Seow, “2 Kings,” *The New Interpreter's Bible 3*, Leander E. Keck, et al., ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1999), 176.

The prophet Joel prophesied of the Holy Spirit to be poured out on God's people in the last days (Joel 2:28). Artur Weiser and Karl Elliger state that this is linked to Isaiah 44:3 and Zechariah 12:10 where the same images are to be found.²² Weiser and Elliger claim that prophecy, dreams, and visions regard the possession of the spirit as similar to the prophet's spirit.²³ David Allan Hubbard describes this Bible verse as the divine oracle of salvation, begun in Joel 2:19, continues as Yahweh lifts the sights of the people beyond their recovery from the plague to days of even greater blessing. In the Hebrew text these verses form chapter three, which Hubbard considers to be the oracle of salvation.²⁴ In other words, it refers to the connection between salvation and the Holy Spirit. This is similar to Jesus' soteriology. Jesus said that no one can enter the Kingdom of God unless he is born of water and the Spirit.

In Haggai there is a description of the relationship between fear and the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit and fear cannot coexist. "I covenanted with you when you came out of Egypt. And my Spirit remains among you. Do not fear" (Hag. 2:5). W. Eugene March mentioned God's "Spirit," the very presence of God, already "abides" or "remains" among the community. God was in their midst, and thus

²² Artur Weiser and Karl Elliger, *Das Buch der zwölf Kleinen Propheten* (München: 1955), trans. (1999), 194-5.

²³ Weiser and Elliger, *Twelve Minor Prophets*, 195.

²⁴ David Allan Hubbard, *Joel & Amos* (Downers Grove, IL: Inter Varsity Press, 1989), 68.

they had nothing to fear.²⁵ Biblical characters who were filled with the Holy Spirit had boldness instead of fear. When David fought Goliath, he went out without fear and triumphed. David said to the Philistine, “You come against me with sword and spear and javelin, but I come against you in the name of the Lord Almighty, the God of the armies of Israel, whom you have defied” (1Sam. 17:45).

In Zechariah we read, “This is the word of the Lord to Zerubbabel: Not by might nor by power, but by my Spirit, says the Lord Almighty” (Zech. 4:6). This is what Ben C. Ollenburger called Zion Theology. He linked this text to Psalm 33:16, “A king is not saved by his great army (or might), a warrior is not delivered by his great power.” Instead, Yaweh’s Spirit, by which God created the world (Ps. 33:6), will assist Zerubbabel. These notions are thoroughly at home in Jerusalem and its Zion theology.²⁶ Ralf L. Smith in his analysis of this text surmises that God’s Spirit is the divine power by which all opposition to the rebuilding of the temple will be removed.²⁷

Finally, in the book of Nehemiah we find again the Spirit poured out upon the Lord's prophets to speak the word of God to the Israelites. “By your Spirit you admonished them through your

²⁵ W. Eugene March, “Haggai,” *The New Interpreter’s Bible* 7, Leander E. Keck, et al., ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1996), 723.

²⁶ Ben C. Ollenburger, “Zechariah,” *The New Interpreter’s Bible* 7, Leander E. Keck, et al., ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1996), 770.

²⁷ Ralph L. Smith, *Word Biblical Commentary 32: Micah-Malachi* (Waco, Texas: Word Books Publisher, 1984), 204.

prophets” (Neh. 9:30). This indicates that even beyond the specific references to the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament, all the prophets in Scripture were led by the Spirit to speak the word of God.

These many Old Testament examples overwhelmingly show the work of the Holy Spirit before the outpouring of the Spirit in the New Testament. It can also be said that when the Spirit of God comes upon a person, the person’s response may not always appear positively. The behavior and attitude of the person who receives the Spirit of God is important. There were many problems in the church at Corinth, even though the work of the Holy Spirit was strong (see for instance 1 Cor. 14:26–31). Therefore, we must inspect ourselves so that the work of the Holy Spirit, which is essential, can be stewarded properly. Augustine of Hippo expressed that the Holy Spirit is love and the bond of the Father and the Son.²⁸

The Holy Spirit in Mark 1:8

The remainder of this chapter will focus on the study of Mark 1:8. In this passage, John the Baptist speaks of Jesus, the Messiah. He states of Jesus, “I baptize you with water, but he will baptize you with the Holy Spirit.”

Origen suggests that the Messiah does not baptize others in water. Only disciples of the Messiah baptize with water. The Messiah, however, reserves for himself the baptism of the Holy Spirit and fire.

²⁸ Alister E. McGrath, *Christian Theology an Introduction* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2005), 312–3.

According to Jerome, the water and fire are compared to the law and the gospel. Baptism by water represents law, whereas fire and the Holy Spirit represent the gospel.²⁹

According to PHEME PERKINS, “John’s baptism cannot be an end in itself.” In the Jewish tradition, Elijah was to come before the Messiah. Perkins focuses on the idea that John the Baptist cannot be enough because he is only preparing for the Messiah.³⁰ When we see John the Baptist’s clothing, we are reminded of the clothing of the prophet Elijah. “They replied, ‘He was a man with a garment of hair and with a leather belt around his waist.’ The king said, ‘That was Elijah the Tishbite’” (2 Kings 1:8).

The Synoptic Gospels as well as John’s Gospel contain the words ascribed to John the Baptist, that one is coming who is greater than John who will baptize people “in the Holy spirit.” Matthew and Luke add that the baptism will not only be in the Holy Spirit but also in/with fire (Matthew 3:11; Luke 3:16).³¹ This could refer to God’s apocalyptic action where “in holy wind and fire” means with devastating hurricanes and bolts of lightning as acts of God in judgment.³²

²⁹ Thomas C. Oden, edit. Christopher A. Hall, *Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture Series* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1998), 9–10.

³⁰ PHEME PERKINS, *New Testament Articles Matthew Mark* in *The New Interpreter’s Bible – A Commentary in Twelve Volumes*, 8 (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1995), 532.

³¹ Marius NEL, *“Baptised in the Spirit and Fire”: Single or Double Baptism?* (New Testament Society of Southern Africa, 2016), 165.

³² James McConkey Robinson, *Hermeneia—a critical and historical commentary on the Bible—The Critical Edition of Q: A Synopsis Including the*

Marius Nel suggests that the Holy Spirit and fire are the same thing, as can be read below:

That “baptize with the Holy Spirit and fire” in Q 3:16 [Matt. 3:11; Luke 3:16] refers to a single baptism with two elements or aspects is strengthened by the fact that the text only utilizes one preposition before “Spirit” and “fire” (βαπτίσει ἐν πνεύματι ἁγίῳ καὶ πυρί). A preposition not repeated before a second noun puts the two nouns in the same category, even though exceptions to the rule exist. Thus, since “Holy Spirit and fire” are governed by a single preposition in Greek (ἐν), it is grammatically more probable that a single baptism of two elements is referred to in Q 3:16 [Matt. 3:11; Luke 3:16].”³³

Based on this suggestion, the fire and Holy Spirit are identified as one.

According to Adela Yarbro Collins, the water and spirit are associated in Ezekiel 36:25–28 and a section of the dead sea scrolls (1QS 4:18–23³⁴). This also overlaps with Q 3:16–17 (Luke 3:16–17; Matt. 3:11–12).³⁵ This passage describes a separation of the same event into two different events. While baptism by water is indeed a form of baptism, it is a public event that prepares one for the baptism

Gospels of Matthew and Luke, Mark and Thomas with English, German and French Translations of Q and Thomas (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2000), lxxi.

³³ Nel Marius, “Baptised in the **Spirit** and Fire”: Single or Double **Baptism**? (New Testament Society of Southern Africa, 2016) 168.

³⁴ “God will then purify every deed of man with His truth; He will refine for Himself the human frame by rooting out all spirit of injustice from the bounds of his flesh. He will cleanse him of all wicked deeds with the spirit of holiness; like purifying waters He will shed upon him the spirit of truth (to cleanse him) of all abomination and injustice. And he shall be plunged into the spirit of purification, that he may instruct the upright in the knowledge of the Most High and teach the wisdom of the sons of heaven to the perfect of way.”

³⁵ Adela Yarbro Collins, *Mark: A Commentary*, in *Hermeneia – A Critical and Historical Commentary on the Bible*, Harold. W. Attridge, ed. (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007), 146.

of the Holy Spirit. This is demonstrated by the baptisms performed by John the Baptist. However, this was not enough, and Jesus Christ was sent to perform the baptism by the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit in this baptism is represented by fire.

In his article, Frank D. Macchia references James D.G. Dunn. Macchia goes into detail about his interpretation of Dunn's work, making the following claim: "Though 'Spirit' seems to accent the renewal and 'fire' the judgment, Dunn helpfully views the messianic baptizing 'in Spirit and fire' as a single baptism with two very different effects. It is the 'Spirit and fire' baptism of which John speaks that results in either covenant renewal or alienation and destruction."³⁶ His idea is that fire represents both punishment and salvation, marking duality in the purpose of the Spirit.

Collins states that Mark 1:8 raises the thought from Ezekiel 36:25-28³⁷ which states that water is used to cleanse. The water cleanses the outside and the Spirit cleanses the inside of a person. After receiving the Spirit from God, we become His children and we can live in the land which God has given to us. The earliest forms of Mark 1:8 did not include the word "Spirit." These early forms of the verse only mentioned baptism by water. Fledderman believes that the Holy Spirit reference was added later to Mark. We know that Ezekiel

³⁶ Frank D. Macchia, "Baptism in the Holy Spirit and Fire : Luke's Implicitly Pneumatological Theory of Atonement," *Religions* 9, no. 2:63 (February 24, 2018): 3, <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9020063>.

³⁷ Collins, *Mark*, 146.

36:25–28 speaks of water and spirit. However, there is additional documentation that supports the idea of and contrast between water and fire. The Sibylline Oracles, which predate the Book of Mark, mention water and fire (Sib. Or. 4:171–178).³⁸ This reference suggests however, that a baptism in fire would not be a blessing, but rather a punishment for sin. Based on Fledderman’s idea that the reference to spirit was added later, Collins suggests that the author intentionally omitted the word “fire” from Mark 1:8. This may have been done so that people do not view Jesus as the person who judges. For, if Mark 1:8 was to mention baptism by water and by fire, people may worry that their baptism includes judgement by Jesus Christ because fire is looked at as a punishment or a means to judge as in early texts such as the Sibylline Oracles. “He will destroy everything by fire, and it will be smoking dust (Sib. Or. 4:178).³⁹

According to the ideas of Fledderman and Collins, the fire was a metaphor for judgement and punishment, but the usage of fire in the Bible can also be used in a positive sense. For instance, Jeremiah 23:29 says, “‘Is not my word like fire,’ declares the Lord, ‘and like a hammer that breaks a rock in pieces?’” This means that the fire can be used against the false prophet or it can be worked for judgement or punishment, but it also breaks through the hardened hearts of

³⁸ Collins, *Mark*, 146.

³⁹
Collins, *Mark*, 146

people. In the book of Luke, two men were traveling from Jerusalem to Emmaus. They were upset by the crucifixion of Jesus Christ. As they walked, Jesus Christ appeared before them, but they did not recognize him. The three talked together into the evening when they arrived at the Emmaus. Eventually, they recognized him, and Jesus disappeared. "They asked each other, 'Were not our hearts burning within us while he talked with us on the road and opened the Scriptures to us?'" (Luke 24:32). The men felt their hearts burning because the word of Jesus Christ is like a fire. This fire is not only punishment, but also has the power to change a person.

Jesus said, "I have come to bring fire on earth, and how I wish it were already kindled!" (Luke 12:49). Many scholars interpret this Bible verse as Jesus giving punishment to earth with fire. If the fire only means judgement, how could Jesus wish fire upon the earth and wish it were kindled? Jesus is love, but if Fledderman and Collins were correct, and fire is only punishment, how would Jesus want such a thing? Fire cannot only be punishment or judgement. Fire is the word of God and the power of the Holy Spirit. According to Acts 2:3-4, "they saw what seemed to be tongues of fire that separated and came to rest on each of them. All of them were filled with the Holy Spirit and began to speak in other tongues as the Spirit enabled them." After Jesus ascended to heaven, the disciples met together in one

place. On the day of Pentecost, they received the Holy Spirit and they saw the tongue of fire on each person.

Jesus connected the kingdom of God with the importance of the Holy Spirit. "In reply Jesus declared, 'I tell you the truth, no one can see the kingdom of God unless he is born again.' 'How can a man be born when he is old?' Nicodemus asked. 'Surely he cannot enter a second time into his mother's womb to be born!' Jesus answered, 'I tell the truth, no one can enter the kingdom of God unless he is born of water and the Spirit'" (John 3:3-5). Much of Jesus' preaching was about heaven. One of the conditions of entering heaven is the rebirth by the Holy Spirit. This condition was not only valid at the time of Jesus but is still valid now.

As mentioned above, Jesus' first words to his disciples after his resurrection and the last words before ascending concerned the Holy Spirit. The disciples had certainly accepted the word of God as evidenced by their relationship with Jesus, but they did not receive the Holy Spirit until Pentecost. Also mentioned previously was the passage in Acts 8:14-17 where people in Samaria had accepted the word of God, but "the Holy Spirit had not yet come upon any of them" (Acts 8:15). Thus, it is biblically validated that a person can accept the word of God and even be baptized (with water) without being baptized in the Holy Spirit.

Other Similes for the Holy Spirit

The Holy Spirit is Like Water

In addition to fire, the Holy Spirit is compared to and described in various other forms. In contrast to being like fire, the Holy Spirit is described like water. “The Spirit, the water and the blood; and the three are in agreement” (1 John 5:8). The Holy Spirit was identified with water and blood. As Jesus identified himself by comparing himself to water.

In another view, Heraclitus said that one cannot look twice at the same river; for fresh waters are ever flowing in. We look and do not look at the same rivers; we are, and we are not. Therefore, water is changing and not changing. Water is the source of all creation and revives everything. The “earth was formed out of water and by water” (2 Peter 3:5). This essentially says that the Holy Spirit and Jesus are one.

This water serves to save all things. That is why Ezekiel records that all the creatures touched by the water from the temple survived (Ezek. 37:1-2). Therefore, Isaiah said that all who were thirsty would come to the river of living water (Isa. 55:1, 3). The prophet Amos also equated water and word (Amos 8:11), with the Holy Spirit being the one who imparts the word.

After Jesus told the Samaritan woman that he is living water, he said that worship should be given in spirit and truth. Then he revealed that he was the Messiah (John 4:1-26). Jesus died on the cross, and blood and water flowed from his body (John 19:34). On the other hand, Satan said that he would go to a place without water (Matt. 12:43; Luke 11:24). Those who follow the Devil are springs without water (2 Pet. 2:17). In this way, water is connected to our lives. After Naaman entered the Jordan River seven times, leprosy was healed (2 Kgs. 5:1-14). John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue state that the Holy Spirit is pictured as life-giving water, that is, salvation (John 7:38-39; 1 Cor. 12:13b; Titus 3:5-6). Paul pictured the Holy Spirit as water being poured out for the washing of regeneration (Titus 3:5-6).⁴⁰

The Holy Spirit is Like Wine

The Bible says that the blood of Christ refers to the Holy Spirit. To drink wine is to commemorate the blood.

Therefore, whoever eats the bread or drinks the cup of the Lord in an unworthy manner will be guilty of sinning against the body and blood of the Lord. A man ought to examine himself before he eats of the bread and drinks of the cup. For anyone who eats and drinks without recognizing the body of the Lord eats and drinks judgement on himself. (1 Cor. 11:27-29)

The first sign of Jesus in the Gospel of John was that the water changed into wine at the wedding feast in Cana (John 2:1-11). Jesus referred to himself as new wine (Luke 5:38). This is a clear use of the

⁴⁰

MacArthur and Mayhue, *Biblical Doctrine*, 339.

wine image by Jesus himself, with the Spirit of Jesus later used as a direct synonym for Holy Spirit.

There are also biblical references to comparing the effects of the Holy Spirit to drinking too much alcohol. “Some, however, made fun of them and said, ‘They have had too much wine’” (Acts 2:13). “Do not get drunk on wine, which leads to debauchery. Instead, be filled with the Spirit” (Eph. 5:18). The Bible tells us to be drunk with the Holy Spirit. It is said that Samuel's mother Hannah prayed as if she was drunk (1 Sam. 1:10–18). David danced and rejoiced in the king's seat without thinking of his throne. Those who are drunk with the Holy Spirit are like this (1 Chron. 15:29).

The Holy Spirit is Like Oil

The Bible symbolically compares the Holy Spirit to oil. John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue state that anointing with oil in the Old and New Testaments symbolizes appointment to an important position. Old Testament priests were anointed to the priesthood (Ex. 40:12–15). David was anointed by Samuel to be king of Israel (1 Sam. 16:13). New Testament disciples were anointed to be apostles (2 Cor. 1:21).⁴¹ “You have an anointing from the Holy One, and all of you know the truth” (1 John 2:20). Here, anointing is connected to wisdom and knowledge.

⁴¹ John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue, *Biblical Doctrine: A systematic Summary of Bible Truth* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2017), 338.

So, in the Old Testament, a king or priest is anointed and appointed. They are bestowed with wisdom and knowledge to govern the people. Isaiah spoke of the anointing of the Spirit of God as he prophesied of the Messiah. “The Spirit of Sovereign Lord is on me, because the Lord has anointed me to preach good news to the poor. He has sent me to bind up the brokenhearted, to proclaim freedom for the captives and release from darkness for the prisoners” (Isa. 61:1). It was said that those who met the second coming Jesus were discreet virgins who prepared the oil (Matt. 25:1-13). Jesus commanded to put oil on the head even when fasting (Matt. 6:17). So, the anointing of the Holy Spirit has related with prayer, appointment, and delegation.

The Holy Spirit is Like a Dove

When Jesus was baptized in the Jordan River by John the Baptist, the heavens opened and he received the Holy Spirit like dove (Matt. 3:16). The dove symbolizes purity in the Bible (Matt. 10:16). In the Song of Songs, a loved one is called a dove. Doves also symbolize peace. The dove could also be sacrificed as a burnt offering in the Old Testament (Lev. 1:14). Especially about the burnt offering, this pigeon sacrifice was for the poor.⁴²

Jesus came to earth as a sacrifice for the poor. The sacrifice of a pigeon was relatively simple compared to other sacrifices as male and

⁴² 박희, *성령의 은사*: 성령의 은사 연구 (서울: 크리스천 문헌, 2001), 45.

female birds were not distinguished. Male and female did not need to be distinguished for the poor.⁴³ The work of the Holy Spirit is to liberate the poor. When Jesus was baptized and the dove descended (a bodily representation of the Holy Spirit), the sky was torn (Mark 1:10). This is the same word used when the curtain of the tabernacle was torn when Jesus died on the cross (Mark 15:38). The baptism of the Lord foreshadows the event where the tabernacle curtain was torn, opening the way to God for the poor who were excluded from the tabernacle. Thus, the Holy Spirit, like a dove, comes to open the way to God for all those who are weak.

Conclusion

This chapter confirms that the Holy Spirit existed before creation as the Third Person of the eternal Trinity, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit, as with the Son (John 1:1-4), worked with God the Father during creation. The Holy Spirit was shown to be mentioned often in the Old Testament as well as the New Testament. The Spirit of God came upon Moses, judges, and David. Many prophets prophesied by receiving the Spirit of God and revealing the Word of God. Therefore, it is extremely unbiblical to divide history into three ages, as some do, the age of the Father (Old Testament), the age of the Son (the Gospels), and the age of the Holy Spirit (Acts

⁴³ 〇〇〇, 〇〇〇 〇〇〇 〇〇〇 〇 (〇〇: 〇〇 〇〇〇, 1999), 44.

to present day). The Holy Spirit was active in all parts and moments throughout the Bible, and there is no place in human history that is unaffected by the Holy Spirit.

When the Spirit of God comes, fear disappears, new knowledge and wisdom arise, and battles are won. However, even if the Spirit of God comes, if those who receive him do not steward his presence properly, negative results can occur. However, when responded to well, those who receive the Holy Spirit show that their fear disappears. This was seen when David fought Goliath and in the valor of the judges. Courage is formed by the anointing of the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit has a crucial role in the salvation of human beings. He is essential to the formation and sustaining of the physical creation as it was designed. He is a spirit that clears up chaos and maintains order.

This understanding sets the stage for the use of biblical teachings from the Old and New Testaments to show the continued work of the Holy Spirit. The work on Mark 1:8 will show that there are two baptisms (water and the Spirit). Part of the teaching on this point will be about how it is possible to have saving faith in Jesus without being baptized by him.

In addition to the Bible as a main resource for project teaching, it is helpful to examine the Holy Spirit's work in the post-biblical age. A survey of church history reveals much the same reality—that the

Holy Spirit remains continually active. This is a direct counterpoint to cessationist theology which we become evident through this next chapter three. In the next chapter, I will examine how the Holy Spirit was understood and worked historically.

CHAPTER THREE

HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS

During my eighteen-year pastoral ministry in the United States, I noticed that many people from Korea who came to our church from various denominational backgrounds believed in the cessationism. It affirms that the work of the Holy Spirit through spiritual gifts such as speaking in tongues, prophecy, and healing was active in the Apostolic period of the New Testament times, but also maintains that it ceased following the closing of the canon of New Testament scripture. Fundamentalists and literalists believe that the work and gifts of the Holy Spirit ended in the Apostolic period, so they reject prophetic words, or preaching about the work of the Holy Spirit in tongues-speaking, or any of the other charismatic expressions of the Holy Spirit. This chapter historically validates the continued work of the Holy Spirit to refute cessationism.

If the miraculous work of the Holy Spirit ended in the time of the Bible, we have to question how this Bible benefits us today. The New Testament was not written until decades after Jesus died. This is because the history of the Bible itself does not end with Jesus'

ascension but continues with Acts of the Apostles and other disciples as they were empowered by the Holy Spirit. Therefore, it is quite difficult to say exactly when the biblical times ended.

It is also incorrect to state that miracles, as an example of the work of the Holy Spirit, stopped when Emperor Constantine authorized Christianity. They may have diminished when Constantine endorsed Christianity as one of several allowed religions giving Christians religious freedom. However, they did not cease. They also did not cease when Christianity became the officially recognized state religion of the Holy Roman Empire. Evidence exists for the continuation of miracles into the Middle Ages and beyond.

Therefore, the position that the work of the Holy Spirit is the same now as in the Bible can be confirmed through the historical records of Christianity over the last two thousand years. The majority of those who played pivotal roles in the history of Christianity acknowledged and experienced the Holy Spirit. Even those who were negative about the continuity of the Holy Spirit's work recanted their position after they experienced the Holy Spirit's work. The notable exception was the respected theologian and cessationist John Calvin. Even reformer Martin Luther, who is often considered a cessationist theologian, was known to have healed the sick and even raised a man from the dead during his pastoral experience.

There are conservative Korean Christians in the project context, especially from Presbyterian and fundamentalist backgrounds, who are cessationists, believing that the work of the Holy Spirit is over. This chapter will examine the historical roots of cessationism while also taking a closer look at why continuationism, the antithesis of cessationism, can be justified historically. First, the history of the Early Church will be examined to see if the work of the Holy Spirit continued after the Apostles. This will include a review of those who turned from cessationism to continuationism. Next is an academic and pastoral study on whether the work of the Holy Spirit continues even now. Lastly, this chapter will include a focus particularly on whether the work of the Holy Spirit was present and whether it continued from the early Korean church history to the modern period. Included will be an examination of cessationism among conservative Korean Presbyterians.

Activity of the Holy Spirit in Early Church History

In the books of Justin Martyr (100–65 CE), he often acknowledged the Spirit of God and mentioned the grace and power of his working. “Among us you can see both men and women who have received gifts of grace from God’s spirit” (Justin, *Dialogue with Trypho the Jew* 88.1). “I will prove to you that we have not believed vain and empty myths or teachings that cannot be verified; on the

contrary, we have believed men who were filled with the divine Spirit, overflowing with grace and power” (Justin, *Dialogue with Trypho the Jew* 9.1.)⁴⁴

Justin believed in the Word of transformation by the Spirit. This Word went out to all nations over which the demons ruled (Justin, *Dialogue with Trypho* 83.4.). Every demon is exorcised, conquered, and subdued in the very name of this Son of God (Justin, *Dialogue with Trypho* 30.3.).⁴⁵ Here we can see that Justin identifies the Word with the Holy Spirit. Justin said that many people who were demon-possessed were healed in the name of Jesus.

According to Justin (in his *First Apology*), the Christian community did not consider people true Christians if they simply quoted Christ’s teachings but did not live them out. He stated that the effectiveness of Christian witness depended on the integrity of the believer’s lifestyles. Thus, the church baptized only people who lived out the things that Christ teaches.⁴⁶ This would include the works of the Holy Spirit.

The work of the Holy Spirit is also written in the early literature of the *Didache*, which is a brief early Christian treatise written

⁴⁴

Eberhard Arnold, ed., *The Early Christians* (Farmington, PA: The Plough Publishing House, 1997), 168.

⁴⁵ Arnold, *Early Christians*, 101-2.

⁴⁶

Alan Kreider, *The Patient Ferment of the Early Church* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2016), 15.

anonymously in Koine Greek, dated by modern scholars to around 100 CE in Syria.⁴⁷ Chapter 11 and verse 8 of the *Didache* reads, “but not everyone who speaketh in the spirit is a prophet, but he is so who hath the disposition of the Lord; by their dispositions they therefore shall be known, the false prophet and the prophet.”⁴⁸ Through this early literature, it can be confirmed that the early church had prophets. However, the work of the Holy Spirit must distinguish between true and false prophets, which is determined by how they live. The charismatic work of the Holy Spirit is thus shown to continue after the time in which the Bible was written.

Eusebius (263–339 CE) in his *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine* describes the miracles recorded by early church father, Papias of Hierapolis (60–130 CE). Papias describes the resurrection of a dead person in his own lifetime. Papias also wrote how Justus, surnamed Barsabas, swallowed a dangerous poison and by the grace of the Lord was unaffected. After the Savior’s ascension, this Justus was put forward along with Matthias by the holy Apostles to replace the traitor Judas.⁴⁹

⁴⁷ *Didache* [1], trans. [1] ([1]: [1], 1998), 7.

⁴⁸ *Didache*, 83.

⁴⁹

Eusebius, *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*, trans. G. A. Williamson (Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Publishing House, 1975), 151.

Eusebius also describes various miracles that Greek Bishop Irenaeus (130–202 CE) wrote about in his *Refutation and Overthrow of False Doctrine*.

But they fall far short of raising the dead, as the Lord raised them, and as did the apostles through prayer, and as among later Christians, because the need was so great and the whole of the local church besought God with much fasting and supplication, the spirit of the dead man has returned, and his life has been granted to the prayers of God's people.⁵⁰

Irenaeus also mentioned the gift of the Holy Spirit. "Similarly, we hear of many members of the Church who have prophetic gifts and by the Spirit speak with all kinds of tongues and bring men's secret thoughts to light for their own good and expound the mysteries of God."⁵¹ Eusebius further describes the mysterious scene of Fabian's appointment as the Roman bishop. Fabian, who was present, came into no one's mind. But suddenly out of the blue a dove fluttered down and perched on Fabian's head, plainly following the example of the descent upon the Savior of the Holy Spirit in the form of a dove. Because of this sign, Fabian was unanimously selected as the bishop of Rome.⁵²

Tertullian (160–240 CE), who is the father of Latin Theology and the first person who used the word "Trinity," was converted in 192 CE. At the time, he was already proficient in law and the philosophical

⁵⁰

Eusebius, *History of the Church*, 209.

⁵¹ Eusebius, *History of the Church*, 210.

⁵² Eusebius, *History of the Church*, 268.

system of his day. He quickly became a presbyter in Carthage, an influential leader in the church and the foremost apologist of the Western church. His writing also reveals a personal acquaintance with the supernatural gifts of the Holy Spirit, including speaking in tongues. In *A Treatise on the Soul* Tertullian writes, “For seeing that we acknowledge the spiritual charismata, or gifts, we too have merited the attainment of the prophetic gift.” He goes on to tell of a woman in his congregation “whose lot it has been to be favored with sundry gifts of revelation.”⁵³

Saint Augustine of Hippo (354–430 CE) has been considered by some scholars to be a main proponent of cessationism. However, Augustine describes various miracle experiences in his book *City of God*, including this long passage:

I know of a virgin at Hippo who was quickly cured of demon-possession after anointing herself with oil in which were mixed tears of presbyter. . . . I also know of a bishop who prayed once for a young man whom he had never seen, and the young man was immediately dispossessed of a demon. There was an old man here in Hippo called Florentius, a poor, devout person, who made his living by tailoring. He lost his cloak and had no money to buy another; and so he went to the shrine of the Twenty Martyrs, whose memory is cherished in our part of the world, and prayed in a loud voice that he might get some clothing. His prayer was heard by some young men who happened to be there; they laughed at him and when he went away, they followed him, teasing him by pretending that he had asked the martyrs for fifty pennis, to buy some clothes. He was walking on without a word when he saw a fish, just cast up by the sea, panting on the shore. With the encouragement and support of the bystanders he picked it up and took it to a delicatessen store

53

Eddie L. Hyatt, *2000 Years of Charismatic Christianity* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2002), 17.

kept by a cook called Cattosus, a good Christian, to whom he sold the fish for three hundred pence, after telling him what had happened. He planned to buy some wool with the money, so that his wife could do the best to produce the material for a garment. But when Cattosus was cutting up the fish he found a gold ring in its stomach, and his feeling of sympathy and his fear of a bad conscience compelled him to hand the ring over to Florentius saying as he did so, 'Look at this! That is how the Twenty Martyrs have given your clothes!'" When the relics of the glorious martyr Stephen arrived at Aquae Tibilitanae, brought by Bishop Praejectus, there was an immense gathering of People who flocked to the place. Among them was a blind woman, who begged to be led to the bishop as he carried the relics. The bishop gave her some flowers which he was caring; she took them, put them to her eyes--and immediately her sight was restored... Eucharius is a presbyter from Spain, living at Calama. He had been suffering from the stone for a long time; but he was cured by the relics of the same martyr, which were brought to him by Bishop Possidius. Later, he was stricken with another disease; the illness grew worse; he was laid out for dead, and his thumbs were already tied together. But the presbyter's tunic was sent to the martyr's shrine; it was brought back and put on his body as he lae there; and by the aid of the martyr the presbyter revived. . . . Again, in the same city of ours, the son of banker, Irenaeus, fell ill and died. His lifeless body was laid out, and preparations for burial were in train amid wailing and lamentation, when one of the friends who were offering words of consolation put in the suggestion that the body should be anointed with St. Stephen's oil. This was done, and the boy revived. . . . Many miracles have occurred there which are not recorded in the published documents.⁵⁴

Augustine also thanked God for personally healing him in book 7 of his *Confessions*: "You saw me, and it pleased you to transform all that was misshapen in me. Under the secret touch of your healing I had my swelling pride subsided, and day by day the pain I suffered brought me health, like an ointment which stung but cleared the

54

Augustine, *City of God*, trans. Henry Bettenson (New York, NY: Penguin Book, 2003), 1040-43.

confusion and darkness from the eye of my mind.”⁵⁵ Augustine’s description of numerous miracles, including his own healing, certainly reveals the continued work of the Holy Spirit and his personal belief in such charismatic phenomenon.

Athanasius of Alexandria (c. 297–May 2, 373 CE) helped canonize the twenty-seven books of the New Testament. He addressed the position that Jesus is of same substance from Father. He is an important historical figure in establishing early Christian doctrine. He had been politically exiled five times in doctrinal battles. In his third asylum, he wrote two works, *The Life of Antony* and *The Letter to Marcellinus*. Athanasius writes of many mysterious experiences of St. Antony (January 12, 251–January 17, 356 CE) who encountered spiritual warfare against Satan.⁵⁶ Antony also had a prophecy fulfilled as Athanasius writes in the chapter 86 of *The Life of Antony*.⁵⁷ In *The Letter to Marcellinus*, Athanasius states, “We pray that the Holy Spirit will live and work in every Bible whenever we need it.”⁵⁸ Through this, it can be confirmed that Athanasius also

⁵⁵ Augustine, *Confessions*, trans. R. S. Pine-coffin (New York, NY: Penguin, 1984), 144.

⁵⁶

Athanasius, *The Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellinus* [original title], trans. [translator] ([city]: [publisher], 1995), 63–85.

⁵⁷ Athanasius, *Life of Antony*, 147.

⁵⁸

Athanasius, *Life of Antony and the Letter to Marcellinus*, 168.

acknowledged the work of the Holy Spirit, especially in regards to spiritual battles.

Sadly, John Calvin (July 10, 1509–May 27, 1564 CE), a reformer, insisted that the gifts of the Holy Spirit ceased after the writing of Scripture. Calvin was influenced by John Chrysostom (349–September 14, 407 CE). Chrysostom insisted that miracles are given when faith is weak, and when true faith takes root, miracles are stopped.⁵⁹ Calvin has had a tremendous impact on Christian theology. The Presbyterian and Reformed denominations, many of which follow the trends of cessationism, trace their roots to John Calvin.

Is the Holy Spirit Still Active?

In his journal, John Wesley (June 28, 1703–March 2, 1791 CE) wrote on January 25, 1735 about his encounter with a group of Moravians while on a ship.

At noon our third storm began. At four it was more violent than any before. Now indeed we could say, ‘the waves of the sea were mighty and raged horribly.’ . . . The Germans (often calling them Moravians) calmly sung on. I asked one of them afterwards, ‘Was you not afraid?’ He replied mildly, ‘No; our women and children are not afraid to die.’... This was the most glorious day which I have ever hitherto seen.”⁶⁰

⁵⁹ [redacted], [redacted] [redacted] [redacted], Loc. 75–79/489.

⁶⁰

John Wesley, *The Works of John Wesley: Journals and Diaries 1 (1738–1743)* edited by Reginald Ward and Richard P. Heitzenrater (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1988), Vol 18: 142–3.

On May 24, 1738, he wrote, "In the evening I went very unwillingly to a society in Aldersgate Street, where one was reading [Martin] Luther's preface to the Epistle to the Romans. About a quarter before nine, while he was describing the change which God works in the heart through faith in Christ, I felt my heart strangely warmed. I felt I did trust in Christ, Christ alone, for salvation; and an assurance was given me that He had taken away my sins, even mine, and saved me from the law of sin and death."⁶¹

Many church historians consider this the day of John Wesley's conversion.

On Thursday April 26, 1739, Wesley described the phenomenon that some people fell on the ground by the Holy Spirit while he was preaching in New Gate prison. He writes:

While I was preaching at Newgate on these words, 'He that believeth hath everlasting life,' I was sensibly led, without any previous design, to declare strongly and explicitly that God willeth all men to be thus saved and to pray that if this were not the truth of God, he would not suffer the blind to go out of the way; but if it were, he would bear witness to his Word. Immediately one and another and another sunk to the earth: they dropped on every side as thunderstruck. One of them cried aloud.⁶²

⁶¹

Joe Iovino, "Holy Spirit moments: Learning from Wesley at Aldersgate," <https://www.umc.org/en/content/holy-spirit-moments-learning-from-wesley-at-aldersgate>.

⁶² John Wesley, *The Works of John Wesley: Journals and Diaries 2 (1738-1743)* edited by Reginald Ward and Richard P. Heitzenrater (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1988), Vol. 19: 51-2.

Another journal entry states, “The power of God came so mightily among us, that one, and another, and another, fell as thunderstruck.”⁶³ At the end of his long life, Wesley wrote his last letter to William Wilberforce (1759–1843 CE), who led the anti-slavery movement; this is considered one of the most precious of his letters.⁶⁴ Therefore, the movement of the Holy Spirit under John Wesley’s ministry is highly regarded because of the transition to the social movement had been achieved. John Wesley said that the essence of faith is inward, but the evidence of faith is outward.⁶⁵ Wesley not only saw the continuation of the works of the Holy Spirit, he also taught that these works should extend to transform society.

In contrast to John Wesley, the form of the preaching of Jonathan Edwards (October 5, 1703–March 22, 1758 CE) was Calvinist. However, the similarity with Wesley is that he appealed strongly to the emotions of the audience. He was admired as an incredibly good preacher at the time. He welcomed George Whitefield (December 16, 1714–September 30, 1770 CE), England’s greatest preacher. Wherever Whitefield preached in New England, men openly cried, and women were stunned. Many evangelists held numerous revival meetings, beginning with George Whitefield. From 1740 to

⁶³ Daniel R. Jennings, *The Supernatural Occurrences of John Wesley* (CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform, 2012), 62.

⁶⁴

□□□, □□□□□□ (□□: □□□□□□□□, 1996), 219, 221.

⁶⁵

□□□, □ □□□□ □□□ (□□: □□□□□□, 2008), 203.

1742 CE, there were a tremendous revival awakening of worship, and it was thought to be the dawn of the Millennium Kingdom. However, the movement of the Great Awakening soon cooled down and did not continue.

Jonathan Edwards thought that the essence of true faith was that the mind was thoroughly changed by the Holy Spirit to a mind that was meek, loving, and living as a Christ.⁶⁶ He suggested five positive evidences in people of the work of the Spirit of the God of the Bible. First, their esteem of Jesus is raised by confirming and establishing their minds in the truth of what the gospel declares of his being the Son of God and the Savior of men. Second, their work opposes Satan's kingdom, which encourages and establishes sin, and cherishes worldly lusts. Third, they have a greater regard for the Holy Scriptures and are more established in their truth and divinity. Fourth, they reveal God's truth, since through the Holy Spirit, they "know the spirit of truth and the spirit of error" (1 John 4:6). Fifth, they operate in a spirit of love towards God and others.⁶⁷ Jonathan Edwards came to discern the biblical experience of the Holy Spirit after a powerful experience of the Holy Spirit. He experienced and witnessed the work of the Holy Spirit.

⁶⁶

Williston Walker, *Great Men of the Christian Church* 卷四 四章 四四四, trans. 四四四 (四四: 四四四四 四四四四, 1994), 250-3.

⁶⁷

Jonathan Edwards, *Distinguishing Marks of a Work of the Spirit of God*, Loc 394 of 1071 - Loc 507 of 1071, Kindle Edition.

William Seymour (May 2, 1870–September 28, 1922 CE) is known as the founder of modern Pentecostalism. At Azusa Street in Los Angeles, California, he led a revival movement in the early 1900s that included speaking in tongues and other charismatic signs of the Holy Spirit. Frank Bartleman (December 14, 1871–August 23, 1936 CE), a reporter for The New York Times, pretended to be lame at one of Seymour’s meetings in order to expose it as a false movement. William Seymour said, “Let it be as he belied” and Bartleman became lame, unable to move his legs. When he repented of his falsehood, he was able to walk again. Because of this experience, Bartleman became a strong proponent of the Azusa Street revival and they became more known to the world.⁶⁸

The Activity of the Holy Spirit in Korean Church History

Christianity was not introduced into Korea until the later 1800s. Many of the early missionaries to Korea were cessationists. However, some of them turned away from this theology toward continuationism after they witnessed the work of the Holy Spirit in Korea. The active work of the Holy Spirit continues in South Korea to the present.

Gil Sun-joo (Korean: 김선주; March 25, 1869–November 26, 1935 CE), was an evangelist and Bible teacher as well as one of the signatories of the Korean Declaration of Independence.⁶⁹ He is called

⁶⁸ 김선주, *한국교회 역사*, 104-5.

⁶⁹

William N. Blair and Bruce F. Hunt, *The Korean Pentecost and the Sufferings Which Followed* (Carlisle, PA: The Banner of Truth Trust, 2020), 100.

the father of Korean Christianity; he was one of the first Koreans ordained as a Presbyterian minister. He was one of the first graduates of the Presbyterian Seminary in Pyongyang in 1907. Gil Sun-joo is known as the first person to start the daily early morning prayer service in Korea. According to the history of the early Korean Church, he offered jobs to the unemployed and prayed every day at 5 a.m. and 10 p.m. He received the revelation of the Holy Spirit when he saw that light existed before the universe was created, and that this light was the risen Christ of the Trinity.⁷⁰

Most of the early missionaries to Korea were Presbyterian. The Presbyterian Church of USA's official position was cessationist. This position is most rigorously argued for by B.B. Warfield in his influential book, *Counterfeit Miracles*, written in 1918. One of these cessationist missionaries to Korea was Charles F. Bernheisel. However, in 1911, Bernheisel changed his position after witnessing many demonized people delivered through prayer. Bernheisel ministered in and became a strong proponent in Korea for the continual works of the gifts of the Holy Spirit.⁷¹

Kim Ik-du (Korean: 김익두, November 3, 1874–October 14, 1950 CE) was a very well-known gangster in Pyongyang. After he believed in Jesus Christ, he changed his life. The Korean church experienced a

⁷⁰ 김익두, *기독교의 기원* (서울: 기독교, 2007), 117-24.

⁷¹

김익두, *기독교의 기원* (서울: 기독교, 2016), 480.

great awakening service in 1907 and there were numerous miracles flowing from the ministry of Pastor Ik-du Kim. Because of the numerous miracles attributed to his ministry, Pastor Ik-du Kim was called the High Shaman.⁷² Pastor Taek-Kwon Lim investigated the miraculous works of Kim. The book title reveals his conclusion: *A Testament of Miracles in the Joseon Jesus Church* (Korean: 조선예수교회 기적의 증서) in 1921.⁷³

Choo Ki-chol (Korean: 조기철; November 25, 1897–April 21, 1944 CE) was a famous martyr in the early Korean church history. He was converted to Christianity when he was 24 years old at a Kim Ik-du faith meeting in 1920. Pastor Kim Ik-du preached, “Receive the Holy spirit, repent and you will be new person.” Choo suddenly fell down and cried out. “Oh, Lord, I am a sinner. Forgive my sin and help me to live and save me.”⁷⁴ Dr. Arch Campbell, in *The Christ of the Korean Heart*, says that it was under the preaching of Kim Ik-du that Choo came to experience what it was to be baptized in the Holy Spirit.⁷⁵ Choo enrolled in Pyongyang Theological Seminary in March 1922 at the age of 26.⁷⁶ He became a senior pastor of the Sangchunghyun

⁷²

조기철, *조선예수교회 기적의 증서*, 183.

⁷³ 조기철, *조선예수교회 기적의 증서* (서울: 크리스천, 2020), 106–7.

⁷⁴ 조기철, *기적* (서울: 크리스천, 2007), 79–82.

⁷⁵

Blair and Hunt, *The Korean Pentecost*, 118–9.

⁷⁶ 조기철, *기적*, 84.

Presbyterian Church in Pyongyang. He refused to worship at an ancestral shrine, was imprisoned in Japan, and died on April 28, 1944 at the age of 48.⁷⁷ Choo's receiving of the Holy Spirit moved him to becoming a person who accelerated the independence of Korea and triggered a movement of the Holy Spirit in Korea.

David Yonggi Cho (February 14, 1936–September 14, 2021 CE) is the senior pastor at the Yoido Full Gospel Church, the world's largest congregation with a claimed membership of 830,000. He is now best known worldwide for the Holy Spirit movement. He was 17 years old when he was told he would die within three months due to lung disease. However, he received Christ through the evangelism of a girl in the same town and he began reading the Bible every day. He was completely healed in six months.⁷⁸ After experiencing the healing of the Holy Spirit, he became a minister of the Holy Spirit. He travels the world and preaches healing. He created the theory of the five-fold gospel and the three-fold blessing from 3 John 1:2. The fivefold gospel is: first, the gospel of salvation; second, the gospel of fullness of the Holy Spirit; third, the gospel of the divine healing; fourth, the gospel of blessing; and fifth, the gospel of the second coming of Christ. The three-fold blessing is as follows: first, the spiritual blessing; second,

⁷⁷ 박종철, *한국교회사*, 191.

⁷⁸

박종철, *한국교회사* (서울: 한국교회, 2005), 107-9.

the daily blessing; third, the blessing of health.⁷⁹ Cho has shown the continuation of the works of the Holy Spirit in Korea.

Even after the death of Pastor Yonggi Cho, the work of the Holy Spirit continues to appear in various places. Elder Ki-Chul Son (November 14, 1957–present) holds a charismatic meeting every Monday through Heavenly Ministry in Good-Shepherd church. He is testifying that many people are being healed through his ministry. As an elder of Onnuri Church, he is doing inner healing work and recovery of the sick, and numerous evidences of healing are being reported.

The work of the Holy Spirit is not in the time of kronos and cannot be limited to any specific period. If this has been proven through the history of the church, it has been proven beyond all dimensions. The work of the Holy Spirit transcends languages and cultures. Since the Holy Spirit himself belongs to eternity, he does not appear and disappear at any moment in human time. From before human time to the present, and even if human time disappears, the work of the Holy Spirit and his activities will not disappear. He abides in the time of kairos, entered human time, and has worked and will work without ceasing. For him, past, present, and future do not exist, only eternity.

79

□□□, 3□□□ □□□ □□□□ 4□□□ □□ (□□: □□□□□□□, 2005), 79.

Conclusion

Through historical studies, we can confirm that the normative work of the Holy Spirit in healing, deliverance, signs, wonders, and miracles has continued from the biblical era to the post-apostolic era, through the Middle Ages into the Modern era, and continues in the present and will do so into the future. Many who played a pivotal role in the history of Christian church acknowledged and experienced the work of the Holy Spirit. Some Christian figures turned from cessationism to continuationism after they experienced the work of the Holy Spirit. For instance, Augustine, who believed through much of his life that the gifts of the Holy Spirit had ceased, later turned to continuationism as he witnessed the gifts of the Holy Spirit in operation during his life and ministry.⁸⁰ Korea's early missionary, Bernheisel (Korean name: 베른하이스), also turned his position from cessationism to the continuationism for very similar reasons.

In Korea, conservative ministers in the Presbyterian denomination were influenced by Calvin who denied the continued work of the Holy Spirit. Their influence has resulted in a strong approval of cessationism, especially in the Presbyterian Churches in Korea. However, in Korea, more are claiming the errors of cessationism among Presbyterian conservative theologians. This will be detailed in the Theological Foundations chapter.

⁸⁰

이동진, *성령의 은사* (서울: 크리스천리더스, 2019), Loc 85-87/489. Google Play Books.

Religiosity is the face of death and denying miracles is at the root of its foundation. If religion excludes miracles based on theological suppositions, then there is no way to properly account for miracles when they occur. Therefore, religion finds ways either to excuse them through some supposed science or deny that they even occurred. If there are no miracles allowed in religion, then there is no way to explain when a miracle occurs, therefore the miracle is denied. This is the circular argument of cessationism. However, as noted, many historical figures of Christian doctrine not only acknowledged the work of the Holy Spirit but also confirmed they experienced His miraculous works. The claim that the miraculous work of the Holy Spirit has ended is a big error that shakes the very foundation of Christian doctrine.

In conclusion, even cursory historical observations show that the work of the Holy Spirit has continued. The Bible speaks of the salvation of our soul (1 Peter 1:9). This salvation is something that our soul experiences beyond that which can be discerned by the five senses. Philosopher William James proposed that we have a sense of reality other than that given by the five senses. There is in the human consciousness a sense of reality, a feeling of objective presence, a perception of something more deep and more overarching than can be perceived by the five senses through which existent realities are supposed to be revealed.⁸¹ James concludes we have a special sense

through which we can know true reality. I believe this sense is the Spirit of Jesus. In the Bible, the Holy Spirit is called the Spirit of Truth (John 14:17; 1 John 4:6). Because Jesus is the truth, the Holy Spirit is the Spirit of Jesus. When our soul meets the Spirit of Jesus, we have the knowledge of Jesus (Phil. 3:8). Historically, humans have experienced the Holy Spirit through all times; they have experienced the gift of the Holy Spirit in the lives of those who believe in and receive Jesus Christ. Therefore, the theory that the work of the Holy Spirit ended in the Bible era has many errors theologically, historically, and psychologically. This, along with other critical theological concepts, will be detailed in the next chapter.

William James, *The Varieties of Religious Experience* (New York, NY: The Mentor Book, 1958), 58-61.

CHAPTER FOUR

THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS

Generally, John Calvin is called the father of cessationism. Calvin borrowed the idea from the early church father John Chrysostom's cessationism. Chrysostom said that “miracles do not happen now, that they did happen then. . . . in those time they were profitable, and now they are not.”⁸² Every variety of miracle Chrysostom declares to have ceased.⁸³ He complained about those questioning why speaking in tongues did not happen when people were baptized. He criticized seeking miracles.⁸⁴ However, his commentary on Romans does not appear to have completely denied the gifts or miracles of the Holy Spirit. He exegetes Romans 12:6 as follows. Even if the prophecy is a gift of the Holy Spirit, it is not given meaninglessly, but by evaluating the recipient. Chrysostom, using 1 Corinthians 12:31 as an example, did not deny the greater gift of prophecy and said that those who were gifted should not have pride.

⁸²

B.B. Warfield, *Counterfeit Miracles* (The Fig Classic Series, 2012), 46 of 328, Kindle edition.

⁸³ Warfield, *Counterfeit Miracles*, 48 of 328.

⁸⁴ 曹文, *圣经与神学* (曹: 曹文, 2019), 75-77/489, google play books.

Therefore, he seems to have been wary of pursuing gifts, pursuing miracles, or bragging about speaking in tongues. Regarding the fruit of the Holy Spirit, he did not say anything mysterious, but insisted that the face of the person who received the kingdom of God as a reward should not have a sad face, but a face with joy and happiness.⁸⁵ Chrysostom often commented that he was not going to flee hardship, but to overcome it with a faith.⁸⁶ From these claims, it seems true he was wary of miracles or the excessive obsession with the gifts of the Holy Spirit, but he does not seem to deny them. Instead, he seems to have pursued a more rational religious life.

Many who claim that the gift of the Holy Spirit has ceased often speak in conflict with their preaching and writing. As shown in the Historical Foundations chapter, it is difficult to limit the miraculous work of the Holy Spirit to a specific time period. Also, if we limit the work of the Holy Spirit, logic leads to the conclusion that there is no religious experience in the present. On the other hand, in some cases, claims of experiences with the Holy Spirit are actually Satanic. The works of the Holy Spirit can also be disregarded as pranks based on the corruption of those who work in the gifts of the Holy Spirit. However, if we follow the logic that, based on some of their immoral

⁸⁵

John Chrysostom, *Homilies of St. John Chrysostom, Archbishop of Constantinople on the Epistle of St. Paul the Apostle to the Romans*, trans. 李俊 (李俊: 李俊, 2010), 430-2.

⁸⁶

John Chrysostom, *Homilies*, 89.

actions, the preachers of the Holy Spirit deny the source of the Holy Spirit, then Calvin's immoral behaviors would fall into the same contradiction and become a reason to deny Calvin's doctrine of cessationism. Obviously, it is a foolish argument to affirm or deny God's work based on the behavior of some individuals.

Theology of the Holy Spirit in the Experience of John Wesley

John Wesley began to practice extemporaneous prayer by learning from the Moravians. Wesley preached outdoor sermons—an activity banned by the Anglican Church—and he also preached without a manuscript. So, John Wesley was a British Anglican priest, acted in ways that were opposed to the canonical form of worship. The style of worship and preaching style that Wesley pursued became the driving force for him to pursue a form of worship that was more dependent on the Holy Spirit. He relied on the guidance of the Holy Spirit instead of the sermon manuscript, and the free guidance of the Holy Spirit instead of the ritual form of the denomination. Wesley theologically denied predestination and was open to the work of the Holy Spirit. One example occurred while he was preaching in New Gate Prison where people fell back and accepted Jesus.

Wesley influenced the origins of the First Awakening. His journal contains mystical experiences and the work of the Holy Spirit in many places. He wrote various records of demons departing,

healings, prophecies and falling in the Spirit. As just one example, Wesley recorded the healing in the name of Jesus of a woman suffering from a painful demonization.

Thur. 25. Oct. 1739. I was sent for to one in Bristol who was taken ill the evening before. (This fact, too, I will simply relate, so far as I was an ear - or eye witness of it.) She lay on the ground, furiously gnashing her teeth, and after a while roared aloud. It was not easy for three or four persons to hold her, especially when the name of Jesus was named. We prayed; the violence of her symptoms ceased, though without a complete deliverance.

In the evening, being sent for to her again, I was unwilling, indeed afraid, to go, thinking it would not avail unless some who were strong in faith were to wrestle with God for her. I opened my Testament on those words, 'I was afraid, and went and hid thy talent in the earth.' I stood reprov'd and went immediately. She began screaming before I came into the room; then broke out into a horrid laughter, mixed with blasphemy, grievous to hear. One who from many circumstances apprehended a preternatural agent to be concerned in this, asking, 'How didst thou dare to enter into a Christian?' was answered, 'She is not a Christian. She is mine.' 'Dost thou do not tremble at the name of Jesus?' No words followed, but she shrunk back and trembled exceedingly. 'Art thou not increasing thy own damnation?' It was faintly answered, 'Ay, ay,' which was followed by fresh cursing and blaspheming.

My brother coming in, she cried out, 'Preacher! Field preacher! I don't love field preaching.' This was repeated two hours together, with spitting and all the expressions of strong aversion. We left her at twelve but called again about noon on Friday 26. And now pangs ceased in a moment. She was filled with peace and knew that the son of wickedness was departed from her.⁸⁷

These demons leaving and healing the disease at Wesley's pastoral site were important spiritual experiences. Wesley's religious

87

John Wesley, *The Works of John Wesley: Journals and Diaries 2 (1738-1743)* edited by Reginald Ward and Richard P. Heitzenrater (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1988), Vol 19: 110-1.

experience would not have been endorsed by the Church of England at the time. However, in his journal, there are countless events of healing through prayer.

In his journal, numerous healing events were recorded. An example of one (which appears to actually be a raising from the dead) follows:

December Mon. 20, 1742. . . . When I came home, they told me the physician said he did not expect Mr. Meyrick would live till the morning. I went to him, but his pulse was gone. He had been speechless and senseless for some time. A few of us immediately joined in prayer. (I relate the naked fact.) Before we had done his sense and his speech returned. Now he that will account for this by natural causes has returned. Now he that will account for this by natural causes has my free leave. But I choose to say, this is the power of God.⁸⁸

Elsewhere in his journal, a horse was healed, cancer was healed, and numerous patients including himself were mentioned as being healed—so much that it is difficult to list all the events of healing through prayer.⁸⁹ He also recorded how prayer changed the weather (July 23, 1750).⁹⁰ Wesley mentioned he was delivered from danger by an angel.⁹¹ Certainly, Wesley apparently established a continuationist theology of the Holy Spirit based on experience.

⁸⁸ Wesley, *Works*, Vol 19: 306.

⁸⁹ Daniel R. Jennings, *The Supernatural Occurrences of John Wesley* (San Bernardino, CA: Sean Multimedia, 2012), 54.

⁹⁰ Jennings, *Supernatural Occurrences*, 186.

⁹¹ Jennings, *Supernatural Occurrences*, 173.

Wesley even based his decision not to marry through a spiritual experience. He dreamed of getting married to Grace Murrey and looked for an answer from God, but he had a dream that she died. Later she married John Bennet and, in fact, died shortly thereafter.⁹² Vinson Synan said that Methodists could know from a crisis experience of conversion that they were saved. From the beginning, Methodist theology placed great emphasis on this conscious religious experience.⁹³ Therefore, Wesley's Methodist movement theologically influenced the Pentecostal Holy Spirit movement and had a methodological influence on the American revival movement.⁹⁴

The Holiness Movement also emerged after the American Civil War as a result of emphasizing Wesley's holiness. This movement attempted to shift away from formalistic worship into an emotional and experiential religion of mind.⁹⁵ In doctrinal terms, Wesley was the first theologian who emphasized the second blessing to overcome the residue of sin and live a sanctified life after rebirth. This became the first step in the modern Pentecostal Spirit movement to lay the theological foundation for the worldwide movement of the Holy Spirit. Phoebe Palmer, the protagonist of the American Holiness Movement,

⁹²

Wesley, *The Works of John Wesley* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 63.

⁹³ Vinson Synan, *The Holiness Pentecostal Tradition* (New York: Oxford University Press, trans. 2008), 14.

⁹⁴ Vinson Synan, *The Holiness Pentecostal Tradition* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 19.

⁹⁵ Vinson Synan, *The Holiness Pentecostal Tradition* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 20.

transformed Wesley's holiness. Later, Asa Mahan was the first to describe this holiness as “baptism of the Holy Spirit.”⁹⁶

Eventually the Methodist Church in the United States became independent from the Methodist movement in England. There were more than 15,000 Methodists in the United States by November 1782. However, only a few priests from the Church of England were present in America. Wesley responded by publishing a 1784 revision of the book *The Sunday Service of the Methodists in North America, With Other Occasional Service*. This became a problem in England since it gave credibility to a separate Methodist movement in America.⁹⁷ Despite Wesley's opposition, Francis Asbury, who had been ordained by Wesley, was elected in 1783 as a bishop of the Methodist Church in the United States. Asbury's organization of the Methodist Church and the appointment of a local untrained pastors rapidly expanded the Methodist Church in the United States. The wide use of local pastors who did have formal theological education led to a focus on revival by experience rather than deep insight and theological inquiry into the Bible. The early Methodist movement thus relied on the movement of the Holy Spirit and the Holiness Movement in general depended less upon theological training.

⁹⁶

Barrie Tabraham, *The Making of Methodism* (London: 2, 163.

⁹⁷

Barrie Tabraham, *The Making of Methodism* (London: 1998), 165-171.

The First Great Awakening

The First Great Awakening began in the 1730s. One of the major drivers of this movement was George Whitefield. He was an Anglican priest and also a member of the Oxford Methodists. He came to the New World and served in Georgia for a time as successor to John Wesley. He later became one of the outstanding leaders of the Great Awakening—a revival movement that began in the middle colonies and thrived in New England under the preaching of Jonathan Edwards.⁹⁸ Vinson Synan calls John Wesley the spiritual and intellectual father of the Holiness–Pentecostal movement.⁹⁹

This theology of experience gave John Wesley considerable significance. It can be said that this is like the experience of the Apostle Paul meeting Jesus at Straight Street. “As he neared Damascus on his journey, suddenly a light from heaven flashed around him. He fell to the ground and heard a voice say to him, “Saul, Saul, why do you persecute me?” Who are you, Lord? Saul asked. “I am Jesus, whom you are persecuting,” he replied” (Acts 9:3–5). Therefore, the work of the Holy Spirit places importance on experience. It is like the book of Acts, which recorded the work of the Holy Spirit. So, this experience of John Wesley adds to the experience of the threefold Theological Structure of the Anglican Church, following the Bible,

⁹⁸

John G. McElhenney, et al., *United Methodism in America: A Compact History* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1992), 21.

⁹⁹ Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 13.

reason, and tradition. That is why the Pentecostal denomination calls him the father of Pentecost and records him as a direct influencer of the First Great Awakening Movement in America.

Wesley's Experience of the Holy Spirit and the Correlation with Holiness

John Wesley was influenced by books from the Catholic and Anglican mystical traditions. The books that influenced him are: *Rule and Exercises of Holy Living and Dying* by Jeremy Tayler, *Imitation of Christ* by Thomas A Kempis, and especially *Treatise on Christian Perfection and Serious Call to a Devout and Holy Life* by William Law. Throughout Law's book John Wesley sees that the supreme holiness and the supreme holy heart are the duty of the priest, as well as the duty and happiness of all Christians.¹⁰⁰ Wesley was interested in holiness, which led him to help establish the Holy Club at Oxford, leading to a lifelong pursuit of the completion of salvation, which he called complete sanctification or the doctrine of perfection.

To supervise the American branch of Methodism, Wesley appointed the indefatigable Francis Asbury as preacher and traveler. As passionately committed to the doctrine of holiness as Wesley himself, Asbury claimed to have been "saved" at the age of fifteen and "sanctified" the following year. In 1782 he wrote in his Journal that

¹⁰⁰

Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 15.

the only preaching that did good was the kind which “presses the use of the means and urges holiness of heart.” Once while ill, he wrote, “I have found by secret search that I have not preached sanctification as I should have done. If I am restored, this shall be my theme more pointedly than ever.”¹⁰¹ As such, the theology of the Methodist took holiness as important. However, this holiness movement combined with the experience of the Holy Spirit movement and produced a great synergizing effect.

Devereaux Jarratt wrote, describing the Virginia services of 1775, that holiness religion was much in evidence. Many were “panting and groaning for pardon” while others were “entreating God, with strong cries and tears to save them from the remains of inbred sin, to sanctify them throughout. . . .” Many of them testified to having been sanctified, “instantaneously, and by simple faith.” At times, the emotions of the sanctified Methodists would exceed the limits of control. “Some would be seized with a trembling, and in a few moments drop on the floor as if they were dead; while others were embracing each other with streaming eyes, and all were lost in wonder, love and praise,” wrote one observer.¹⁰² It can be confirmed by historical records that the expansion of Methodism was extended to the experience of the Holy Spirit and the Holiness Movement.

¹⁰¹ Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 22.

¹⁰² Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 23.

As mentioned above, those influenced by Wesley came to emphasize holiness and the movement of the Holy Spirit. In 1782 Asbury wrote that the only preaching that did good was the kind which “presses the use of the means and urges holiness of heart. . . . I have found by secret search that I have not preached sanctification as I should have done. If I am restored, this shall be my theme more pointedly than ever”.¹⁰³

In the Methodist General Conferences of 1842 and 1832 urgent calls were given to the faithful to emphasize holiness. “If Methodists give up the doctrine of entire sanctification, or suffer it to become a dead letter, we are a fallen people, warned the bishops. . .” By 1840 perfectionism was becoming one of the central themes of American social, intellectual, and religious life. And from the ground of perfectionist teaching sprang the many reform movements intended to perfect American social life—women’s rights, the abolition of slavery, anti-masonry, and the various temperance campaigns.¹⁰⁴

The Theology of the Holy Spirit in the Wesleyan Quadrilateral

The so-called Wesleyan Quadrilateral includes Scripture, Tradition, Reason, and Experience. The term “Wesleyan Quadrilateral” does not appear in the writings of John Wesley. It is a

¹⁰³ Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 22.

¹⁰⁴ Synan, *Holiness Pentecostal Tradition*, 32.

term that Albert C. Outler chose to describe the theological method of John Wesley.¹⁰⁵

John Wesley took the Anglican theology as it was and added an emphasis on experience, meaning the Holy Spirit's work in attesting to the truth by inner working in a person's life to produce what the other dimensions of the quadrilateral affirmed. It is noteworthy that while Anglican theology emphasized tradition, John Wesley emphasized the Bible. In his standard sermon, each sermon quotes countless Bible verses. He is regarded as the man of one book. Richard Hooker, an Anglican theologian, added the Bible to tradition, following the claim of the reformer at the time, and furthermore, added reason with the influence of rationalism under the ideology of the time and made the foundation of the Anglican theological system. To this, John Wesley added experience, which, with the other three elements, Outler referred to as the Wesley Quadrilateral. The experience here can be seen as referring to the work of the Holy Spirit and the experience of holiness.

Wesley did not formulate the succinct statement now commonly referred to as the Wesley Quadrilateral. Building on the Anglican theological tradition, Wesley added a fourth emphasis, experience.

105

Albert C. Outler, "The Wesleyan Quadrilateral in John Wesley," *Wesleyan Theological Journal* 20.1 (1985). 7-18.

The resulting four components or "sides" of the quadrilateral are (1) Scripture, (2) tradition, (3) reason, and (4) experience.¹⁰⁶

The restoration of religious experience to the Christian faith is perhaps John Wesley's most significant theological contribution.¹⁰⁷ Experience was a jewel that Wesley placed back into the crown of Christianity. Through a series of encounters with a group called the Moravians, John Wesley became aware that he lacked the experience of Christian assurance.¹⁰⁸ One of his great strengths as a theologian was that he never left the ministry field. He continued to expand his theological affairs through pastoral experience. John Wesley believed that the Holy Spirit was the primary agent involved in Christian experience.

Wesley's pneumatology was distinctly soteriological. The Spirit is the divine initiator who awakens, assures, purifies, and guides the believer in the *ordo salutis* ("order of salvation"). In *A Letter to a Roman Catholic*, Wesley writes:

I believe the infinite and eternal Spirit of God, equal with the Father and the Son, to be not only perfectly holy in himself but the immediate cause of all holiness in us; enlightening our

¹⁰⁶

Glossary: Wesleyan Quadrilateral, the The United Methodist Church (umc.org), Source: A Dictionary for United Methodists, Alan K. Waltz, Copyright 1991, Abingdon Press. Used by Permission., https://www.umc.org/en/content/glossary-wesleyan-quadrilateral-the?gclid=Cj0KCQjwytoEBhD5ARIsANnRjVhtRE3u14Ufny1rp4fEFhhooeY0HFihGYVDJoS4gEVcjgbKxz6N1cMaAqGbEALw_wcB

¹⁰⁷

Winfield H. Bevins, *A Pentecostal Appropriation of the Wesleyan Quadrilateral* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Journal of Pentecostal Theology, 2006), 239.

¹⁰⁸ Bevins, *Wesleyan Quadrilateral*, 240.

understandings, rectifying our wills and affections, renewing our natures, uniting our persons to Christ, assuring us of the adoption of sons, leading us in our actions; purifying and sanctifying our souls and bodies, to a full and eternal enjoyment of God.¹⁰⁹

Wesley seems to have thought of connecting the experience of the Holy Spirit and sanctification.

The Understanding of Holy Spirit in C. Peter Wagner's Theology

It seems to be true that the work of the Holy Spirit, which began with John Wesley, indirectly influenced the First Great Awakening Movement in America. Then there was the 2nd and 3rd Great Awakening Movements. The early Methodist movement gave rise to the Pentecostal movement. In particular, Peter Wagner, who helped form and introduce the New Apostolic Movement, was influenced by a famous Methodist missionary to India, E. Stanley Jones and expanded his theological outlook on the work of the Holy Spirit. Following is a description of how Wagner's theological views changed.

In his book *How to Have a Healing Ministry without Making Your Church Sick*, Wagner described himself as a dispensationalist, anti-Pentecostal, with a limited view of power of Holy Spirit, and having a humanistic worldview. He accepted the teaching of leaders such as John Stott, J. I. Packer, and John MacArthur, Jr.¹¹⁰ In his

¹⁰⁹

Bevins, *Wesleyan Quadrilateral*, 241.

¹¹⁰

autobiographical confession, he self-describes as completely fundamentalist. He used the Scofield Bible in both English and Spanish where the editor's footnote to 1 Corinthians 13:8 affirmed that the "sign" gifts such as tongues, healings, and miracles went out of use after the age of the apostles.¹¹¹

According to Peter Wagner's writing:

I like the way Pastor George Mallon, John Opmeer, Jeff Kirby and Paul Stevens capsulize their pilgrimage. None consider himself as a charismatic pastor of a charismatic church. They admit that "Our backgrounds, both Dispensational and Reformed, taught us to believe that the overt gifts of the Holy Spirit ceased with the apostles. To pass our theological exams we all adapted the party line." Once they left seminary, however, and became involved in ministry for varying periods of time, they have now come to three conclusions: (1) the cessation of particular gifts was not taught in Scripture; (2) the Church was desperately weak and anemic because of the lack of these gifts; and (3) what we were seeing in our own experience suggested that these gifts were available for the Church today.¹¹²

Wagner saw that religious experience changed the form of their beliefs. He pointed out "an important factor in changing the minds of these evangelical pastors was their personal experience of God's supernatural power in their ministries."¹¹³

Peter Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry without Making Your Church Sick* (Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1982) 39-42.

¹¹¹

Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 41.

¹¹²

Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 35.

¹¹³ Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 35.

Wagner was no longer a dispensationalist nor was he anti-Pentecostal. What brought about the change was his experience of watching a cyst that needed surgical attention healed through prayer by E. Staley Jones. The patient, Peter Wagner himself, said this healing gift changed his perspective.¹¹⁴ It was the first step of a paradigm shift towards accepting the work of the Holy Spirit as described by anthropologist Charles H. Kraft.¹¹⁵

The second stage of Wagner's paradigm shift involved witnessing the growth of the Pentecostal churches in Latin America. In 1950, twenty percent of Latin American evangelicals were Pentecostals. In twenty years, that figure reached seventy percent and was still growing.¹¹⁶ The works of the Holy Spirit had to be the reason for this amazing growth.

The third stage of his paradigm shift was a meeting with the Church of God (Cleveland, TN). Peter Wagner admits he had despised Pentecostals. But after spending time at The Church of God, his attitude towards Pentecostals changed. Every time he returned from a visit, he felt spiritually refreshed and started to wish he was Pentecostal. It was during that time he suspected strongly that God had something different in store for his future.¹¹⁷

¹¹⁴ Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 44-5.

¹¹⁵

Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 43.

¹¹⁶ Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 42-5.

¹¹⁷

Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 46-7.

The final stage of his paradigm shift came from witnessing John Wimber and his healing prayer.¹¹⁸ Wagner and Wimber became friends in the mid-1970s. By 1980, Wimber developed a reputation for healing the sick through prayer at his new church. Wagner began to attend meetings and then heard Wimber's lecture, "Signs, Wonders and Church Growth." Inspired by the lecture, he pitched the idea of teaching signs and wonders at Fuller Theological Seminary. After it was accepted as a class in the School of World Missions program at Fuller, while teaching, Wimber asked if anyone needed prayer for physical healing. Wagner raised his hand, talking about his issues with high blood pressure that required him taking three pills daily. When Wimber prayed for him, he felt a sense of peace, and also that he might fall over. Days after, Wagner went to see his doctor, and his blood pressure was so low that he was removed from medication.

Wagner wrote, "This finished the process of my paradigm shift. I began as a skeptic, then became a spectator and finally decided to be a participant. I started laying hands on the sick, learning how to minister to them in the name of Jesus."¹¹⁹ The experience of the Holy Spirit changed Wagner's theology.

¹¹⁸ Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 47.

¹¹⁹ Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 56-7.

The Healing Theology of John Wimber

John Wimber was originally a student of Peter Wagner, but Wagner was, in the end, deeply affected by John Wimber. According to Wimber in his book *Power Healing*, Wagner affirmed his charismatic belief and theology of the Pentecostal movement. Richard J. Foster introduced John Wimber in the book *Power Healing* and expressed the book's biblical integrity. This book affirms a team approach to ministry. Foster finished his introduction as follows:

In May of 1978 I was walking alone along a beautiful stretch of coastline in the Pacific Northwest, USA, when I had an unusual experience of the presence of God—an experience that lasted for perhaps an hour and half. I was never the same again. One of the several instructions from that encounter was to pray for the rising of new prophetic leaders who could gather the people of God into fresh, bold expressions of faithfulness and obedience. Since that day I (no doubt along with multiplied others) have been seeking God to raise up an incendiary company of Spirit-led, Spirit-ordained, Spirit-trained leaders.¹²⁰

Richard Foster's support became a great source for the theological foundation of Wimber's work in the Holy Spirit.

John Wimber made his position on healing prayer clear. If one hundred people receive prayer and only one is healed, it is better than if none receive prayer and no one is healed.¹²¹ Wimber had suffered chest pain every four or five months.¹²² When Bob Craine prayed over

¹²⁰

John Wimber and Kevin Springer, *Power Healing* (New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 1991), xii-xiii.

¹²¹

Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, xviii.

¹²² Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, xv.

him for healing and prophesied that “as I was with Abraham, so I am with you,” he sensed God’s healing power already working on him. Later in life he was hospitalized, but he prayed and was healed again.¹²³ Wimber established his system of faith and theology through experience, doubt, and divine experience again. He believed that the goal in praying for the sick was that they got healed and as a result the kingdom of God was advanced.¹²⁴

Wimber explained how his position on speaking in tongues changed. One sunny afternoon in June 1964 his three-year-old son, Sean, wandered away. He found his son terror stricken and waving at stinging bees. He could see ugly red welts forming all over him. He laid Sean down on his bed. After the initial shock of seeing Sean in such a bad condition, he pulled himself together and began praying for his healing, but he did not know how to pray. He had been warned by a pastor about the dangers of charismatic gifts like healing and speaking in tongue. “They are divisive, and the devil counterfeits them. It’s best to stay away from them.” But his son’s present condition cut through this argument. He began to pray for Sean’s healing. He was desperately in need of words when he broke out into a language that he did not understand. His “tongue” was accented by intermittent salvos of “heal him, Jesus, heal him.” He could feel faith

¹²³

Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, xvii.

¹²⁴ Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, xix.

for healing. When he awakened a few hours later, Sean had only one small red bump on his body. Through this event, Wimber had experienced the gift of speaking in tongues. Although he later, for a period, doubted healing and speaking in tongues, his experiences brought him back to belief.¹²⁵ His experiences also made his theological foundation more solid. Like other charismatics, he solidified his belief system through mystical experiences of the Holy Spirit's presence and power.

Through his experiences, Wimber began to form his theological foundation of miracles, despite the traditions of his early learning that denied miracles exist. Many Reformed and Lutheran Christians also teach the cessation theory. Both Calvin and Luther thought the charismatic gifts ceased after the first century. In their reasoning, most Christians who deny divine healing misunderstand its purpose; a purpose which they usually limit to authenticating the gospel and the witness of the first-century messengers. Once the Christian church was established, they reason, there no longer remained any need for healing and other miracles. So, they conclude, God withdrew the charismatic gifts.

While authenticating the gospel and establishing the church were two of the purposes of divine healing, John Wimber claimed there were others. These purposes include: demonstrating Christ's

¹²⁵

Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, 3-5.

compassion and mercy (Matt. 14:14, 20:34; Mark 1:41); bearing witness to the truth of Christ's claims about himself (Matt. 8:14; Luke 5:18-26); demonstrating that God's kingdom has arrived (Matt. 4:23); showing Jesus is the One who was promised by the Father (Matt. 11:1-6), illustrating on the physical plane what God wants to do for us spiritually (Matt. 9:1-8); bringing people to repentance (Luke 10:8-12); and showing that the gospel is intended for the Gentiles as well as the Jews (Luke 7:1-10).¹²⁶

One of the Bible passages that Korean Pastor Yonggi Cho frequently quotes is very insightful. This verse actively defends John Wimber's support for the ongoing use of the gifts of the Holy Spirit: "Jesus Christ is the same yesterday and today and forever" (Heb. 13:8). In addition to this, in conclusion, this concept is powerfully reinforced by Paul's admonition to the church at Corinth, where he says, "Therefore, you do not lack any spiritual gift as you eagerly wait for our Lord Jesus Christ to be revealed" (1 Cor. 1:7).

Conclusion

John Wesley became known as the father of the Pentecostal movement in establishing his theological system of the experience of the Holy Spirit. He came to this through his conversion experience at Aldersgate, enlightenment through meetings with Spirit-led

¹²⁶

Wimber and Springer, *Power Healing*, 10-12.

Moravians, especially his personal experience of the baptism of the Holy Spirit at Fetter Lane, and numerous experiences of the Holy Spirit in the ministry field. Wesley, through his theological embracing of the work of the Holy Spirit, is recognized as a direct influence of the Great Awakening Movements in the United States.

For John Wesley, experience goes beyond the mystical experience of the gift of the Holy Spirit and has a close relationship with the Holiness Movement. Furthermore, it was an important process toward Christian perfection that clears up the remnants of sin that remain after conversion. The gifts of the Holy Spirit are also meant to be seen in the transformation of society.

Wesley's theology expands the experience of the Holy Spirit to holiness and social holiness. Through weekly meetings, early Methodists collected a penny for relief work and cared for the underprivileged. Wesley can be said to be a remarkable reformer, clergyman, and theologian who transcended speculative faith, which is the limit of reason, and sublimated speculative theology into the experience of the Holy Spirit and the Holiness Movement.

Peter Wagner needed fifteen years to accept the power of the Holy Spirit.¹²⁷ John Wimber also needed time to understand and believe the Holy Spirit was still working in supernatural and miraculous ways. Through the Aldersgate event, Fetter Lane event,

¹²⁷

Wagner, *How to Have a Healing Ministry*, 43.

and other events, John Wesley came to emphasize the experience of the Holy Spirit. This theology of Wesley's then influenced George Whitefield and Jonathan Edwards, whose theological background of cessationism was changed through experience, the First Great Awakening Movement became fueled by a continuationist theology. In Saint Augustine's old age, he changed his viewpoint from cessationism to continuationism because he experienced the work of the Holy Spirit. Luther also saw his position change from belief that the work of Holy Spirit ceased to continuationism when he witnessed the work of the Holy Spirit. Through this we can see the Holy Spirit relentlessly at work bringing about corrected views of his person and work in the theology of great minds and great influencers.

The cessationist leaning Scofield Bible and John Calvin's reformed theology affects many people. It leads the to the belief that the work of the Holy Spirit ceased after the Apostolic age. However, through this study, it is apparent that many charismatic theologians and leaders began as cessationists yet had their faith and theological views changed towards continuationism upon experiencing the work of the Holy Spirit.

Charles Kraft provides an excellent perspective to conclude this theological discussion. He emphasizes that the way we interpret Scripture (and all else that goes on) is pervasively influenced by our experience.¹²⁸ This is because people have difficulty understanding

beyond their own experience. In this sense, the empiricism that all perceptions are based on experience is seen as extremely valid with the foundation of the Bible.

Charles H. Kraft, *I Give You Authority* 聖經 福音 書 卷, tran. 韓 文 (韓: 韓文 韓文, 2000), 10.

CHAPTER FIVE

INTERDISCIPLINARY FOUNDATIONS

There are parallels to the study of the Holy Spirit in the fields of religious philosophy. Certain parallels become apparent that act as reinforcement for the idea of the Holy Spirit's ongoing supernatural work. Many philosophers have pondered the existence of God and the Holy Spirit. Through their results, extrapolations can be made that connect with the work of the Holy Spirit in Christianity.

An "innate idea" is an idea allegedly inborn in the human mind; that is an idea that is already present in the human mind and does not derive from experience. The doctrine that at least certain ideas (e.g., those of God, infinity, substance) must be innate, because no satisfactory empirical origin of them could be conceived, flourished in the 17th century, and found in René Descartes its most prominent exponent.¹²⁹ Descartes identified an innate idea with God. Descartes' major work on the scientific method was his *Discourse on the Method*

129

"Innate Idea," *Encyclopaedia Britannica*,
<https://www.britannica.com/topic/innate-idea>.

of Rightly Conducting One's Reason and of Seeking Truth in the Sciences.

Carl Jung introduced the concept of an archetypal theory. It is like the *innate idea*.¹³⁰ Jung referred to the unconscious as the individual and collective unconscious. The archetype belongs to this collective unconscious world. It is assumed that this archetype contains a shadow of God. An archetype is also known as “universal symbol.” Jung argued that phrase “collective unconscious” refers to experiences shared by a race or culture. Such experiences include such things as love, religion, death, birth, life, struggle, and survival. These experiences exist in the subconscious of every individual, and are re-created in literary works, or in other forms of art.¹³¹ Carl Jung thought collective unconsciousness prove that there are traces of God in the human mind.

Descartes' innate idea is remarkably like the archetype of Carl Jung. Descartes said it was God who made the laws that move this universe.¹³² In China, this is called Tao. The Chinese Bible translates the “Word” into “Tao” in the beginning in the Gospel of John: “In the

130

It is a concept passed down by Descartes that the perception of God exists from birth. This is not the perception of God by experience, but the perception of God from the time human beings are born.

131

Literary Devices, s.v. “Archetype,” <https://literarydevices.net/archetype/>.

132 王德山, *圣经与神学* (台北: 王德山, 2015), 39-42/1032. Google Play Books.

beginning was the *Tao*.” In Eastern philosophy, ch’i is considered to move the universe.

Baruch Spinoza also had a concept of the innate. He thought all people innately had the light of universal cognitive ability. This light came from God. This light was necessary to properly interpret the Bible.¹³³ This can be regarded as the Holy Spirit’s work in revelation.

This discussion attempts to add further substantiation from outside the Bible to the work and existence of the Holy Spirit. In this chapter, the invisible manifestations in Western and Eastern philosophy are examined with regard to describing God. The existence of God is thus shown to not be limited to a specific area. The work of the Holy Spirit is not governed by time and space.

Correlation between Ch’i and the Holy Spirit in the Orient

Koo Dong Yun expresses his opinion as follow: Although there is no exact English word for the Chinese word ch’i, various terms describe this Chinese word, such as spirit, energy, force, material force, vapor, breath, and air. Without difficulty, one can see many similarities between the biblical word Spirit (Hebrew: ruach, Greek: pneuma) and the Chinese word ch’i.¹³⁴ The understanding of ch’i (qi or

¹³³ Baruch Spinoza, *Theological Political Treatise*, trans. R. H. M. Elwes (Independent Publisher, 2019), 69.

¹³⁴ Koo Dong Yun, *The Holy Spirit and Ch’I (Qi)* (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2011), 8-9.

ki, which will be used interchangeably) philosophy in Far East Asia has an exceedingly long history.

The Sun exemplifies the primary symbol of yang ch'i; the moon is the primary symbol of yin ch'i. Thus, the essence of change is ch'i.¹³⁵ According to Eastern philosophy, ch'i becomes the cause of the universe's movement. There are two elements of ch'i, yin and yang, and these elements come together to form life. Yin is a woman, and yang is a man. When a woman and a man come together, life is born. Koo Dong Yun defines ch'i as constantly changing, moving, and transforming. This East Asian view of ch'i brings forth a chiological (Koo's term for his study of ch'i) approach that views the essence of all beings as ch'i. Change precedes being (ontos), and Change produces beings. In this regard, "changeology" takes priority over ontology.¹³⁶ Koo Dong Yun compared chiology to changeology. The chiological approach underscores the continuum between ch'i of humans and that of Change (or Tao).¹³⁷ Here, ch'i and Tao are almost similar and can be understood as ch'i for changes that work in humans and Tao for universal changes.

The word "Holy Spirit" did not exist in East Asia before Christianity arrived. However, it cannot be said that the Holy Spirit

¹³⁵ Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch'I*, 8.

¹³⁶
Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch'I*, 9.

¹³⁷
Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch'I*, 10.

began with the beginning of Christianity. The Holy Spirit is often expressed in Judges of the Bible as the Spirit of Wisdom. Also, there is a scene where Samson gains great strength through the Spirit of God (Judg. 14:19, 15:14). In the Orient, when ch'i fills the body, more than one's ability can appear. The Eastern understanding of ch'i and Tao will be examined. A key difference between the Holy Spirit and ch'i is that ch'i is impersonal, and the Holy Spirit is personal. Ch'i is energy, and the Holy Spirit uses and operates ch'i.

The Concept of Logos in the Chinese Bible; Tao

According to the Chinese Bible, the *logos* of John 1 is translated *Tao*. "In the beginning was the Tao, and the Tao was with God, and the Tao was God (John 1:1). In Korea's first translated Bible by John Ross, Logos was translated into Tao. In the East, the concept of God seems to be understood as Tao, that is, something that moves the entire universe.

In Chapter 1 of his *Tao Te Ching*, Lao-tzu writes the following about Tao: "The Tao that can be spoken of is not the eternal Tao; The name that can be named is not the eternal name." (道可道非常道 名可名非常名: Chinese).¹³⁸ Young-Oak Kim, an oriental philosopher, said that in the East there is no such thing as changelessness, and that eternity means the continuation of change. In other words, Tao is the source of

¹³⁸

金, *等等* (金: 等等, 2012), 371.

continuing change.¹³⁹ According to his discourse, God is not the object of our recognition and God cannot be called by name.¹⁴⁰ In the East, God is not a noun, but an adjective. He said that in Oriental classics, God is a mysterious energy that the *Ki* of the Universe emits.¹⁴¹ Before using the language of Shang-di (上帝: Chinese) as the concept of God in China, the primitive concept of Tao, which refers to God, is closer to the fundamental principle and energy of the entire universe that cannot be named other than by the personal concept of God.¹⁴²

Experience with the underground seminary in China would lead one to the conclusion that they understand the logos in John's Gospel as Tao.¹⁴³ Therefore, the logos understood by the Chinese is like Tao in Lao-tzu's *Tao Te Ching*. In fact, there are many concepts of Tao that are remarkably like God in the Bible.

Chinese scholar Lit-Sen Chang claims the five essences of the understanding of Taoism. First, Tao is all embracing. In chapter 25 of Tao Te Ching it says,

There is a thing, formless, yet complete; Before Heaven and Earth, it existed. Without sound, without substance, it stands alone without changing. It is all pervading and unfailing. One

¹³⁹

王德, *21 世纪* (台北: 王德, 2000), 106.

¹⁴⁰ 王德, *21 世纪*, 202-3.

¹⁴¹ 王德, *21 世纪*, 259.

¹⁴² 王德, *21 世纪*, 198.

¹⁴³ This is based on personal observation over twenty years of teaching experience among pastors in this context. I have been teaching pastors in an underground seminary in China for over twenty years. I have seen them understand the logos in John's Gospel as Tao.

may think of it as the mother of all under Heaven. We do not know its name, but we call it Tao; forced to give an appellation to it, I shall say it was Great.”¹⁴⁴

Here, Tao is a pre-existence of heaven and earth and implies a divine existence. Stephen Addiss and Stanley Lombardo

translate chapter 25 of Tao Te Ching:

Something unformed and complete
Before heaven and earth born,
Solitary and silent, stands alone and unchanging,
Pervading all things without limit.
It is like the mother of all under heaven,
But I don't know its name
Better call it Tao.
Better call it great.”¹⁴⁵

Tao is identified as great. Tao refers to the creation of all things. In other words, there is no problem at all if Tao is replaced by God the creator.

Second, Tao is immutable.¹⁴⁶ “If you do not know the eternal, you will bring disaster by acting in delusion” (chapter 16 of *Tao Te Ching*).¹⁴⁷ The Bible teaches us that this “immutable” one is not merely a “principle” but the eternal God.

¹⁴⁴

Lit-Sen Chang, *Asia's Religions: Christianity's Momentous Encounter with Paganism* (Vancouver: China Horizon, 1999), 61.

¹⁴⁵ Lao-Tzu, *Tao Te Ching*, trans. Stephen Addis and Stanley Lombardo (Boston, MA: Shambhala Publications, 1993), 25.

¹⁴⁶

Lao-Tzu, *Tao Te Ching*, 63.

¹⁴⁷ 道, 道, 380.

Third, Tao is reversible. “The movement of Tao consists in reversion” (chapter 40).¹⁴⁸ “Returning is the movement of the Tao” (translated by Kang-nam Oh).¹⁴⁹ “Be twisted and one shall be whole; be crooked and one shall be straight; be hollow and one shall be filled, be tattered and one shall be renewed; have little and one shall obtain; but have much and one shall be perplexed” (chapter 22). These words are in the same context as the book of Isaiah in the Bible.

A voice of one calling: “In the desert prepare the way for the LORD; make straight in the wilderness a highway for our God. Every valley shall be raised up, every mountain and hill made low; the rough ground shall become level, the rugged places a plain. And the glory of the LORD will be revealed, and all mankind together will see it. For the mouth of the LORD has spoken.” (Isaiah 40:3-5)¹⁵⁰

Fourth, Tao is paradoxical. “True words are paradoxical” (chapter 72). One example of this in the Bible is “for the message of the cross is foolishness to those who are perishing, but to us who are being saved it is the power of God” (1 Cor. 1:18).¹⁵¹ In chapter 43 of *Tao Te Ching*, the softest thing in the world, overcomes the hardest

¹⁴⁸

Lao-Tzu, *Tao Te Ching*, 64.

¹⁴⁹ □□□, □□□, 394. Please check all foreign language footnotes to make sure the comma, page number and period are in Times New Roman font. I have corrected three, but I did not look from the beginning of the paper, so you will need to check from the beginning.

¹⁵⁰

Lao-Tzu, *Tao Te Ching*, 65.

¹⁵¹ Lao-Tzu, 66-8.

thing in the world.¹⁵² We see this in expressions like, “A gentle answer turns away wrath” (Pr. 15:1)

Fifth, Tao is hidden. Tao was a hidden mystery for Lao Tzu. “The way itself is the something seen in dream elusive, evading; In it are images, elusive, evading; In it are things, like shadow in twilight” (chapter 21). Here a parallel can be seen in expressions like, “The secret things belong unto the Lord our God” (Deut. 29:29).¹⁵³

There are many concepts in *Tao Te Ching* that have close parallels in the Bible. Looking a little more, Tao is as follows: “Heaven and Earth do not take side in their loving” (*Tao Te Ching*, chapter 5, translated by Kang-nam Oh).¹⁵⁴ In the Bible, “He causes his sun to rise on the evil and the good, and sends rain on the righteous and the unrighteous” (Matt. 5:45). This Tao is self-defining in chapter 25 of *Tao Te Ching*. “There was something undifferentiated and yet perfect. Before Heaven and Earth were born. Soundless and formless. Independent and unchanging. Prevailing everywhere and inexhaustible. It can be called the mother of the universe. I do not know its name. I just give it a style name Tao.”¹⁵⁵ This definition of Tao is stated as if describing the doctrine of God and the theory of trinity.

¹⁵²

□□□, □□□, 397.

¹⁵³

Lao-Tzu, 69.

¹⁵⁴

□□□, □□□, 373.

¹⁵⁵

□□□, □□□, 385–6.

“The Tao gives birth to the one. The one gives birth to the two. The two gives birth to the three. The three gives birth all things. All things carry yin on their backs and embrace yang in their bosoms. Through blending the ch’i, they achieve harmony. (*Tao Te Ching*, chapter 42)¹⁵⁶

Worship in Spirit (Ch’i)

According to the ch’i philosophy, because our body is not our own, the law in which the organism of our body works must be explained by the change in motion of the ch’i of heaven and earth.¹⁵⁷ Eastern philosophy makes it clear that all things are closely related to the entire universe. In the view of Koo Dong Yun, ch’i and spirit can be identified as one.¹⁵⁸ Using his views, we can describe worship in Holy Spirit through ch’i.

“God is spirit, and his worshipers must worship in spirit and in truth” (John 4:24). In his book, *Principle of Sociology*, Herbert Spencer states that the root of all religions is ancestor worship. Every god is, and must be, in ultimate analysis, the ghost of a particular human being. Therefore, Kim Yong-ok also saw the God of the Jews—the God of Abraham, the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob—

¹⁵⁶

□□□, □□□, 396.

¹⁵⁷

□□□, □□□, □□□□□ (□□: □□□, 1998), 56.

¹⁵⁸

Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch’I*, 10-11.

ultimately as an evolved form of the ancestral god called Yahweh.¹⁵⁹

However, it is deduced that the descendants served the God that the ancestors served in commemorating the genealogy of the ancestors, and later regarded the ancestors as a god.

There is no saying in Confucianism that relates to serving ghosts. However, we can see a vague acknowledgment of God's existence. Therefore, if Confucius cannot be said to worship the ancestral gods, it is easy to believe that the ancestors' worship of God has turned into the descendant ancestor worship of today.

In his *Analects*, Confucius describes the following: Chi-lu asked how the spirits of the dead and the gods should be served. The Master said, "You are not able even to serve man. How can you serve the spirits?" "May I ask about death?" "You do not understand even life. How can you understand death?" (*Analects* book 11: 12)¹⁶⁰ But there are also sayings to memorialize parents and ancestors. "Tseng Tzu said, 'conduct the funeral of your parents with meticulous care and let not sacrifices to your remote ancestors be forgotten, and the virtue of the common people will incline towards fullness'" (*Analects* book 1:9).¹⁶¹

¹⁵⁹ 曾子, *論語集注* 1 (曾子: 曾子, 2010), 241.

¹⁶⁰

Confucius, *The Analects*, trans. D.C. Lau (NY, New York: Penguin Books, 1979), 107.

¹⁶¹

Confucius, *The Analects*, 60.

Although not written by Confucius, one of the Confucian scriptures describes in detail the original meaning of rituals in Zhongyoung. According to the doctrine of the Mean or Zhongyoung (Chinese: 中庸, Korean: 중용), filial duty means following the will of parents (19:2). During the spring and autumn seasons, one should inspect their ancestors' graves, display the clothes their ancestors wore, and put on the food that their ancestors ate when they were alive to perform a rite (19:3). The ultimate meaning of rituals is to take the place of my ancestor's life. One does the worship they performed, one enjoys the music they enjoyed, one honors what they admired, and one values the people they have brought close to. This is the supreme filial duty (19:5).¹⁶² In Confucianism, the basis of rituals is to serve the object of respect that one's ancestors served. All human beings have the essence of fearing God, and that experience and respect are passed on to their children, and it is seen as the basis of sacrifice. R. Marret (1866-1943), an English anthropologist, asserted that humans are *homo religiosus*. The only difference of humans from animals is their awareness and worship of God.

Koo Dong Yun indicates the most foundational doctrine of Christianity is hyo (Korean: 효) by quoting the fifth commandment of the Decalogue. Jesus Christ is the ultimate embodiment of hyo who obeyed His Father (God the Creator) and volunteered to die on the

¹⁶²

이종우, *중용* (서울: 도서출판, 2013), 449-457.

cross for His Father. The central point of Christianity is to obey the Heavenly Father (God) and the earthly father (human father). In face of this, Koo accused him of being a “Confucianized Christian.”¹⁶³ The most fundamental principle of Confucianism begins with *hyo*. This comes from respect and obedience to superiors. The sacrifice is the expression of that heart.

Koo Dong Yun defines the essence of God as Spirit. John 4:24 reads, “God is Spirit (*pneuma*), and his worshipers must worship in spirit and truth.” Jesus Christ is also depicted as the Spirit: “Now the Lord is the Spirit (*pneuma*), and where the Spirit of the Lord is, there is freedom” (2 Cor. 3:17).¹⁶⁴ Here we can confirm that both God and Jesus are understood as spirits. The Bible states that one of the essences of human nature is also spirit. “May your whole spirit, soul and body be kept blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ” (1 Thess. 5:23). “The Spirit himself testifies with our spirit that we are God’s children” (Rom. 8:16). “For the word of God is living and active. Sharper than any doubled-edged sword, it penetrates even to dividing soul and spirit, joints and marrow; it judges the thoughts and attitudes of the heart” (Heb. 4:12). According to the above scriptures, humans also have a spiritual essence.

¹⁶³

Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch’I*, 1.

¹⁶⁴ Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch’I*, 7.

Koo Dong Yun compared spirit in the Bible with ch'i of *I Ching* (Korean: 기, Chinese: 氣). A parallel understanding that God is Spirit is easily found in the *I Ching*, where *I* (change) represents the ultimate reality. The *I Ching* regards ch'i as the essence of *I* and Tao. The term *I Ching* consists of the two Chinese ideograms. *Ching* denotes a book or thread, and the other ideogram *I* means changes.¹⁶⁵ *I* (䷄) is derived from a hieroglyphic lizard and has its meaning in that it changes 12 times a day. That means it changes.¹⁶⁶ Koo translated *I Ching* as the book of Change. The ideogram *I* (䷄) is the combination of the two radicals: the sun and moon. The sun exemplifies the primary symbol of yang ch'i; the moon is the primary symbol of yin ch'i. Thus, the essence of Change is ch'i.¹⁶⁷ Ch'i is divided into yin and yang, and the yin and yang are combined to form one.

Similarly, Eve was separated from Adam; the first human being became two, Adam and Eve; and the two became the oneness again, giving birth to life. In the East, this is called the combination of Yin and Yang. The sky is Yang, the Earth is Yin, the man is Yang, and the woman is Yin. This Yang and Yin combine to form one. This is called the harmony of Yin and Yang. The Korean flag represents the harmony of Yin and Yang. China's Tai Chi also harmonizes Yin and Yang. This

¹⁶⁵

Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch'I*, 8.

¹⁶⁶ 기, 기 (기: 기, 2011), 12.

¹⁶⁷ Koo, *Holy Spirit and Ch'I*, 8.

harmony of Yin and Yang is called ch'i. Electrons have cathodes and anodes. Atoms have protons and electrons. Plants have stamens and pistils. When Yin and Yang meet in this way, another life is born. God puts a living energy into man, and it comes out again and becomes a living being (Gen. 2:7).

Chang-il Lee introduced Yin and Yang with archetype, which was coined by Carl Jung. The archetype is a form in which human experiences have been handed down since ancient times in an infinite repetition. In this way, Yin and Yang is a circular symbol engraved on every single cell of our body by hundreds of thousands of infinite repetitions of light and darkness that occur naturally at night and day as the Earth rotates around the Sun.¹⁶⁸ Ch'i of Yin-Yang is the essence and manifestation of the origin of the Universe.

In Oriental medicine, it is said that if the ch'i does not flow, pain comes. The Holy Spirit can be seen as the movement of ch'i. "Spirit of God was hovering over the waters" (Gen. 1:2). It breaks through the ch'i that is blocked between God and man.

The Bible records that when the Spirit of God came upon Samson, a strong force appeared on Samson and he killed the lion with his bare hands (Judg. 14:6, 19). In the East, it is said that ch'i came in that great power was revived. Ch'i can be expressed energy. Ch'i (氣) combined with another word yun (運) which means to move.

¹⁶⁸

김영, *한글 한자* (서울: 김영, 2012), 213.

Ch'i-yun (氣) to create energy. It is said that when I have strength, I have ch'i-yun (energy). Samson is cut off from God, and his ch'i was blocked and he loses his strength. However, after recovery with God, he regains strength. This means that the blocked ch'i has been pierced.

Oriental medicine says that eating with an uncomfortable mind can block ch'i and cause indigestion. Similarly, Jesus told the Jews to first reconcile with their brothers and sisters before leaving sacrifices at the altar (Matt. 5:23-24). In the context of communion, Paul states, "Anyone who eats and drinks without discerning the body eats and drinks judgment on themselves" (1 Cor. 11:29).

Worshiping with the spirit refers to worship in which ch'i is not blocked in the Eastern concept. That is, there is no discomfort in the heart and no barriers to anyone. It refers to sacrifices in a harmonious flow between man and man, God and man, and the universe and me, and even in my body. That is why I become the universe and the universe becomes me. Even in the book of Romans, it is mentioned that there is a divine nature in all things (Rom. 1:20). And as the Eastern thoughts say, the idea that God and I can become one is similarly mentioned in the Bible. "If a man remains in me and I in him, he will bear much fruit; apart from me you can do nothing" (John 15:5).

Creation and Sprit in Zhuang Zhou

In the Zhuang Zhou (Korean: 莊子 Chinese: 莊子), A person has seven holes. These holes play a role in seeing, hearing, eating and breathing. However, there were no holes in chaos, so the king of the seas of the south and the king of the seas of the north decided to make a hole for the central king, chaos, and began to drill a hole every day. And on the seventh day, the chaos died (7:12).¹⁶⁹ Genesis describes that the Earth was in chaos at the time of the creation of the heavens and the earth. And on the seventh day, the creation of heaven and earth is finished (c.f. Gen. 1:2, 2:1-2). “The earth was formless and empty, darkness was over the surface of the deep, and the Spirit of God was hovering over the waters” (Gen. 1:2). Here we can see the Spirit of God moving on the earth in the midst of chaos.

In 4:15 of Zhuang Zhu, there is a story that when one looks inside with their ears and eyes, and when one turns their heart and knowing outward, ghosts come in and stay.¹⁷⁰ In this context, ghosts do not mean spirit of dead or bad evil, but supernatural powers. The Bible says that the scales were stripped from the apostle Paul's eyes (Acts 9:18). It is not looking through the eyes of the flesh, but through the eyes of the Spirit. Therefore, Jesus repeatedly said that you will be

¹⁶⁹

莊子, 77 (韓: 莊子, 2014), 347.

¹⁷⁰ 莊子, 77, 184.

ever hearing but never understanding; you will be ever seeing but never perceiving (Matt. 13:14). In the book of Revelation, there is a scene rebuking the church at Laodicea which is described as blind (Rev. 3:17).

In the East, although the direct expression of the Holy Spirit was not used, it seems that Tao or ch'i or various expressions that seem to imply it were expressed. Just as the language of God is expressed differently in each country, the Holy Spirit is also expressed in different languages around the world. Tao is described as God and sometimes can be replaced by the Holy Spirit, and chi can also be converted into the Holy Spirit. However, it is understood as a special point in that oriental chi is divided into two and merged into one again to form a whole life.

Conclusion

This study attempts to show that the work of the Holy Spirit cannot be limited to 2000 years. The work of the Holy Spirit has been chronicled into the time of the Old Testament to show a non-limited time-frame. Similarly here, it is evident that the operation of the Holy Spirit cannot be limited to a specific geographic area, even if that work is not fully revealed and understood in direct personal terms for the Spirit within the culture. If the name of God was expressed differently in each region, it was evident from the regionally specific

terminology that the Holy Spirit was also called by a different name (again, even when and where the revelation had not reached its peak in specific biblical personal terms). While thinking about the Chinese Bible and their understanding of the Holy Spirit, it can easily be seen that Tao and the Holy Spirit or ch'i and the Holy Spirit can be understood in the same conceptual context. As with all cultures and languages, the Bible informs and gives clarity to extant concepts, but there is no doubt that the root ideas are pregnant within cultures such as China.

As confirmed in the ancient Chinese classics and scriptures listed above, there is a very high degree of similarity, almost a parallelism between the concept of Tao and God in the Bible. If one goes to China, there is a place called Temple of Heaven, a representative tourist destination in the capital Beijing. Its magnificence is incomparable to anywhere in the world. It is the place where the Chinese emperor held rituals to heaven. Koreans were also a people who had rituals to heaven.

Lao Tzu's Tao Te Ching is familiar to Chinese and Koreans, and Tao is translated into a language that replaces the logos of John's Gospel. The Tao referred to here is a self-existing and the principle that moves the universe itself that existed before the beginning. Tao moves this universe, and there is ch'i that makes this universe flow, and this ch'i is divided into Yin ch'i and Yan ch'i. Eastern philosophy

and belief are the concept that Yin and Yang are combined to form harmony.

An important concept of chi is that problems arise when chi becomes clogged or disharmonious. The flow of ch'i has both an order and an inverse. An order is the meeting of Yin and Yang. An inverse is called Yeokri when Yin and Yin or Yang and Yang meet. It's like the electromagnetic force pushes each other away when the plus and the plus meet. The concept is that if one does not choose the order, but chooses the inverse, the ch'i will be blocked and that person will not be able to flow smoothly. The consequence is that person will get sick. In Eastern philosophy, as the union of men and women creates life, the day and night must be in harmony to achieve the order.

In the end, chi is the harmony between God and humans, and the harmony between human and human. When this happens, one's body becomes healthy, diseases are healed, and people and the society in which they live become healthy. In Confucian ideology, the idea that God and an individual become one means the perfect harmony of ch'i, and this is Tao of the beginning. This can be said to be the same as the presence of the Holy Spirit in the Bible. God is the Spirit, and the Holy Spirit is not discriminated against and is omnipresence in the entire universe. The sum of this study confirms that the Holy Spirit was not limited to the spatial concept of Israel and the temporal concept of 2000 years ago. However, through the

Pentecost of Mark's upper room, it is evident that the work of the Holy Spirit became more fully revealed in power, it expanded, and it continued throughout the world.

The word *logos* was also the language of Greek philosophy that appeared in the Hellenistic era. Just as the concept of *logos* became the language of the Bible and was inserted as a universal concept and recognized about Jesus and God at the time, I believe that the concept of *ch'i* and the concept of *Tao* can be replaced with the language of the Holy Spirit if complementary concepts are added. The biggest difference between the concept of *ch'i* or *Tao* and the concept of the Holy Spirit is that the Holy Spirit is a person. If *ch'i* or *Tao* can be replaced with energy, the Holy Spirit cannot be replaced with energy, but he can be viewed as the creation energy of the universe. However, if the Holy Spirit is understood as a single person, and that personhood is then infused into the concepts of *Tao* and *ch'i*, as they are understood in the Eastern world, it is clear that these Eastern concepts can be sublimated to a more similar and complete understanding of the biblical revelation of the Holy Spirit.

The phenomena of the Holy Spirit already appeared and existed in all universes, and whether there was awareness of them or not, he was still present and moving. One cannot rule out the possibility that his name was called by different names in each region, albeit with less full revelatory understanding. The Holy Spirit was present in the

creation of the universe, and according to Romans, it is said that the divine is present in all creation. This deep contemplation of nature and equally deep meditation on life, reveals the presence and the work of the Holy Spirit in every dimension, through all time, in all places.

In philosophy, literature, religious studies, and even science, phenomena and existence of the Holy Spirit can be experienced, at least partially. Even if it is not the language of theology—the language of the Bible—life experiences and concepts speak to a partial understanding of the Holy Spirit, sometimes under the guise of another name or another conceptual framework. One comes to greater understanding when these experiences are affirmed, rather than exclusively disregarding their potential revelation. There is no doubt that the Bible made the work of the Holy Spirit more concrete and clearer. Through the incident of Mark's Upper Room, we have directly understood and acknowledged the work and indwelling of the Holy Spirit. And many theologians have explained it in the language of theology. The honest study of other religious concepts and psychology open the student to the possibility that the Holy Spirit may have worked under different names at different times in different places, even if that revelation has yet to come to its fullest biblical conceptualization.

It is the brining of all these many substantiations for the person and ongoing work of the Holy Spirit that formed the basis of the project. It was hypothesized that if cessations and others who have not been exposed to the charismatic work of the Spirit were led through a proper, biblically based exposure to the Holy Spirit's work and activity in all of history, and opportunity was given for vital encounters with him, they, like so many chronicles in the discussion thus far, would enter into their own transformative engagement with him. The next chapter chronicles the project and its results.

CHAPTER SIX

PROJECT ANALYSIS

For the past twenty years while in the Third World, through lecturing about the Holy Spirit and leading meetings, I have seen many believers experience the Holy Spirit and receive the gifts of the Holy Spirit. However, there are many moments of great interest and tension in systematically understanding the Holy Spirit, conducting experiments regarding the Holy Spirit, and deriving research results about the Holy Spirit. Results may not come out as expected, as research expectation affects the spiritual research system and the tools. Regardless, research still has an educational value that could be recognized by itself.

The hypothesis of this project was that if participants participated in an eight-week training process focused on the Holy Spirit, they would report an increase in the gifts of the Holy Spirit functioning in their lives. To evaluate the qualitative results, I used pre- and post-questionnaires, in-line individual interviews, and journal entries made during the eight-week project. The project, results from

the project, and conclusions about the project will be the focus of this final chapter.

Description of the Project

The project was designed for eight participants to participate in a study and the awaken worship service¹⁷¹ at the church for eight weeks. They were asked to complete various information gathering tasks to determine how they changed through the process. The group gathered every Sunday and participated in eight sessions of Bible study and prayer meetings. Each meeting was intended to last one hour. At the beginning of the project, the participants signed a consent agreement and wrote a personal testimony (see Appendix A).

The project ran the eight weeks from June 5, 2022, to July 30, 2022. Due to the lingering effects of the pandemic, all sessions met in a virtual setting with a few personal visitations for follow-up on the personal experiences. The session topics through the eight weeks are shown in Table 1. The focus group participants were expected to learn about and experience the supernatural power of the Holy Spirit through eight sessions.

Table 1. Outline of Project Weeks and Sessions

Week	Session	Session Topic
-------------	----------------	----------------------

¹⁷¹

The awaken worship service included praise, prayer with loud voices, and prayer using the gift of speaking in tongues.

1	Session 1	Pre-questionnaire: Lesson on the spirit as understood in the world
2	Session 2	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament
3	Session 3	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the New Testament
4	Session 4	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in church history
5	Session 5	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in Korean church history
6	Session 6	Lesson how cessationists transformed to continuationists
7	Session 7	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in my ministry
8	Session 8	Post questionnaire; Sharing of participant experiences

The first session included completion of the pre-questionnaire (Appendix B) prior to any knowledge of the nature of the project. The participants volunteered to participate in a Bible study without knowing what the Bible study would be about. The first session included a discussion with the participants of their understanding of spirit and the Holy Spirit. It was assumed that each participant would likely have different understandings of the Holy Spirit, especially regarding how the world views the spirit.

In the next two sessions, the participants learned that the Holy Spirit worked in the times of the New Testament and the Old Testament eras. Sessions two (Table 2) and three (Table 3) are similar in nature. Participants examined the work of the Holy Spirit in the Old

and New Testaments, respectively, and then personally reflected on this work. The third lesson was designed to give the participants confidence to be aware of the work of the Holy Spirit in the timeframe of the New Testament. The work of the Holy Spirit in the New Testament, presented in session three is outlined in Appendix E. The participants were asked to journal their reflections from the session discussion. In this way, their knowledge of the Bible and their theological orientation of the Holy Spirit could be determined.

Table 2. Second Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
10 minutes		Praise and prayer	
5 minutes		Meditation and listening from the Holy Spirit	
30 minutes	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament	Writing their understanding about the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament	
10 minutes	Praise and prayer	Share personal experience of	Acknowledge personal

		the Holy Spirit	thought of the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament.
5 minutes	Journaling	Reflection	Self-awareness

Table 3. Third Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson on the New Testament			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
5 minutes		Praise and prayer	
40 minutes	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the New Testament.	Discussion: Where the Holy Spirit works in the New Testament	Understanding the Holy Spirit works in the whole New Testament and share their opinions.
10 minutes	Lesson reflection on the Holy Spirit	Journaling	Aware of the Holy Spirit's work in the New Testament
5 minutes	The Holy Spirit Guidance	Praise and prayer	Feel the touch of the Holy Spirit

The fourth session explored participants' beliefs about the work of the Holy Spirit in the world as an all-encompassing and ongoing reality. The session led participants to reveal their understanding of how the Holy Spirit has worked throughout the whole of human and church history. In addition, they were informed of some key ideas concerning the ongoing charismatic work of the Spirit in the world from the post-Apostolic age. Participants were asked to write their reflections to assess how their own beliefs about the work of the Holy

Spirit changed through this session with the studying material as provided (Appendix F).

Table 4. Fourth Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the church history			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
5 minutes		Praise and prayer	
40 minutes	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the church history	Discussion: Why Cessationists believe the Holy Spirit is not work after the time of the New Testament.	Understanding the Holy Spirit's working on the history of the church.
10 minutes	Lesson Reflection on the gifts of the Holy Spirit in the church history	Journaling	If the Holy Spirit works on the church history, that mean the Holy Spirit is still working on the presence.
5 minutes	The Holy Spirit Guidance	Prayer	Touch of the Holy Spirit.

The purpose of the fifth session (Table 5) was for participants to recognize that the Holy Spirit produced transformation throughout Korean church history. All references in the Korean church history were provided for the participants (see Appendix G). There was a intentional focus on teaching them about the obvious power work of the Spirit in Korea so as to challenge cessationist assumptions in a practical, historical and testimonial way. Thus, the participants could relate the Holy Spirit and his ongoing charismatic and transformational work to their own heritage.

Table 5. Fifth Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the history of Korean Church			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
5 minutes		Praise and prayer	
40 minutes	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the history of the Korean church	Discussion: Why early missionaries in Korea changed their belief about the Holy Spirit	Expectation: all participants can be change their belief about the Holy Spirit as early missionaries change their belief.
10 minutes		Personal reflection: journaling	Sharing their belief how they change.
5 minutes	Healing	Praise and prayer	Feel the Holy Spirit

The sixth session (Table 6) was the highlight of the project. The session introduced people who transformed from cessationists into continuationists. This session raised the expectations that participants could also experience the Holy Spirit as continuationists. The participants were asked to observe and assess their beliefs from the study materials that provided (Appendix H).

Table 6. Sixth Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson how cessationists transformed to continuationism			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
5 minutes		Praise and prayer	Feel the presence of the Holy Spirit
40 minutes	Lesson how cessationists transformed to continuationism	Share the case from Apollos(Acts 18:24), Augustine, John Wesley the church members who experienced	Finding the witness who experienced the Holy spirit and to be one of them.

		the Holy Spirit and changed to their belief.	
10 minutes		Personal reflection, journaling	Acknowledge the challenges of experiencing the Holy Spirit
5 minutes		Prayer	Healing prayer for them.

The seventh session taught the participants that the kingdom of God is not a matter of talk but of power (1 Cor. 4:20). Most importantly, the participants were to realize and apply the power of the Holy Spirit in their lives, not as an idea or philosophy, but as a living practice. The seventh session is designed to enhance their confidence in the Holy Spirit. The discussion material is provided (Appendix I).

Table 7. Seventh Session of Curriculum

Topic: Lesson on the Holy Spirit in my ministry			
Time	Lesson	Activity	Outcome
5 minutes		Praise and prayer	Powerful prayer
20 minutes	Lesson on the Holy Spirit in my ministry.	Share the witness in my ministry.	Understanding how the Holy spirit works in the church and pastor Choi's ministry.
15 minutes		Discuss their experience in the Holy Spirit	Understanding the power of the Holy Spirit in their life.
10 minutes		Personal reflection, journaling	Remind participants of their gift of the Holy spirit appears in our meeting.
10 minutes		Prayer with singing gospel	Feel the presence of the Holy Spirit

In summary of the first seven sessions, the participants studied and began to understand the Holy Spirit in the first session (Appendix C). From the second to the fifth session (Appendices D-G), a Bible study incorporating theological study about the Holy Spirit was given to the participants for them to gain knowledge of the Holy Spirit's works from creation to now. The sixth session lectured that about how cessationists had changed their belief to continuationists (Appendix H) after they experienced the work of the Holy Spirit. From this session, the participants learned that they could also do the same. The seventh session was designed for me to share how the Holy Spirit has personally worked beyond my ability in the Korean-American church (Appendix I).

For data gathering purposes, the participants discussed their experiences throughout the project at the conclusion of session eight. They also completed the post-questionnaire (Appendix J), which was subsequently compared with the results from the pre-questionnaire. Within two weeks of the conclusion of the project, all the participants were individually interviewed. In these ways, data was collected from all eight participants.

The hypothesis was examined through qualitative narrative methods, with the questionnaire data being used as a slightly more objective supplement of the phenomenological impact of experiences they either did or did not have during the research project. The data

collected included pre- and post-questionnaires, in-class discussions, in-line individual interviews, and journals from eight group and personal meeting sessions. As mentioned above, the participants completed the pre-questionnaire (Appendix B) before the first-class meeting without knowing the project's purpose.

Data from Project

The project data was collected in different ways. First, data was collected from the pre- and post-questionnaires that determined if there were changes in how the participants experienced the Holy spirit. According to the first data, leading indicators suggest that studying the Holy Spirit can lead participants into transformational impartation and experiences. All the participants witnessed the signs of the Spirit's increased activity in their lives in comparing their pre- and post-questionnaires.

Participant Information

Participant 1 was a woman from a Catholic background who had no understanding of the Holy Spirit at all. She was pessimistic about praying out loud. However, after eight weeks of Bible study, she became convinced of the existence of the Holy Spirit. She had struggled in her relationship with her husband for a long time. She felt that her husband was quite patriarchal. She seemed to be pressed into a hierarchical home atmosphere. She learned the wisdom to deal with

her husband's conflicts with obedience, avoidance, and submissiveness instead of arguing. During eight weeks of class, she shed tears during praise. Although still anxious, she felt the Lord's love, happiness, and warmth during the praise that day. Her most dramatic change was that she started participating in every Sunday worship, early morning prayer with her children, and some all-night prayer meetings 40 minutes away. She also began to serve as a teacher at a Korean language school run by the church and became a member of the intercession prayer team. She did not experience the Holy Spirit as an outward phenomenon such as tongues, prophecy, or healing. However, she changed into a person who acknowledges the Holy Spirit and believes in the gifts of the Holy Spirit. She claimed that the gifts of wisdom and faith had come upon her (more internal gifting for relationship). Her marital conflict was resolved, and even her children are now expected to attend church.

Participant 2 was a church choir conductor. She is the daughter of a church elder and grew up in a family of faith. However, she confessed that she did not know anything about the Holy Spirit and that she had no gifts of the Holy Spirit. She understood the gift of the Holy Spirit to come only to very special people, and she thought negatively about the gift of the Holy Spirit. Before the study, she had fallen into a religious slump, had said she would no longer conduct the choir, and had avoided personal encounters with me. However, as a

result of her participation, she started conducting again, joined the intercession team, and her face brightened after eight weeks of Bible study.

Participant 3 was a pianist but did not do church accompaniment before studying the Bible for eight weeks. However, after eight weeks of Bible study, she started to play the piano at every worship service, participate in early morning prayer services, and play the piano every morning. She also participated in the church's short-term mission. Her most significant change she experienced through participation was in regard to her son. Her son was diagnosed with ADHD with a Tic Disorder that caused him ongoing issues at home and school. She witnessed her son become much calmer at home and school with a controlled behavior after I put a hand on him and prayed for healing. Participant 3 and her family became more involved in church ministry since she experienced the power of the Holy Spirit that healed her son. She began leading the intercessory prayer meeting at the church and stood up as one of the church leaders.

Participant 4 had a severe panic disorder and depression. She had wanted to die and had even thoughts of jumping out of a moving car. She had no trace of joy on her face due to severe depression. However, she changed after eight weeks of Bible study. She joined the choir team and committed to the translation service as well. She learned she could receive peace, comfort, and freedom through

praying with a loud voice. Again, though not a gift of the Holy Spirit as normally defined, she nevertheless experienced a significant impartation of grace by the Spirit.

Participant 5 was a Korean who served in the United State Army years ago. He was only an occasional worshipper but was willing to participate in eight weeks of Bible study. He was affected by the study. He began to tithe and attend the early morning service every day. According to his confession, after the eight-week Bible study, he decided to stop wandering in his life and faith journey. He had planned to move to another place but decided to settle at the church for solid faith. After the Bible study, he started to help interpret services for American families using his thirty-years of English skills from the US military. He also started to lead the praise team and a small group Bible study.

Participant 6 is an artist. She graduated from Seoul National University, the most prestigious university in Korea. She learned her faith in a very conservative Presbyterian denomination in Korea, so she learned and believed that she should reject speaking in tongues or gifts of the Holy Spirit. However, she began believing in the work of the Holy Spirit and started praying in tongues after eight weeks of Bible study. She is now a member of the new welcoming committee and prays with tears whenever participating in all worship services.

Participant 7 attended the Presbyterian church and took a break from the church after the COVID-19 pandemic. During the study, she felt her heart warmed, tears flowed, and she experienced a powerful presence of the Holy Spirit. She was hospitalized with severe pain in her legs during the eight weeks of the Bible study, but she experienced healing after she received prayer with faith. She began to believe in the work of the Holy Spirit from the Bible study. She had not believed in the power of the Holy Spirit, but she changed her beliefs through the Bible study. She now relies on the God of healing. She began to participate in the early morning service every day.

Participant 8 had divorced her husband and did not have a job. As a result, she lives with government assistance. She came into the study with character jealousy and had a habit of slandering others during the Bible study. Her attitude made other participants uncomfortable. All the participants and I prayed earnestly together, and the Holy Spirit directed me to tell her not to criticize others. She began to scream and cry loud and started praying in tongues. Since then, the other participants and church members noticed she had changed.

Pre- and Post-questionnaire Comparisons

All the data collected showed positive results towards the hypothesis. The data was triangulated, with each source confirming

the validity of the other. For the pre- and post-questionnaires, participants were asked to give their responses on a scale from 1 (not at all) to 5 (a lot) regarding their understanding or experience of various aspects of the Holy Spirit. Data collected from the pre- and post-questionnaires are presented in the tables below. These responses were tabulated as described in the tables below.

Table 8 shows the pre- and post-questionnaire comparison of the participants' understanding of the Holy Spirit. Note the dramatic increase in awareness of, receiving of, and equipping with the Holy Spirit following the project. Very few answered positively regarding these areas prior to the project compared to the vast majority following the project. Most dramatically note that none felt equipped with the gift of the Holy Spirit prior to the project, however 70 percent felt so following the project.

Table 8. Participant Understanding of the Holy Spirit in Pre- and Post-questionnaires

The studying and understanding the Holy spirit	Pre-questionnaire	Post-questionnaire	Difference
The awareness of the Holy Spirit	0.5	4	3.5
Have you received the Holy Spirit	0.5	5	4.5
Are you equipped with the gift of the Holy Spirit	0	5	5

As Table 9 shows, the participants experienced a large difference in their activation in the gifts of the Holy Spirit as a result of the Bible study. There was an increase in each aspect of the experience of the Holy Spirit measured. As tables 9 and 10 show, all the participants advanced regarding the understanding and the experience of grace of the Spirit, whether it be in the receiving of a specific ministry gift, or in some inner grace that the Holy Spirit imparted.

Table 9. Participant Experience of the Holy Spirit in Pre- and Post-questionnaires

Holy Spirit phenomenon in the participant's life	Pre-questionnaire Total	Post-questionnaire Total	Difference
Feeling peace	1	5	4
Feeling thanksgiving	0	5	5
Healing	0	4	4
Reconciliation	0	4	4
Love	1	4	3
Hope	0.5	4	3.5
Forgiveness	0.5	4.5	4
Boldness	0.5	4	3.5
Join church activity	1	5	4

In her pre-questionnaire, participant 1 mainly wrote 1's and 2's out of 5 on the questionnaire about the Holy Spirit based (Appendix B). She indicated she did not know much about the Holy Spirit and thought it strange. But eight weeks later, she was convinced that she

had the gift of wisdom and knowledge. Eight weeks later, in the post-questionnaire, she scored herself mostly as 4's and 5's.

Participant 2 scored herself higher in the initial pre-questionnaire (3's and 4's) both in understanding and experience of the Holy Spirit. However, she had closed her heart and had stopped conducting the choir as the worship service struggled due to COVID-19. She said that she was not confident to restart the choir with a small number of people and wanted to spend free time with her daughter. However, while studying the Bible on the Holy Spirit, she heard the voice of the Lord and began to serve as a choir conductor again. She learned obedience through the Holy Spirit. This was indicated as her post-questionnaire numbers moved to 4's and 5's. Through the study, the Holy Spirit gave her a tender heart, boldness, and courage to start again.

Participant 3 scored herself as mostly 1's and 2's in the pre-questionnaire. However, her post-questionnaire indicated a strong conviction in the Holy Spirit. This growth had much to do with the fact that her son with ADHD received healing through prayer with laying on of my hands. His outbursts of spitting and screaming disappeared in the house after the prayer. She experienced a powerful presence of the Holy Spirit through the healing of her son. She started coming daily to church and playing piano for early morning prayer.

Participant 4 moved from mid-range answers on her pre-questionnaire to very high numbers (mostly 5's) in the post-questionnaire. Prior to the study she had panic disorder, had weight gain from severe depression, wanted to die, and felt bothered by her children. Through studying and experiencing the Holy Spirit, she joined the choir, her panic disorder disappeared, her depression disappeared, and she started to lose weight and felt normal. She found the meaning of life in the presence of the Holy Spirit. Her post-questionnaire results were indicative of this large improvement.

Participant 5, retired military, had planned to move away. However, after his son's ADHD was cured through prayer during the study, he decided not to move, joined the early morning daily service, and began to lead the praise team. He recovered the prayer in tongues, which he had lost during his long military service, and came to rely more on the Holy Spirit while seeing the work of healing with his own eyes. His pre-questionnaire indicated that he had no gifts of the Holy Spirit, but his post-questionnaire indicated a high presence in the gifts of the Holy Spirit. This aligns with his experience of healing and speaking in tongues through the Bible study.

Participant 6 had severe depression because her mother was a dementia patient in Korea. She had a great longing for her mother. She also had severe pain in her right hand and anemia. When she married her conservative Presbyterian husband, she forgot the gift of the Holy

Spirit and refrained from speaking in tongues. However, during the eight-week study, she shed many tears and prayed. Her severe dizziness gradually recovered and her right arm which was not moving well was healed and began to move. Her deep longing for her mother and depression were beginning to heal. Her gift of tongues, which she had lost and thought to be problematic, began to reappear. When she started to pray, she prayed in tongues for more than an hour every day, started participating in the early morning prayer, and began actively participating in her religious life. Her pre-questionnaire to post-questionnaire results indicated increase in almost every category in both understanding and experience of the Holy Spirit. However, due to starting a new business she thought that participation in church activities decreased.

Participant 7 said that as soon as she came to our church from the Presbyterian Church, she felt a little confused and about our noisy worship service. While participating in the study she had a lot of pain and discomfort in her legs, and our intercessory prayer team prayed for her legs every week. After receiving the prayer, she felt the pain was relieved, and as she gradually improved; she said that she could feel the work of the Holy Spirit. She mentioned that the seemingly chaotic worship started to feel like a worship service of joy and thanksgiving and tears began to flow at every worship service. She said that she came to experience that this is the real life of faith. In

every category, there was at least some increase between her pre- and post-questionnaire results.

Participant 8 is one year older than my mother but was jealous and suspicious of me. Prior to the study she was quite uncomfortable even with me talking with other female church members. She followed me around, preventing me from talking with other church member, and even attacked the women who tried to talk to me. I strongly rebuked her for such a behavior which seemed to have hurt her a lot. Due to bad experiences with affairs in her marriage, she subconsciously felt abandoned by men. During the eight weeks of study, her deep wounds were healed through many tears and crying prayers. Instead of hating the female members who talked with the pastor, she went to talk to them; instead of hating and envying them, she ate with them and spent her time with them. Her prayer seemed to vomit out (this may have been a deliverance) the resentment in her heart as she recovered from past wounds and the pain of being abandoned through praise, sharing the Word, and prayer. She learned that the Holy Spirit is a healing spirit. Her pre- and post-questionnaires showed small, but consistent increases in understanding and experience of the Holy Spirit in all areas.

Participant Interviews, Journals, and Discussion Data

Through the survey of the eight participants, it was confirmed that both the understanding and experience of the Holy Spirit increased. I conducted in-depth interviews individually with each of the eight participants. The interviews not only gave an indication of their evaluation of the project, but they also provided an opportunity for the participants to continue to discover the essence of their faith and even to experience healing of their hearts.

During the interview with Participant 1, she received great grace when sharing the gift of wisdom among the gifts of the Holy Spirit. In an authoritative family, she always resisted unjust orders and would never lose an argument with her husband. The gift of wisdom appeared as the fruit of meekness, teaching her to resist evil, not to fight, and sometimes to avoid it. Just as Jesus fled King Herod, Moses fled King Pharaoh, and Joseph fled General Potiphar's wife, the role of the Spirit of Wisdom is to avoid arguing in conflict situations as well. She reported that the number of fights with her husband had drastically decreased. This was something I never foresaw while studying the gifts of the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit led the couple into one with love. She was very homesick for her hometown and was very dissatisfied with the various situations in the church. However, as she studied the Bible on the Holy Spirit, she began to find peace in her heart. she went to church almost an hour away and started

participating in the special early morning prayer meeting and the Friday all-night prayer meeting too. Although she could not finish her prayer aloud, she found peace in her heart and came to believe that she had the gift of wisdom and faith in herself. She described the weekly journal as daily school homework, but as she found peace in her mind and began to develop a passion for the faith. She started volunteering for the church and started teaching Korean language to students at a Korean school. Her face brightened and her smile was restored through the study. Her transformation was a miracle. The restoration of her happiness was the work of the Holy Spirit. Even if the work of the Holy Spirit is not in tongues, prophecy, or healing, the work of the Holy Spirit is revealed through inner peace.

Participant 2 was a negative woman. Even when I greeted her, she never gave a good response; if I asked for anything she always declined. She avoided me and sometimes gossiped behind my back. However, through the interview with her, it was confirmed that her heart opened up towards me through the study. Previously she avoided conversations with me, now she joked and participated in church service again. In the interview with me, she said that while praying, listening to the pastor's words and obedience, she was confirmed to hear the voice of the Lord about conducting the choir again. She confessed that she had heard the voice of the Lord through that day's devotion on Isaiah 41:9-10, which reads, "I took you from the ends of the earth, from its farthest corners I called you. I said, 'You are my servant'; I have chosen you and have not rejected you. So do not rear, for I am with you; do not be dismayed, for I am your God. I will strengthen you and help you; I will uphold you with my righteous right hand." It is said that she caught on to this word four years ago and started to become a conductor. However, during this Bible study on the Holy Spirit, she heard these words again. She also received a phone call from her father living in Korea who confirmed the voice of the Lord to her. She prayed for repentance to return to being the choir conductor. After this experience, she even started bringing food to the Bible study class. She thanked God for the opening of her heart. The Holy Spirit is the one who opens the door to our hearts. "These are the

words of him who is holy and true, who holds the key of David. What he opens no one can shut, and what he shuts no one can open” (Rev. 3:7).

Participant 3 previously did not attend church, but after her son received a prayer from me and his ADHD was cured, she suddenly started coming to church every day. Through an interview, she said that she was curious about praying in tongues and wanted to experience it. However, after experiencing the healing of her son, she believes that the Holy Spirit is still at work and that she does not experience the gift of the Holy Spirit as a special phenomenon but comes to know that the Holy Spirit is working by supplying our needs according to the needs of each person in our daily life. She was surprised that she was able to thank God for the little things every day rather than just for the healing of her son. Before that, she wanted to get out of a situation and run away. The work of the Holy Spirit revealed that peace of mind and gratitude play a major role.

Participant 4 took antidepressants and experienced panic disorder. In an interview, she said that she had wanted to die to get out of her current situation and go to heaven quickly. She then revealed that her illness had disappeared and recovered through the time of praise and prayer in the Bible study. She said that her life as an immigrant made it difficult for her to breathe. Her parents who could not speak any English always needed an interpreter, felt

ignored as Koreans by outsiders, and always had a hard time with the threat of economic survival. The sky seemed to be falling, and the ceiling collapsing, but through the Bible study on the Holy Spirit, delusions that would arise one by one began to disappear. After experiencing healing, she joined the choir through an intense desire to sing. She reports that through praise her soul has been set free.

Participant 5 continued to thank me in the interview. After 30 years of military service, he decided to move to another area, but through this Bible study he decided not to move, but to live a religious life at the church. He called it a miracle that his son's ADHD symptoms, which could not be cured even at the hospital, disappeared. He, too, began to pray in tongues again after having previously lost that gift. He set a new purpose for his life through the experience of the Holy Spirit, began to hope that his son would become a pastor, led the praises, and decided to participate in the Cambodia and Mexico missions as well. Finally, he said that he felt that his religious life had been fake, but now he desired to pursue a more Holy Spirit-filled life.

Participant 6 said in an interview that she had confusion because of her negative education about speaking in tongues through her Presbyterian Church. She had stopped praying in tongues. However, through the Bible study on the Holy Spirit, her speaking in tongues was restored, her uncomfortable right arm began to move

again, and her guilt over her mother was removed. Guilt is not necessarily bad, but if it remains for a long time, it can cause one to harden in sin and can kill the soul. She said that she came to realize that severe depression and sadness and longing gave way to the evil spirits, not the Holy Spirit. Now, she participates in the morning prayer every day, the Tuesday intercession prayer team, and the healing prayer ministry.

Participant 7, a Presbyterian, was unable to attend church due to COVID-19 and was wandering. After learning that our church is studying the Holy Spirit, she left the Presbyterian Church and joined our church. She was shocked to see people suddenly shouting, praying, praising, and showing their gifts in my church. In her previous church there was no emphasis in sermons on the Holy Spirit and no emphasis on prayer. In an interview, she said that she was deeply impressed that the senior pastor would pray for her uncomfortable legs until she became better. In fact, her legs were restored, and she was able to walk comfortably. She began to pray in tongues and found peace in her heart. She said that whenever she listens to the sermons, tears and emotions come to her. As the grace of the Holy Spirit came upon her, she experienced healing in body and mind.

In her interview, participant 8 spoke of her past for the first time since being in the United States. She had endured a long time

being alone. She had lived with envy and jealousy in extreme loneliness. She said that her husband had abandoned her and went to be with another woman. She projected looking at her husband when she was looking at me. She could not stand my conversations with other members of the congregation and was full of jealousy towards me. Through the study she learned how to be satisfied with the Holy Spirit. Still, she wanted to do more at church, but her dissatisfaction with it was revealed. She appears to still need psychological and spiritual management. However, she was pouring out her pain and sorrow through prayer through the Bible study on the Holy Spirit. Although she appears to have partially recovered, she still looks unstable and will need to be taken care of for a long time.

Summary of Learning

This research taught me a lot. I hoped that through this study, the gifts of the Holy Spirit of participants would be strongly manifested. However, it revealed the gift of the Holy Spirit to a handful of participants, and the pattern of life of faith changed dramatically for most people. This project is about the participants experiencing the supernatural power of the Holy Spirit. It was an opportunity to heal the wounds of their hearts. Through this study, we have seen that conflicts between couples can be restored, negative people can be positively changed, and passive people can be

transformed into active people. Even someone who wants to die due to deep depression can be changed, finding a bright side, actively participating in the church, and volunteering. Of course, some people's experiences gave them stronger faith.

Participant 1 said that there was no dialect phenomenon, but wisdom came, and the conflict between husband and wife disappeared and church activity became active. And she found peace in her heart. Participant 2 recognized the word of the Lord and returned to service as a choir conductor. Participant 3 experienced the healing of her son's ADHD and actively participated in church activities and came to church every morning to play the piano. Participant 4 experienced healing from the disappearance of panic disorder, prayed in tongues, and became zealous for church activities. Participant 5 experienced the healing of his son's ADHD, and the previously ceased prayer in tongues started to come out explosively again. Through the healing of his son, he gave up moving and settled in this church. Participant 6's anemia disappeared and the guilt about her mother in bed disappeared. She also started praying in tongues again after this gift had ceased in her. Participant 7's uncomfortable leg was restored, and her faith became passionate through the experience; she goes to church every day to study the Bible. Participant 8 still had anxiety and doubts, conflicts and envy among the members, but she found a lot of peace in her heart and through fervent prayer in tongues.

Table 10 indicates revealed phenomenon of the gift of the Holy Spirit in the participants. Before the study, all participants were expected to exhibit the gift of tongues. However, only five out of the eight participants showed this phenomenon. Participants 1, 2, and 3 did not show the phenomenon of praying in tongues. All participants had increased church attendance and participation. Participants 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 8 all participated in the early morning prayer every day. Participants 1 and 2 could not participate every day due to distance, but participant 1 participated in the all-night prayer every Friday and participant 2 participated in the intercession prayer meeting. In addition, all participants actively joined the intercessory prayer meeting. Participants 1, 4, and 6 experienced internal healing, participant 1 had a resolved marital conflict, participant 4 was liberated from panic disorder, and participant 6 was freed from guilt feeling. Participants 3, 5, and 7 had a healing experience. As a couple, 3 and 5 shared their son's ADHD healing phenomenon, and participant 7 had her legs healed. By sharing these phenomena with church members, sinusitis disappeared, shoulder pain, and head pain also disappeared for church members who did not participate in the study.

Table 10. Revealed phenomenon after eight-week study about the Holy Spirit

Phenomenon after eight weeks/ Participant	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Speaking in tongues	X	X	X	O	O	O	O	O
Wisdom	O							
Resolved couple conflict	O							
Awakening of the Word	O							
Church Activities	O	O	O	O	O	O	O	O
Early Morning Service	X	X	O	O	O	O	O	O
Friday overnight Prayer	O	X	O	O	O	O	O	O
Inner Healing	O			O		O		
Surgical Healing							O	
ADHD Healing			O		O			
Join Intercessory Prayer	O	O	O	O	O	O	O	O

Table Notes: O indicates that the phenomenon is present.
X indicates that it did not appear as expected.
The blank is the part not mentioned by the participant.

All eight participants in the study felt at peace, thanksgiving, healing, reconciliation, love, hope, forgiveness, boldness, and positive emotional effects were found in all of them. Everyone's understanding of the gifts of the Holy Spirit increased. Negative reports appeared in two people, and participants 6 and 8 reported a decrease in church activity. My observation was that church activity had increased, but those two participants thought it had decreased. The reason was that participant 6 thought that participation in church activities decreased as they started a new business during the course of the study, and participant 8 mistakenly believed that I, the senior pastor, had excluded her from the service at the age of retirement. She was not fully healed from the trauma of being abandoned by her husband when she was young.

As a result of this study, I expected the gifts of the Holy Spirit to appear supernaturally. However, the phenomenon that was the same for all was improved inner peace and increased activeness in church activities. In particular, it was not expected that marital relationship recovery or mental problems were recovered, but it can be said to be a great harvest of this study. This fact notwithstanding, the project implementation did increase supernatural gifting in many people. The hypothesis was affirmed on that issue. It is just that the more obvious and universal transformations came in ways that were not the primary

focus of the project. This is still wonderful news and bodes well for a future use of the project.

Conclusion

Through this dissertation, the work of the Holy Spirit proves that he is a universal phenomenon and transcends all the world. The Holy Spirit did not appear suddenly after Jesus, but the Holy Spirit conceived Jesus, and when Jesus prayed, the Holy Spirit helped, so the Holy Spirit worked remarkably in Jesus's birth, coexistence, and later life. The Holy Spirit was with God's work of creation and was with God before creation. After Jesus ascended in the resurrection, the Holy Spirit reveals himself to us. He is powerfully present to all who have believed and trusted in him since the days of the early church. For all those who learn the work of the Holy Spirit biblically, theologically, and relationally, and believe and pray together, they will see the Holy Spirit manifested in various ways according to each person's needs, as has always been the case since Pentecost and beyond in all of God's manifold working by his Spirit.

As a result of this study, I believe this paper will be a good challenge for those who believe or deny the work of the Holy Spirit. I focused on the overt, manifest phenomena of the Holy Spirit., In conclusion, the most significant work of the Holy Spirit was to heal the hearts of wounded souls of all participants. Hosea 4:6 says "my

people are destroyed for lack of knowledge.” It has been clinically shown that education that limits the work of the Holy Spirit and denies the gifts of the Holy Spirit can suppress the Holy Spirit manifested in each person. And that is to the great detriment of all who come to God looking for his saving grace in all of its forms.

People all over the world have seeds of understanding of the Holy Spirit that are surprisingly close to the biblical description of his person and work. And the Bible specifically describes the Holy Spirit, and records that he was with God at the time of creation and that he also came to Moses and David in the Old Testament. And in the Old Testament, it is said that God wants the his Spirit to come upon everyone. The Holy Spirit, who dwelt with Jesus in the New Testament era, indwells us as the Comforter, the Holy Spirit, after Jesus' ascension, and has helped us in our ministry with various gifts. I have no doubt that this research paper will provide new hope to those who confine the phenomenon of the Holy Spirit to the biblical age and prove that the work of the Holy Spirit transcends time and region, working for us today and for eternity in our next generation.

Through this study, I wanted to see the presence of the powerful gift of the Holy Spirit, but it was confirmed that what the Holy Spirit often and unexpectedly gives us as we seek him is peace, love, and hope, which are more precious than gifts as a foundation for understanding God's love, while gifts remain very important in the

mission of the church. Studying the Holy Spirit and praying for the Holy Spirit's presence restored the family, healed depression, dispel homelessness, and relieved stress. The presence of the Holy Spirit brightened the face, restored laughter, increased participation in the church, and showed a united obedience.

As this study was intended to focus on how the gifts are manifested, the discovery of the psychological and physical healing phenomenon, which was not greatly expected, confirmed that the work of the Holy Spirit has the main purpose of healing and restoring us as a foundation for pursuing him and his power even more. God did give some gifts by the Spirit, and though these inner results were wonderful and surprising, they are often necessary first touches before the Spirit manifests in power to gift and to send out. Therefore, my conclusion can be said that the phenomenon of the presence of the Holy Spirit is the same as the reason why Jesus came to this earth. "The blind received sight, the lame walk, those who have leprosy are cured, the deaf hear, the dead are raised, and the good news is preached to the poor" (Luke 7:22).

Through the work of the Holy Spirit, I have been healed of many wounds that are common in the lives of immigrants. I had to leave my mother country. I had to leave my mother and father. When I was pastoring in America, my father died in a hospital bed. My guilt was so great that it was difficult to recover, and my life as an immigrant in

the United States was very difficult due to language and financial problems. The continuation of my marital relationship was not easy due to the extreme stress. Extreme loneliness and fear the difficult pastoral environment often led me to want to die from a depressed and troubled heart. It was not easy to control my emotions, and I often burst into tears. It was the Holy Spirit who healed these diseases of the heart. Immigrant society is a world of abandoned wives, neglected children, and neglected workers. The only thing that can overcome this difficulty is the comfort and healing of the Holy Spirit. This was the main essence of the results, even as I was focused more on the phenomenon. The most important role of the Holy Spirit was to comfort, heal, and give us peace. Holy Spirit, please come and heal all those who read this just as you have healed me.

APPENDIX A
PERSONAL TESTIMONY

Personal Testimony

(□□ □□□)

Name _____

[illegible]

APPENDIX B

PRE-QUESTIONNAIRE, INTERVIEW QUESTIONS, AND JOURNAL QUESTIONS

Pre-questionnaire, Interview Questions and Journal Questions

Name _____

The questionnaire, which will be given before the Bible study begins and afterwards, was prepared in the following way. The questionnaire's responses are 1-5: 1) is not at all; 2) is not really; 3) is not sure; 4) is some; and 5) is a lot.

1. What are the "gifts of the Holy Spirit"?
2. Are there "certain people" that these gifts of the Holy Spirit are given to? If so, please describe what kind of persons are given these spiritual gifts.
3. Do you currently possess any gifts of the Holy Spirit? If you do, please indicate with specificity what these gifts are?
4. How often do you utilize these gifts of the Holy Spirit?
5. How do you utilize these gifts of the Holy Spirit?
6. Can anyone receive these gifts of the Holy Spirit? If so, how does one go about acquiring these spiritual gifts?
7. How do these gifts of the Holy Spirit affect the operation of the local church?
8. How do these gifts of the Holy Spirit affect the operation of the larger Body of Christ as we express them outside the church?

Interview Questions for those who have an experience of a gift of the Holy Spirit.

1. Describe what happened.
2. Was this a brand-new experience for you or something you experienced before?
3. How does this change your understanding of the Holy Spirit?
4. How does this make you feel about your faith and God's work in and through your life?
5. Anything else you would like to say?

Weekly Journal Questions

1. What did you learn this session?
2. Did you agree or disagree with what was taught? why?
3. Did you experience anything when you were prayed for? If so, please describe and let me know, so I can interview you.
4. Did your belief in the person and work of the Holy spirit change in any way? (Describe)

APPENDIX C

TO STUDY ABOUT THE SPIRIT IN THE UNDERSTANDING OF THE
WORLD

**Orientation and to study about the spirit in the understanding
of the World**

DMin project for Seung Mok Choi

Session #1

Name: _____

Session # 1: Orientation about the Holy Spirit

1. 15 minutes to take Pre-projects questionnaires
2. 30 minutes to study about the spirit in the understanding of the
World
3. 20 minutes for participants to share their knowledge of the Holy
spirit and to provide feedback

APPENDIX D

LESSON ON THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE OLD TESTAMENT

DMin project for Seung Mok Choi

Session #2

Participant's Name:

Session 2: Lesson the Holy Spirit in the Old Testament

In the manifestation of the work of the Holy Spirit, it is often said that the beginning is Pentecost. However, the Holy Spirit, as the third Person of the Trinity, has always been present. According to biblical scholars John MacArthur and Richard Mayhue, the Holy Spirit is referred to from the time of creation (Gen. 1:2) all the way to the last Old Testament book (Mal. 2:15). God's Spirit appears most frequently in Isaiah (fifteen times), Ezekiel (fifteen times), Numbers (seven times), Judges (seven times), 1 Samuel (seven times), and Psalms (five times). The work of the Holy Spirit began in Genesis. "Now the earth was formless and empty, darkness was over the surface of the deep, and the Spirit of God was hovering over the waters" (Gen. 1:2).

APPENDIX E

LESSON ON THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE NEW TESTAMENT

DMin project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant's Name:

Session 3: Lesson the Holy Spirit in the New Testament

Most of Jesus' preaching was about heaven. One of the conditions of entering heaven is the rebirth from the Holy Spirit. This condition is not only valid at the time of Jesus but is still valid now. Jesus told His disciples that the reason for his crucifixion was that we would receive the Holy Spirit. "I tell you the truth: It is for your good that I am going away. Unless I go away, the Counselor will not come to you; but if I go, I will send him to you" (John 16:7). He died on the cross and was resurrected on the third day. After his resurrection, the first words spoken to the disciples were to receive the Holy Spirit. "He breathed on them and said, 'Receive the Holy Spirit'" (John 20:22).

APPENDIX F

LESSON ON THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE CHURCH HISTORY

DMin project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant's Name:

Session 4: Lesson on the Holy Spirit in the church history

Most of Jesus' preaching was about heaven. One of the conditions of entering heaven is the rebirth from the Holy Spirit. This condition is not only valid at the time of Jesus but is still valid now. Jesus told His disciples that the reason for his crucifixion was that we would receive the Holy Spirit. "I tell you the truth: It is for your good that I am going away. Unless I go away, the Counselor will not come to you; but if I go, I will send him to you" (John 16:7). He died on the cross and was resurrected on the third day. After his resurrection, the first words spoken to the disciples were to receive the Holy Spirit. "He breathed on them and said, 'Receive the Holy Spirit'" (John 20:22).

Martyr Justin believed the Word of transformation by the Spirit. This Word went out to all nations over which the demons ruled (Justin, Dialogue with Trypho 83.4.). Every demon is exorcised, conquered, and subdued in the very name of this Son of God (Justin, Dialogue with Trypho 30.3.). Here we can see that Justin identifies the Word and the Holy Spirit. Justin said that many people who were demon-possessed were healed in the name of Jesus.

The work of the Holy Spirit is also written in the early literature of the Didache, which is a brief early Christian treatise written anonymously in Koine Greek, dated by modern scholars to around 100 CE in Syria. Chapter 11 and verse 8 of the Didache reads, “but not everyone who speaketh in the spirit is a prophet, but he is so who hath the disposition of the Lord; by their dispositions they therefore shall be known, the false prophet and the prophet.” Through this early literature, it can be confirmed that the early church had prophets.

Eusebius (263–339 CE) in his *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine* describes the miracles recorded by early church father, Papias of Hierapolis (60–130 CE). Papias describes the resurrection of a dead person in his own lifetime. Papias also wrote how Justus, surnamed Barsabas, swallowed a dangerous poison and by the grace of the Lord was unaffected. After the Savior’s ascension, this Justus was put forward along with Matthias by the holy Apostles to replace the traitor Judas. Eusebius also describes various miracles that Greek Bishop Irenaeus (130 – 202 CE) wrote about in his *Refutation and Overthrow of False Doctrine*. But they fall far short of raising the dead, as the Lord raised them, and as did the apostles through prayer, and as among later Christians, because the need was so great and the whole of the local church besought God with much fasting and supplication, the spirit of the dead man has returned, and

his life has been granted to the prayers of God's people. Irenaeus also mentioned the gift of the Holy Spirit. "Similarly, we hear of many members of the Church who have prophetic gifts and by the Spirit speak with all kinds of tongues and bring men's secret thoughts to light for their own good and expound the mysteries of God." Eusebius further describes the mysterious scene of Fabian's appointment as the Roman bishop. Fabian, who was present, came into no one's mind. But suddenly out of the blue a dove fluttered down and perched on Fabian's head, plainly following the example of the descent upon the Savior of the Holy Spirit in the form of a dove. Because of this sign, Fabian was unanimously selected as the bishop of Rome.

Tertullian (160 – 240 CE) also reveals a personal acquaintance with the supernatural gifts of the Holy Spirit, including speaking in tongues. In *A Treatise on the Soul* Tertullian writes, "For seeing that we acknowledge the spiritual charismata, or gifts, we too have merited the attainment of the prophetic gift." He goes on to tell of a woman in his congregation "whose lot it has been to be favored with sundry gifts of revelation." Saint Augustine of Hippo (354–430 CE) has been considered by some scholars to be a main proponent of cessationism. However, Augustine describes various miracle experiences in his book *City of God*. Athanasius of Alexandria (c.297–May 2, 373 CE) helped canonize the twenty-seven books of the New Testament. In his third asylum, he wrote two works, *The Life of*

Antony and The Letter to Marcellinus. Athanasius writes of many mysterious experiences of St. Anthony (January 12, 251 – January 17, 356 CE) who encountered spiritual warfare against Satan. Antony also had a prophecy fulfilled as Athanasius writes in the chapter 86 of The Life of Antony. In The Letter to Marcellinus, Athanasius states, “We pray that the Holy Spirit will live and work in every Bible whenever we need it.”

Sadly, John Calvin (July 10, 1509 – May 27, 1564 CE), a reformer, insisted that the gifts of the Holy Spirit ceased after the writing of Scripture. Calvin was influenced by John Chrysostom (349 – September 14, 407 CE). Chrysostom insisted that miracles are given when faith is weak, and when true faith takes root, miracles are stopped. In the May 24, 1738, John Wesley wrote, “In the evening I went very unwillingly to a society in Aldersgate Street, where one was reading [Martin] Luther's preface to the Epistle to the Romans. About a quarter before nine, while he was describing the change which God works in the heart through faith in Christ, I felt my heart strangely warmed. I felt I did trust in Christ, Christ alone, for salvation; and an assurance was given me that He had taken away my sins, even mine, and saved me from the law of sin and death.” George Whitefield (December 16, 1714 – September 30, 1770 CE), England's greatest preacher. Wherever Whitefield preached in New England, men openly cried and women were stunned. Many evangelists held numerous

revival meetings, beginning with George Whitefield. From 1740 to 1742, there were a tremendous revival awakening of worship.

Jonathan Edwards came to discern the biblical experience of the Holy Spirit after a powerful experience of the Holy Spirit. He experienced and witnessed the work of the Holy Spirit. William Seymour (May 2, 1870 – September 28, 1922 CE) is known as the founder of modern Pentecostalism. At Azusa Street in Los Angeles, California, he led a revival movement in the early 1900s that included speaking in tongues and others signs of the Holy Spirit. Frank Bartleman (December 14, 1871 – August 23, 1936 CE), a reporter for The New York Times, pretended to be lame at one of Seymour's meetings in order to expose it as a false movement. William Seymour said, "Let it be as he belied" and Bartleman became lame, unable to move his legs. When he repented of his falsehood, he was able to walk again. Because of this experience, Bartleman became a strong proponent of the Azusa Street revivals and they became more known to the world.

APPENDIX G

LESSON ON THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE HISTORY OF KOREAN CHURCH

DMin Project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant's Name: _____

Session 5: Lesson on the Holy spirit in the history of Korean church

1. 25 minutes to share healing ministry in the history of Korean Church
2. 20 minutes to share how the Holy Spirit work in the history of Korean Church
3. 15 minutes for share how the great Pyongyang revival movement came about.

APPENDIX H

LESSON HOW CESSATIONISTS TRANSFORMED TO CONTINUATIONIST

DMin Project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant's Name: _____

Session 6: Lesson how cessationists transformed to continuationism

1. 25 minutes to share the case of missionaries in Korea
2. 20 minutes to share the case of theologians in the church history
3. 15 minutes for share the case of church members.

APPENDIX I

LESSON ON HOW THE HOLY SPIRIT WORKS IN MY MINISTRY

DMin Project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant's Name: _____

Session 7: Lesson on How the Holy Spirit works in My Ministry.

1. 25 minutes to share healing ministry in USA
2. 20 minutes to share how the Holy Spirit work in mission field.
3. 15 minutes for share each person's experiences.

APPENDIX J

POST-QUESTIONNAIRE

DMin project for Seung Mok Choi

Participant name: _____

Session 8: Prayer Meeting for 1 hour

After all, eight weeks of education and interviews, I would like to examine the changes in their religious life with the following additional questions

Post-questionnaire

1. What are the "gifts of the Holy Spirit"?
2. Are there "certain people" that these gifts of the Holy Spirit are given to? If so, please describe what kind of persons are given these spiritual gifts.
3. Do you currently possess any gifts of the Holy Spirit? If you do, please indicate with specificity what these gifts are?
4. How often do you utilize these gifts of the Holy Spirit?
5. How do you utilize these gifts of the Holy Spirit?
6. Can anyone receive these gifts of the Holy Spirit? If so, how does one go about acquiring these spiritual gifts?
7. How do these gifts of the Holy Spirit affect the operation of the local church?
8. How do these gifts of the Holy Spirit affect the operation of the larger Body of Christ as we expect them outside the church?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alcott, Jeanne. *Words of Power: 365 Inspirational Message, Spiritual Powerlines, and Prayers Hear God's Heart for Your Life Every Day and Live in His Power*. Bloomington, IN: WestBow, 2014.
- Allen, Leonard. *Poured Out: The Spirit of God Empowering the Mission of God*. Abilene, TX: Abilene Christian University Press, 2018.
- Allison, Gregg, et al. *The Holy Spirit*. Nashville, TN: B & H Publishing Group, 2020.
- _____. *50 Core Truths of the Christians Faith: A Guide to Understanding and Teaching Theology*. Grand Rapids: MI: Baker, 2018.
- Anderson, Allan H. *An Introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity* 2nd ed. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Arnold, Eberhard, editor. *The Early Christians in Their Own Words*. Farmington, PA: Plough Publishing House, 1997.
- Augustine. *City of God*. translated by Henry Bettenson. New York, NY: Penguin Book, 2003.
- _____. *Confessions*. translated by R. S. Pine-coffin. New York, NY: Penguin, 1984.
- Augustine, Daniela Christova. *The Spirit and the Common Good: Shared Flourishing in the Image of God*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2019.
- Barclay, John M. G. *Paul & the Gift*, Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2015.
- Baltsan, Haim. *Webster's New World: Hebrew Dictionary*. Cleveland, OH: Wiley Publishing Inc., 1992.

- Berkin, Carol, et al. *Making America: A History of the United States*. 7th ed. Boston, MA: Cengage Learning, 2014.
- Bevins, Winfield H. "A Pentecostal Appropriation of the Wesleyan Quadrilateral," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 14, no. 2 (January 2006): 229-246.
- Billings, J. Todd. *Remembrance, Communion and Hope*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 2018.
- Blair, William N. & Bruce F. Hunt. *The Korean Pentecost and the Sufferings Which Followed*. Carlisle, PA: The Banner of Truth Trust, 2020.
- Bosworth, F. F. *Christ the Healer*, Grand Rapids, MI: Chosen, 2000.
- Brown, Candy Gunther, *Testing Prayer: Science and Healing*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2012.
- Brown, Michael L. *Israel's Divine Healer*, Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Publishing House, 1995.
- Carroll, John T. *The Holy spirit in the New Testament*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2018.
- Castelo, Daniel. *Pneumatology: A Guide for the Perplexed*. London, UK: Bloomsbury T & T Clark, 2015.
- Castleman, Robbie. *New Testament Essentials: Father, Son, Spirit, and Kingdom*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2014.
- Clark, Randy. *There is More*. Bloomington, MI: Chosen Books, 2013
- _____. *The Essential Guide to the Power of the Holy spirit: God's Miraculous Gifts at Work Today*, Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image Publishers, 2001.
- _____. *Lighting Fires: Keeping the Spirit of Revival Alive Your Heart and in the Hearts of Others around You*, Lake Mary, FL: Creation House, 1998.
- Collins, Adela Yarbro. *Hermeneia - A Critical and Historical Commentary on the Bible Mark A Commentary*. Edited by Harold. W. Attridge. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007.
- Confucius. *The Analects*, translated by D.C. Lau. New York, NY: Penguin Books, 1979.
- Congar, Yves. *Spirit of God: Short Writing on the Holy Spirit*. Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 2018.

- Cox, Harvey. *Fire From Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-First Century*. Cambridge, MA: Da Capo Press, 2001.
- Dearborn, Kerry. *Drinking from the Wells of New Creation: The Holy Spirit and the Imagination in Reconciliation*. Cambridge, UK: James Clarke & Co., 2015.
- DeArteaga, William. *Quenching the Spirit: Discover the Real Spirit Behind the Charismatic Controversy*. Lake Mary, FL: Creation House, 1996.
- DeVries, Jan. *Do Miracles Exit ?* Edinburgh, UK: Random, 2011.
- Duewel, Wesley L. *Revival Fire*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1995.
- Edwards, Jonathan. *Distinguishing Marks of a Work of the Spirit of God*. Kindle Edition.
- Eke, Christopher. *The Book of Great Testimonies and Great Breakthroughs*. Scotts Valley, CA: Create Space, 2014.
- Elmer, Duane. *Cross-Cultural Conflict: Building Relationship for Effective Ministry*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1993.
- _____. *Cross-Cultural Connections: Stepping out and Fitting in Around the World*, Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2002.
- Elsbree, Oliver W. *The Rise of the Missionary Spirit in America, 1790-1815*. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2013.
- Eusebius. *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*. translated by G. A. Williamson. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Publishing House, 1975.
- Evans, Tony. *Prayers for Victory in Spiritual Warfare*, Eugene, OR: Harvest House Publishers, 2015.
- Gaebelein, Frank E., general editor. *The Expositor's Bible Commentary: Volume 2*. Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1990.
- _____. *The Expositor's Bible Commentary: Volume 5*. Grand Rapids, MI: Harper Collins Publication, 1991.
- Gordon, A. J. *The Ministry of Healing: The Unbroken History of God's Power to Heal*. New Kensington, PA: Whitakerhouse, 2020.
- Graham, Billy. *Just as I Am: The Autobiography of Billy Graham*. New York, NY: Harper Collins, 1997.

- Gunkel, Hermann. *Genesis*, translated by Mark E. Biddle. Macon Georgia: Mercer University Press, 1997.
- Gunter, W. Stephen and Elaine Robinson, et al., editor. *Considering the Great Commission: Evangelism and Mission in the Wesleyan Spirit*, Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2005.
- Habers, Myk. *The Progressive Mystery: Tracing the Elusive Spirit in Scripture and Tradition*. Bellingham, WA: Lexham Press, 2019.
- Hagin, Kenneth E. *How You Can Be Led by the Spirit of God*. Tulsa, OK: Kenneth Hagin Ministries, 2006
- Hahan, Scott. *The Fourth Cup: Unveiling the Mystery of the Last Supper and the Cross*. New York, NY: Image, 2018.
- Heitzenrater, Richard P. *Wesley and the People Called Methodists*, 2nd ed. Nashville, TN: Abingdon, 2013.
- Helland, Roger, and Leonard Hjalmarson. *Missional Spirituality: Embodying God's Love from the Inside Out*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2012.
- Hellerman, Joseph H. *Philippians*. Edited by Andreas J. Köstenberger and Robert W. Yarbrough. Nashville, TN: B&H, 2015.
- Hill, Kevin Douglas. *Athanasius and the Holy spirit: The Development of His Early Pneumatology*. Minneapolis, MI: Fortress Press, 2016.
- Holmes, Christopher R. J. *The Holy Spirit*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2015.
- Hooton, Michael, and Nigel Wright. *Extended Family: Why There So Many Different Churches?* Eugene, OR: Resource, 2016.
- Hubbard, David Allan. *Joel and Amos*. Downers Grove, IL: Inter Varsity Press, 1989.
- Hyatt, Eddie L. *2000 Years of Charismatic Christianity*. Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2002.
- James, William. *The Varieties of Religious Experience*. New York, NY: The Mentor Book, 1958.
- Jennings, Daniel R. *The Supernatural Occurrences of John Wesley*. San Bernardino, CA: Sean Multimedia, 2012.
- Johnson, Charles A. *The Frontier Camp Meeting: Religion's Harvest Time*. Dallas, TX: Southern Methodist University Press, 1955.

- Johnstone, Patrick. *The Church is Bigger than You Think: The Unfinished Work of World Evangelisation*. Bucks, U.K.: WEC International, 2005.
- _____. *The Future of the Global church: History, Trends and Possibilities*. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity, 2014.
- Jones, Schott J. *The Evangelistic Love of God and Neighbor: A Theology of Witness and Discipleship*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003.
- Jonson, Bill and Randy Clark. *The Essential Guide to Healing: Equipping all Christians to Pray for the Sick*. Minneapolis, MN: Chosen, 2011.
- Kant, Immanuel. *An Answer to the Question: "What is the Enlightenment?"* Translated by H. B. Nisbet. London, UK: Penguin 2013.
- Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti. *Pneumatology: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2018.
- Keck, Leander E., et al., editor. *The New Interpreter's Bible: Volume 2*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1998.
- _____. *The New Interpreter's Bible: Volume 3*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1999.
- _____. *The New Interpreter's Bible: Volume 7*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1996.
- Keener, Craig S., *Miracles: The Credibility of the New Testament Accounts Volume 1*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic a division of Baker Publishing Group, 2011.
- _____. *Miracles: The Credibility of the New Testament Accounts Volume 2*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic a division of Baker Publishing Group, 2011.
- _____. *The Mind of the Spirit: Paul's Approach to Transformed Thinking*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2016.
- _____. *The Spirit Hermeneutics: Reading Scripture in Light of Pentecost*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2016.
- _____. *The Spirit in the Gospels and Acts: Divine Purity and Power*, Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic a division of Baker Publishing Group, 2010.

- Kim, Grace Ji-Sun. *The Homebred Christianity Guide to the Holy Spirit: Hand-Raisers, Han, and the Holy Ghost*. Minneapolis, MI: Fortress Press, 2018.
- Kinghorn, Kenneth Cain, editor. *John Wesley on Christina Practice: The Standard Sermons in Modern English Volume 1*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2002
- _____. *John Wesley on Christina Practice: The Standard Sermons in Modern English Volume 2*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2002
- _____. *John Wesley on Christina Practice: The Standard Sermons in Modern English Volume 3*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003
- Koo, Dong Yun. *The Holy Spirit and Ch'I (Qi)*. Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2011.
- Kooi, Cornelis Van Der. *This Incredibly Benevolent Force: The Holy Spirit in Reformed Theology and Spirituality*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2018.
- Kreider, Alan. *The Patient Ferment of the Early Church*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2016.
- Lao-Tzu. *Tao Te Ching*, translated by Stephen Addis and Stanley Lombardo. Boston, MA: Shambhala Publications, 1993.
- Leclaire, Jennifer. *Tongues of Fire: 101 Supernatural Benefits of Praying in the Holy Spirit*. Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image, 2013.
- Lederle, Henry I. *Theology with Spirit: The Future of the Pentecostal & Charismatic Movements in the 21st Century*. Tulsa, OK: Word & Spirit Press, 2010.
- Levison, John R. *Inspired: The Holy Spirit and the Mind of Faith*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2013.
- _____. *The Holy Spirit Before Christianity*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2019.
- Lewis, C. S. *The Problem of Pain*. New York, NY: HarperOne, 2015.
- Lingenfelter, Sherwood G. & Marvin K. Mayers. *Ministering Cross Culturally: An Incarnational Model for Personal Relationships*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books House, 1992.

- Loyer, Kenneth. *God's Love Through the Spirit: The Holy spirit in Thomas Aquinas and John Wesley*. Washington, D. C.: Catholic University of America Press, 2014.
- MacArthur, John, and Richard Mayhue. *Biblical Doctrine: A Systematic Summary of Bible Truth*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2017.
- Macchia, Frank D. "Baptism in the Holy Spirit-and-Fire: Luke's Implicitly Pneumatological Theory of Atonement." *Religions* 9, no. 2: 63. (February 24, 2018).
<https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9020063>.
- Macchia, Stephen A. *Crafting a Rule of Life: An Invitation to the Well-Ordered Way*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity, 2012.
- Malkmus, George H. *Why Christians get Sick*, Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image Publishers, 2005.
- Marcus, Susan. *Enter His Gate to Your Jewish Roots*. Israel: T-Land Ltd, 2003.
- Matthews, Michael R. *International Handbook of Research in History, Philosophy and Science Teaching*. New York: Springer, 2014.
- McBride, Alfred. *The Gospel of the Holy Spirit: Meditation and Commentary on the Acts of the Apostles*. Charlotte, NC: Saint Benedict Press, 2013.
- McElhenney, John G., editor. *United Methodism in America: A Compact History*, Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1992.
- McGrath, Alister E. *Christian Theology: An Introduction*, Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2005.
- Nouwen, Henri J. M. *The Wounded Healer*, New York, NY: Image Books Doubleday, 1979.
- Nel, Marius, "'Baptised in the Spirit and Fire': Single or Double Baptism?" *Neotestamentica*, vol 50, no. 1. (January, 2016): 165 – 180.
- Oak, Sung-Deuk, *The Making of Korean Christianity: Protestant Encounters with Korean Religions 1876-1915*, Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2013.

Oden, Thomas C. *Ancient Christian Commentary on Scripture Series*, edited by Christopher A. Hall. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1998.

_____. *Pastoral Theology Essentials of Ministry*, New York, NY: Harper & Row, 1983.

Osudibia, Kizito Choke. *Religion and the Global Resurgence of Violence Connection of the Abrahamics*. Bloomington, IN: Authorhouse, 2016.

Outler, Albert C. "The Wesleyan Quadrilateral in John Wesley," *Wesleyan Theological Journal*, vol. 20, no. 1 (Spring 1985): 7-18.

_____. editor. *John Wesley*, New York, NY: Oxford University Press 1980.

Park, Andrew S. *A Big Picture of Heaven and Hell*. North Charleston, SC: Independent Publishing Platform, 2018.

_____. *From Hurt to Healing*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2004.

_____. *Racial Conflict and Healing*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1996.

_____. *Triune Atonement*, Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2009.

Perkins, PHEME. "New Testament Articles Matthew and Mark." In *The New Interpreter's Bible - A Commentary in Twelve Volumes*, vol. 8, edited by Leander E. Keck. Nashville, TN: Abington Press, 1995.

Pitre, Brant. *Jesus and the Jewish Roots of the Eucharist: Unlocking the Secret of the Last Supper*. New York, NY: Image, 2016

Price, Frederick K. C. *How to obtain Strong Faith: Six Principles*, Los Angeles, CA: Faith One Publishing, 1980.

Riley, Gregory J. *The Power of God*, New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 2003.

_____. *Resurrection Reconsidered: Thomas and John in Controversy*, Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1995.

Ring, Kenneth. *Heading Toward Omega*, Amazon Digital Services LLC, 2012.

- Robinson, James McConkey. *Hermeneia—a critical and historical commentary on the Bible—The Critical Edition of Q: A Synopsis Including the Gospels of Matthew and Luke, Mark and Thomas With English, German and French Translations of Q and Thomas*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2000.
- Rohde, Ross. *Viral Jesus: Recovering the Contagious Power of the Gospel*. Lake Mary, FL: Passio (Charisma), 2012.
- Roth, Sid and Linda Josef. *Supernatural Healing: With True Stories from Ana Mendez-Ferrell, David Herzog, Ron Phillips, Katie Souza, and more!* Brunswick, GA: Messianic Vision, 2010.
- Ruthven, Jon Mark. *On the Cessation of the Charismata: The Protestant Polemic on Post-Biblical Miracles*, Tulsa, OK: Word & Spirit Press, 2011.
- _____. *What's Wrong with Protestant Theology? Tradition vs. Biblical Emphasis*. Tulsa, OK: Word & Spirit Press, 2013.
- Sider, Ronal J. *Doing Evangelism Jesus' Way*, Nappanee, IN: Evangel Publishing House, 2003.
- Saliers, Don E. *Worship and Spirituality*, Akron, OH: OSL Publications, 1996.
- Saint Thomas Aquinas. *The Bread of Life: or St. Thomas Aquinas on the Adorable Sacrament of the Altar*, translated by Henry Augustus Rawes. San Bernardino, CA: Self-publishing, 2017.
- Sande, Ken. *The Peacemaker: A Biblical Guide to Resolving Personal Conflict*, Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2004.
- Sanders, Fred. *The Deep Things of God: How the Trinity Changes everything*. 2nd ed. Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2017.
- Schreiner, Thomas R. *Spiritual Gifts: What They Are and Why They Matter*. Nashville, TN: B&H, 2018.
- Schreuder, Duco A. *Vision and Visual Perception: The Conscious Base of Seeing*. Bloomington, IN: Archway, 2014.
- Sheehan, Jonathan. *Enlightenment Bible: Translation, Scholarship, Culture*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013.
- Shulam, Joseph. *A Commentary on the Jewish Roots of Romans*, Baltimore, MD: Lederer Books, 1997.

Smith, Chuck. *Charisma Versus Charismania*. Costa Mesa, CA: The Word for Today Publishers, 2000.

_____. *Calvary Chapel Distinctives: The Foundational Principles of the Calvary Chapel Movement*, Costa Mesa, CA: The Word For Today Publishers, 2004.

Smith, James K. A. Smith. *Desiring the Kingdom: Worship Worldview and Cultural Formation*, Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic a division of Baker Publishing Group, 2009

Smith, Ralph L. *Word Biblical Commentary 32: Micah–Malachi*. Waco, Texas: Word Books Publisher, 1984.

Snider, Gordon L. *Use of the Old Testament in a Wesleyan Theology of Mission*. Cambridge, MA: Clarke & Co., 2016.

Spielvogel, Jackson J. *Western Civilization*. 2 vols. Stamford, CT: Cengage Learning, 2014.

Spinoza, Baruch. *Theological Political Treatise*, translated by R. H. M. Elwes. Independent Publisher, 2019.

Spong, John Shelby. *This Hebrew Lord*, Morristown, NJ: Harper San Francisco A Division of HarperCollins Publishers, 1993.

_____. *The Fourth Gospel: Tales of a Jewish Mystic*, New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 2013.

Stevens, Leon G. *One Nation Under God: A Factual History of America's Religious Heritage*. Bloomington, IN: Thomas Nelson, 2012.

Storms, Sam. *Practicing the Power: Welcoming the Gifts of the Holy Spirit in Your Life*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan. 2017.

Synan, Vinson. *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal*, Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2001.

_____. *The Holiness Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth* Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1997.

Thiselton, Anthony C. *A Shorter Guide to the Holy Spirit: Bible, Doctrine, Experience*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2016.

- _____. *The Holy Spirit: In Biblical Teaching, through the Centuries, and Today*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2013.
- Tillich, Paul. *Systematic Theology: Three Volumes in One*, Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press, 1967.
- Torrey, R. A. *The Presence & Work of the Holy Spirit*, New Kingston, PA: Whitakerhouse, 1996
- Towns, Elmer L. *The Ten Most Influential Churches of the Past Century: How They Impact You Today*. Shippensburg, PA: Destiny Image, 2014.
- Turner, Max. *The Holy Spirit and Spiritual Gifts in the New Testament Church and Today*. Rev. Ed. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker, 2012.
- Umstattd, Rustin. *The Spirit and the: Lake of Fire: Pneumatology and Judgment*. Eugen: OR: Wipf&Stock, 2017.
- Vickers, John A. *Thomas Coke: Apostle of Methodism*. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2013.
- Visala, Aku. *Naturalism, Theism and the Cognitive Study of Religion: Religion Explained?* Routledge Science and Religion Series. London, UK: Routledge, 2016.
- Wagner, Peter. *How to Have a Healing Ministry without Making Your Church Sick*. Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1982.
- Watson, Kevin. *The Class Meeting: Reclaiming a Forgotten (and Essential) Small Group Experience*. Franklin, TN: Seedbed, 2013.
- Weaver, C. Douglas. *Baptists and the Holy Spirit: The Contested History with Holiness-Pentecostal-Charismatic Movements*. Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2019.
- Wesley, John. *The Bicentennial Edition of the Works of John Wesley*, vol. 18 *Journal and Diaries 1 (1735-1738)*. General editors Frank Baker and Richard P. Heitzenrater. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1988.
- _____. *The Bicentennial Edition of the Works of John Wesley*, vol. 19 *Journal and Diaries 2 (1738-1743)*. General editors Frank Baker and Richard P. Heitzenrater. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1990.

- Wimber, John & Kevin Springer. *Power Healing*. New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 1991.
- Wood, Leon J. *The Holy Spirit in the Old Testament*, Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 1998.
- Wokler, Robert. *Rousseau, the Age of Enlightenment, and Their Legacies*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2012.
- Wright, N. T. *Paul A Biography*, New York, NY: HarperCollins Publishers, 2018.
- Xhemajli, Rimi. *The Supernatural and the Circuit Riders: The Rise of Early American Methodism*, Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications, 2021.
- Yarnell, Malcolm B., III. *God the Trinity: Biblical Portraits*. Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2016.
- _____. *Who is the Holy Spirit? Biblical Insights into His Divine Person*. Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2019.
- Yperen, Jim Van. *Making Peace: A Guide to Overcoming Church Conflict*. Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2002.
- Yun, Holly Namok. *The Lord's Answers to my Questions*, Middletown, DE: Independent Publishing Platform, 2021.
- Zahl, Simeon. *The Holy Spirit and Christian Experience*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020.
- Zucca, Lorenzo. *A Secular Europe: Law and Religion in the European Constitutional Landscape*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 2013.

Translated Books in Korean

- Anonymous. *Didache*. [한글], translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글], 1998.
- Tabraham, Barrie. [한글] [The Making of Methodism], translated by [한글]. Seoul, Korea: [한글] [한글], 1998.
- Frazer, James George. *The Golden Bough* [한글] [한글], translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글] [한글], 2002.
- Haechen, D. Ernst. *Die Apostelgeschichte* [한글] [한글] 1, translated by [한글], [한글], [한글]: [한글] [한글], 2001.

- Kierkegaard, Soren. *Krankheit Zum Tode* [Sickness Unto Death], translated by [한글], 1988.
- Kraft, Charles H. *I Give You Authority* [내가 주는 권세], translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글] [한글], 2000.
- Synan, Vinson. *The Holiness Pentecostal Tradition* [성령의 전통], translated by [한글]. [한글], [한글]: [한글], 2008.
- Thich Nhat Hahn. *Living Buddha Living Christ* [살아있는 부처, 살아있는 그리스도], Translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글], 2013.
- Von Rad, Gerhard. [한글] [*Genesis*]. Translated by [한글]. International Bible Commentary 1. Seoul, South Korea: Korea Theological Institute, 2001.
- Walker, Williston. *Great Men of the Christian Church* [기독교의 위대한 인물들], Translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글] [한글], 1994.
- Weiser, Artur & Karl Elliger. *Das Buch der Zwolf Kleinen Propheten* [한글]: [한글] [한글] [한글], translated by [한글], [한글]: [한글], 1999.

Korean Books

- [한글], [한글] [한글] [한글] 2 *Yoido Full Gospel Church Faith and Theology 2*, [한글]: [한글], 1993.
- [한글], [한글] *Gil Seon-ju*. [한글]: [한글], 2007.
- [한글], [한글]: [한글] *Acts: Bible Commentary*. [한글]: [한글], 1999.
- [한글], [한글] 21 [한글] *Lao Tzu and the 21st Century*. [한글]: [한글], 2000.
- _____, [한글] 1 *Analects of Doh-ol I* [한글]: [한글], 2010.
- _____, [한글], [한글] *Doh-ol's research papers*. [한글]: [한글], 1998.
- [한글], [한글] [한글] [한글]: [한글] [한글] [한글] [한글] *Walking on the Holy Way: A Study of Leviticus for Preaching*. [한글]: [한글] [한글], 2001.
- [한글], [한글] [한글] [한글] *A Rediscovery of John Wesley's Theology*. [한글]: [한글], 1996.
- _____, [한글] [한글] [한글] *John Wesley's Theology of Sanctification*. [한글]: [한글], 2008.
- [한글], [한글] [한글] [한글] [한글] *A Confucian Story told by a Theologian*. [한글]: [한글], 2014.

- _____, *John Wesley*. 冊: 冊冊冊冊冊, 1996
- _____, *Tao Te Ching*. 冊: 冊冊, 2012.
- _____, *Chuang Tzu*. 冊: 冊冊, 2014.
- _____, *Rewriting An Early Korean Church History*, 冊: 冊冊冊冊, 2016.
- _____, *The Mind*. 冊: 冊冊, 2006.
- _____, *The human law of I Ching*. 冊: 冊冊 冊冊, 2012
- _____, *Leviticus: The Location of Meeting and Sharing*. 冊: 冊冊 冊冊, 1999.
- _____, *Sermons are My Life*. 冊: 冊冊冊冊, 2005.
- _____, *The Fourth Dimensional Spirituality Directing the Third Dimensional Life*. 冊: 冊冊冊冊冊, 2005.
- _____, *Brunch with the Holy Spirit*. 冊: 冊冊冊冊冊, 2020.
- _____, *Seek Miraculous Gifts*. 冊: 冊冊冊冊冊, 2019, Google Play Books.
- _____, *Western Modern Philosophy of Religion*. 冊: 冊冊, 2015. Google Play Books.

Internet Sources

- Iovino, Joe. "Holy Spirit Moments: Learning from Wesley at Aldersgate," The United Methodist Church, <https://www.umc.org/en/content/holy-spirit-moments-learning-from-wesley-at-aldersgate>
- Glossary: Wesleyan Quadrilateral, the United Methodist Church (umc.org), Source: A Dictionary for United Methodists, Alan K. Waltz, Copyright 1991, Abingdon Press. Used by Permission., https://www.umc.org/en/content/glossary-wesleyan-quadrilateral-the?gclid=Cj0KCQjwytOEBhD5ARIsANnRjVhtRE3u14Ufny1rp4fEFhho0eY0HFihGYVDJoS4gEVcjgbKxz6N1cMaAqGbEALw_wcB